

B-32



In the Matter of Katie Girdali and  
Brian McCoach, Administrative  
Analyst 3, Fiscal Management  
(PS3928U), Office of Information  
Technology

CSC Docket Nos. 2017-3192 and  
2017-3193

:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:

**STATE OF NEW JERSEY**  
**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE**  
**ACTION**  
**OF THE**  
**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**  
  
Examination Appeals

**ISSUED: APR 24 2017 (CSM)**

Katie Girdali and Brian McCoach appeal the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that they were below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Administrative Analyst 3, Fiscal Management (PS3928U), Office of Information Technology. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues presented.

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the closing date of November 21, 2016 (see attached). The subject examination was cancelled on April 16, 2017 since the appellants were the only applicants.

Girdali indicated on her application that she served provisionally in the title under test from April 2016 to the closing date, November 2016. She also indicated experience as a Technical Assistant 1, Community Affairs, Technical Assistant 2, Community Affairs, and Technical Assistant 2. Girdali also indicated possession of a Bachelor's degree and a Master's degree. Agency Services credited her with one year of experience for her Master's degree, but determined that the remainder of her experience was not applicable.

McCoach indicated on his application that he was provisionally serving in the title under test from September 2015 to the closing date, November 2016. He also indicated experience as a State Budget Specialist 1, a Slot Operations Manager and Player Services Supervisor with Rivers Casino, and a Senior Executive Host and Casino Operations Manager with Harrah's Casino. McCoach indicated possession

of a Bachelor's degree. Agency Services credited him one year and nine months of experience based on his experience as a State Budget Specialist 1, but determined that the remainder of his experience was not applicable.

On appeal, Giraldi highlights her education and experience in the Technical Assistant, Community Affairs title series. In support of her appeal, Giraldi provides a letter from Sheri Smith, Chief Fiscal Officer, Department of Community Affairs, who confirms that the appellant performed the required duties to establish eligibility for the title under test while employed with the Department of Community Affairs. Additionally, Erin Zippel, Chief Financial Officer, Office of Information Technology, who confirm that Giraldi has been performing the required duties to establish eligibility while serving provisionally in the title under test. McCoach also details his provisional experience in the title under test. In support, Zippel confirms that McCoach has been performing the required duties in the subject title and requests that his provisional experience be accepted after the announced closing date.

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.6(c) provides that applicants for promotional examinations with open competitive requirements may not use experience gained as a result of out-of-title work to satisfy the requirements for admittance to the examination or for credit in the examination process, unless good cause is shown for an exception. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:1-1.2(c) provides that a rule may be relaxed for good cause, in a particular circumstance, in order to effectuate the purposes of Title 11A of the New Jersey Statutes Annotated.

## CONCLUSION

In the present matter, a review of the documentation demonstrates that initially, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellants were not eligible for the subject examination. Giraldi was properly credited with one year of experience for her Master's degree but did not specify performance of the required duties while serving provisionally in the title under test. McCoach was properly credited with one year and nine months of experience for his service as a State Budget Specialist 1 but he did not specify performance of the required duties while serving provisionally in the title under test.

Under *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(g), the Civil Service Commission (Commission) can accept clarifying information in eligibility appeals. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an application may only be amended prior to the announced closing date. For example, information submitted on appeal pertaining to duties in a given position that expands or enlarges information previously submitted is considered clarifying and is accepted. However, any documentation indicating work in a setting that was not previously listed on an application or resume cannot be considered after the closing date. Thus, the Commission can only consider information provided on

appeal regarding the positions listed on the appellant's original application. Further, