

Agenda Date: 1/29/14 Agenda Item: 4A

TELECOMMUNICATIONS

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350

www.nj.gov/bpu/

IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY, INC.'S)	ORDER ESTABLISHING
ALLEGED FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH OPPORTUNITY NEW JERSEY COMMITMENTS)	COMMENT PERIOD
)	DOCKET NO. TO12020155

Parties of Record:

Gregory M. Romano, Esq., for Verizon New Jersey Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD:

By Order dated March 12, 2012, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") issued an Order to Show Cause in the above captioned matter which ordered the following:

- Verizon to show cause before the Board why the Board should not find that Verizon failed to comply with the Plan for Alternative Regulation ("PAR") Order in providing full broadband capability by 2010; and
- Verizon to file an Answer to this Order to Show Cause, and any and all documents or other written evidence upon which Verizon relies in responding to the within Order to Show Cause, no later than April 12, 2012.

Verizon timely filed its response indicating, among other things, that Verizon is in compliance with its PAR obligations and that the Board should refrain from pursuing the Order to Show Cause. Subsequent to the issuance of the Order to Show Cause, Board Staff and Verizon entered into settlement discussions in an effort to resolve the issues raised in the Order to Show Cause. Following numerous discussions, Board Staff and Verizon have reached a proposed Stipulation of Settlement (attached).

The proposed Stipulation would serve as a resolution to the Board's investigation regarding Verizon's compliance with Opportunity New Jersey ("ONJ") by, among other things, implementing a new broadband request process known as a bonafide retail request or "BFRR". The proposed Stipulation describes the details and terms and conditions of the BFRR, as well as notice and reporting requirements.

The proposed Stipulation would modify the process for ordering broadband services contained in ONJ and the PAR and it is therefore necessary for not only the parties to the PAR Order issued on August 19, 2003 at Docket No. TO01020095, but all affected customers and entities and any other interested party to be given an opportunity to comment on the terms contained in the proposed Stipulation prior to Board consideration of the agreement. Therefore, the Board HEREBY DIRECTS that a 45 day comment period be established for public comment on the proposed Stipulation of Settlement recommended by Board Staff. The Board FURTHER ORDERS that the Board's Secretary shall issue the attached Notice seeking Comments relating to the Stipulation of Agreement and shall post the Notice and the Stipulation of Agreement on the Board's web site, such that any interested party may review and download the Notice during the duration of the 45 day comment period. The public Comment Period shall commence on February 7, 2014 and all comments shall be due no later than 5:00 PM on Monday March 24, 2014. Comments shall be submitted consistent with the Notice.

The Board <u>FURTHER</u> <u>ORDERS</u> that Verizon shall cause to be published in a newspaper of broad circulation in its service territory a copy of the Notice and proposed Stipulation. If no single newspaper of broad circulation covers Verizon's service territory, Verizon shall cause the Notice and proposed Stipulation to be published in such papers as would ensure broad circulation in its service territory.

This Order shall be effective on February 7, 2014.

DATED: 1/29/14

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

DIANNE SOLOMON

PRESIDENT

JEANNE M. FOX COMMISSIONER

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO

COMMISSIONER

MARY-ANNA HOLDEN

COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

KRISTI IZZO SECRETARY HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document it is a true copy of the original in the fleet of the Board of Public

ay-Ana Holder

BPU Docket No.TO12020155

IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY INC.'S ALLEGED FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH OPPORTUNITY NEW JERSEY COMMITMENTS DOCKET NO. TO12020155

SERVICE LIST

Gregory M. Romano, Esq. General Counsel Verizon New Jersey, Inc. Mid-Atlantic Region One Verizon Way, VC54S204 Basking Ridge, NJ 07920

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director Christopher White, Esq. Maria Novas-Ruiz, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625

Geoffrey Gersten, DAG
Alex Moreau, DAG
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101

Anthony Centrella Carol Artale John DeLuca Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350

Collen A. Foley, Esq. Saul Ewing One Riverfront Plaza Newark, NJ 07102

Mark A. Keffer AT&T Communications 3033 Chain Bridge Road Oakton, VA 22185 Benjamin J. Aron State Reg. Affairs, Northeast Region Sprint Nextel Corp. 2001 Edmund Halley Drive Reston, VA 20191

Scott Sommerer Alteva of Warwick, LLC d/b/a Warwick Valley Telephone Company 47-49 Main Street Warwick, NY 10990

William K. Mosca Bevan, Mosca, Giuditta & Zarillo, P.C. 222 Mount Airy Road, Suite 200 Basking Ridge, NJ 07920-2335

K.C. Halm, Esq. Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Suite 2001 Washington, DC 20006

Ernest Cooper, Esq. Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferns, Glovsky & Popeo, PC 701 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20004

Hesser McBride Wilentz Goldman & Spitzer 90 Woodbridge Center Drive Suite 900 Box 10 Woodbrige, NJ 070953-0958

Elana Shapochnikov Senior Regulatory Counsel Government Affairs Cablevision Lightpath, Inc. 1111 Stewart Avenue Bethpage, NY 11714-3581 James C. Meyer Riker, Danzig, Scherer, Hyland & Perretti, LLP Headquarters Plaza One Speedwell Ave. Morristown, NJ 07962

Sue E. Benedek CenturyLink 240 North Third Street, Suite 300 Harrisburg, PA 17101

James H. Laskey, Esq. Norris, McLaughlin & Marcus 721 Route 202-206, Suite 200 Bridgewater, NJ 08807

Phyllis Salowe-Kaye New Jersey Citizen Action 400 Main Street, 2rd Floor Hackensack, NJ 07601

David Mayer, Chairman New Jersey Cable Telecommunications Association 142 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608

Kevin Drennan Senate Democratic Office P.O. Box 099 Trenton, NJ 08625-0099

Jim Dieterle AARP New Jersey Forrestal Village 132 Main Street Princeton, NJ 08540

William John Kearns, Jr., Esq. General Counsel NJ State League of Municipalities Kearns, Vassallo, Guest & Kearns 630 Beverly-Rancocas Road Willingboro, NJ 08046-3718 Cynthia J. Jahn, Esq. NJ School Boards Association 413 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618

Harris David, Esq.
Legal Services of New Jersey
100 Metroplex Drive @ Plainfield Avenue
Suite 402
P.O. Box 1357
Edison, NJ 08818-1357

Arthur Bergman, Esq. Sokol, Behot & Fiorenzo 433 Hackensack Avenue Hackensack, NJ 07601

Mary Alice Messenger, Exec. Director Assembly Democratic Office State House-South Wing, Suite LA40 P.O. Box 098 Trenton, NJ 08625-0098

Edward W. Ahart, Esq. Schenck, Price, Smith & King, LLP 10 Washington Street P.O. Box 905 Morristown, NJ 07963

Chris Cerf
Commissioner
State of New Jersey
Department of Education
100 Riverview Executive Plaza
Route 29
P.O. Box 500
Trenton, NJ 08625-0500

Kelly Faul XO Communications 13865 Sunrise Valley Dr. Herndon, VA 20171



Chris Christie Governor

Kim Guadagno Lt. Governor

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350

www.nj.gov/bpu/

Kristi Izzo Secretary of the Board Tel. # (609) 292-1599

NOTICE1

IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY, INC.'S ALLEGED FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH OPPORTUNITY NEW JERSEY COMMITMENTS

Docket No. TO12020155

Notice of Opportunity to For Public Comment

On January 29, 2014, the Board of Public Utilities ("Board") directed Board Staff to seek comment on a proposed Stipulation of Agreement between Board Staff and Verizon New Jersey relating to its Alternative Plan For Regulation ("PAR-2") and Verizon's compliance with Opportunity New Jersey ("ONJ") by, among other things, implementing a new broadband request process known as a bonafide retail request or "BFRR".

Parties wishing to be heard on the proposed stipulation, Opportunity New Jersey or the settlement of this case should submit comments to board.secretary@bpu.state.nj.us no later than March 24, 2014 at 5:00 PM and include "Verizon New Jersey, Docket No. TO12020155" in the subject line of the email. After reviewing comments, it will be determined whether to take additional action relating to this matter.

Hard copies or any comments should also be sent to:

New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Kristi Izzo, Secretary 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, N.J. 08625-0350

Secretary of the Board

Dated: January 29, 2014

Not a paid legal advertisement.

STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY INC.'S ALLEGED FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH OPPORTUNITY NEW JERSEY COMMITMENTS	DOCKET NO. TO12020155 STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT O
)

WHEREAS, the signatories to this Stipulation are Verizon New Jersey Inc. ("Verizon NJ"), 540 Broad Street, Newark, New Jersey and the Staff of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board Staff"), 44 South Clinton Avenue, Trenton, New Jersey. Said signatories have agreed to settle the above-referenced matter subject to the stipulations, terms, and conditions specified herein.

WHEREAS, Verizon NJ is a local exchange carrier ("LEC") that provides local telephone and associated services in its service territory in New Jersey through a telecommunications network that it owns and operates.

WHEREAS, the Board, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:2-13 and N.J.S.A. 48:2-1 et seq., has been granted certain regulatory authority and jurisdiction over public utilities.

WHEREAS, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:2-21.16, the Board has the authority to approve alternative forms of regulation that address changes in technology and the structure of the telecommunications industry.

WHEREAS, on May 6, 1993, in Docket No. T092030358, the Board issued an order approving a plan of alternative regulation ("PAR-1") for Verizon NJ's predecessor New Jersey Bell Telephone Company. PAR-1 included a plan for accelerated deployment of advanced

switching and transmission technologies for its network known as Opportunity New Jersey ("ONJ"). The service capability and technology deployments outlined in ONJ were based upon assumptions regarding technology, markets and economic conditions over an extended period of time.

WHEREAS, PAR-1 required Verizon NJ to fully deploy broadband service in its service territory by the end of 2010 and provided for the monitoring of Verizon NJ's progress regarding such deployment.

WHEREAS, since the adoption of PAR-1, the Board has reviewed implementation of ONJ, particularly (1) the status of ONJ and relevant deployment strategies; (2) the business as usual benchmarks established to gauge ONJ's progress to date, and (3) the economic development impacts that ONJ has had on the State. See, e.g., In the Matter of the Board's Inquiry into Bell Atlantic-New Jersey, Inc.'s Progress and Compliance with Opportunity New Jersey, Its Network Modernization Program, Docket No. TX96100707, Order, October 18, 1996.

WHEREAS, by Order dated August 19, 2003, in Docket No. T001020095, the Board approved a second plan for alternative regulation ("PAR-2") that replaced PAR-1, but left in place the requirements of ONJ established under PAR-1.

WHEREAS, on March 12, 2012, the Board served on Verizon NJ an Order to Show Cause directing Verizon NJ to show cause why the Board should not find that it failed to comply with the PAR Orders in providing full broadband capability in its service territory by 2010; and to file an answer to the Order to Show Cause.

WHEREAS, on April 12, 2012, Verizon NJ filed an answer responding to the Order to Show Cause ("Answer"). In its Answer, Verizon NJ asserted that it satisfied its ONJ

commitments, including full deployment of broadband service within its service territory, and requested that the Board dismiss the Order to Show Cause.

WHEREAS, as a resolution to the Board's investigation regarding Verizon NJ's compliance with ONJ, the signatories agree that the requirements embodied in this Stipulation resolve the dispute between the signatories in a reasonable manner and THEREFORE agree as follows:

- 1. <u>Implementation of Broadband Request Process</u>: For single-line business or residential consumers ("consumers") residing in Verizon NJ's authorized service territory who do not have access to Broadband service (as defined below), Verizon NJ will, commencing thirty (30) days after the issuance and service of a Board Order approving this Stipulation and concluding the earlier of the Board's approval of a new plan of alternative regulation or December 31, 2017, make Broadband service available to such consumers pursuant to the terms of the bonafide retail request ("BFRR") requirements described below. Under the BFRR process, Verizon NJ shall make Broadband service available to:
 - a. a minimum of thirty-five (35) single-line business or residential consumers (in any combination) located in a Census Tract (as defined by the United States Census Bureau on the date of this Stipulation's execution) in Verizon NJ's authorized service territory who:
 - have no access to Broadband from cable service providers (including single-line business or residential consumers located outside of cable providers' Primary Service Area (defined in the applicable cable providers' Franchise Order issued by the Board));
 - ii. have no access to 4G-based wireless service; and

- iii. each sign a contract agreeing to at least one (1) year of service and pay a\$100 deposit to be credited towards their service ("BFRR consumer").
- b. Within nine (9) months of the receipt of a completed BFRR that meets the criteria referred to in 1(a)(i)-(iii) above ("BFRR consumer"), Verizon NJ must either itself or by contracting with another provider (including wireless, cable, or satellite provider¹), arrange to have Broadband service provided to such BFRR consumer's home or business. The nine (9) month time period for completing broadband installation may be extended by up to six (6) months upon notice by Verizon NJ to the Board and to the BFRR consumer, for delays beyond Verizon NJ's reasonable control, including situations involving equipment or property acquisition, rights-of-way, permitting, or if the total number of BFRR deployments exceeds twenty (20) in a calendar year.
- c. For the purposes of this Stipulation, Broadband is defined as delivering, through the use of any technology medium (including 4G-based wireless, fiber, copper, or cable), data transmission service at speeds no less than the minimum speed of Verizon NJ's Digital Subscriber Line Services ("DSL") that is provided by Verizon NJ as of today's date.
- d. Consumers who request Broadband service and meet the criteria set forth in paragraph 1(a) above, shall be advised by Verizon NJ that the BFRR process is available and provided with details of the program. Consumers who believe that Broadband service is improperly being denied to them under the BFRR process

¹The satellite technology referred to herein shall be technology that is superior to broadband satellite technology commonly deployed in the past. For example, a certain industry-leading satellite provider has announced plans to launch new satellite-based broadband services at speeds of between five and 10 megabits per second, far in excess of the arrangements previously available.

- should also be advised by Verizon NJ that they can contact the Board to contest the denial.
- e. Within thirty days after the issuance and service of a Board order approving this Stipulation, Verizon NJ shall post detailed information concerning the BFRR program on its web site. Within ninety days after the issuance and service of a Board order approving this Stipulation, Verizon NJ will include an insert into its paper bills providing notice to its customers of the BFRR program. Verizon NJ shall provide semi-annual reports to the Board detailing the number of BFRR requests received by Census Tract. The reports should identify: (1) every BFRR request received; (2) the action taken in response to each request; (3) all applicants who are denied Broadband service under the BFRR process, and (4) the reason for the denial. The Board Staff may, upon reasonable notice to Verizon NJ, request that Verizon NJ provide supplemental reports updating the most recent semi-annual report.
- 2. <u>Public Entities</u>: Public schools, municipal police and fire stations, emergency services, rescue squads and/or paramedics shall not be subject to the BFRR process described in section 1 above. With regard to any such public school, municipal police, fire station, emergency service, rescue squad and/or paramedic in Verizon NJ's authorized service territory that does not have access to Broadband from a cable service provider or access to 4G-based wireless service, Verizon NJ shall: (i) establish a single point of contact to handle inquiries about Broadband service options and (ii) shall make Broadband service available on terms, conditions and rates mutually agreeable to the parties. Within nine (9) months of the execution of this Stipulation resolving this investigation, Verizon NJ

shall provide written notice to the public elementary schools in Hopewell and Upper Pittsgrove in Cumberland County, of their option to order Broadband service through what is known as the "Pittsgrove Consortium."²

- 3. Access to BFRR: For residential consumers of Hopewell and Upper Pittsgrove who do not have access to Broadband and meet the BFRR process requirements set forth in Section 1(a) above, Verizon NJ shall complete all BFRR requests no later than nine (9) months of Verizon NJ's receipt of a qualified request. The six (6) month extension referred to in Section 1(b) above, shall not apply to BFRR applications submitted by Hopewell and Upper Pittsgrove residential consumers.
- 4. Order to Show Cause: Upon the Board's adoption of this Stipulation and service upon the signatories, Verizon NJ will implement the BFRR process detailed above to any qualified consumers who request Broadband service within Verizon NJ's service territory. Further upon the Board's adoption of this Stipulation and service upon the signatories, this Order to Show Cause will be closed and Verizon NJ's ONJ requirements will be enforced through Verizon NJ's compliance with the BFRR process and the requirements of this Stipulation. If Verizon NJ fails to comply with the terms of this Stipulation, the Board may take action to enforce such terms as the Board deems appropriate.
- 5. Effective upon Approval. The signatories agree that this Stipulation was negotiated and agreed to in its entirety with each section being mutually dependent on approval of all other sections. If the Board modifies or rejects any of the terms of this Stipulation, each signatory will have the option, before implementation of any different terms, to accept,

² The Pittsgrove Consortium allows for a group e-rate application that allows discounts to be passed on to each member district, and allows for shared expenses among members.

- change, or to resume the proceeding as if no agreement had been reached. If this proceeding is resumed, each signatory is given the right to return to the position it was in before this Stipulation was executed.
- 6. <u>Drafting of Stipulation</u>. The entire Stipulation has been reviewed by and is acceptable to the signatories and their counsel as to form, content and meaning. The Stipulation was drafted jointly by the signatories and shall not be construed against any signatory based on its preparation.
- 7. Enforceability. In the event of default or breach of any term and/or condition of this Stipulation, the harmed signatory shall be entitled to rely upon this Stipulation or any other recourse available by law, to enforce the terms and conditions of this Stipulation.
- Counterparts. This Stipulation may be executed in multiple counterparts, each of which shall be an original and all of which shall constitute one agreement.
- 9. <u>Authority to Bind.</u> The signatories hereby agree to be bound to this Stipulation, and they acknowledge that they are authorized on behalf of their respective clients to execute this Stipulation and to bind their respective clients by their signatures below.
- 10. <u>Governing Law.</u> This Stipulation shall be governed by the applicable law of New Jersey without regard to choice of law rules.

WHEREFORE, the parties hereto do respectfully submit this Stipulation and request that the Board issue a Decision and Order approving it in its entirety, in accordance with the terms hereof, as soon as reasonably possible.

VERI	ZON NEW JERSEY INC.
Ву:	Gregory M. Romano
Date:	
JOHN FOR ATTO	JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES I J. HOFFMAN, ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY PRNEYS FOR THE STAFF OF THE NEW JERSEY RD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES
Ву:	Deputy Attorney General
Date:	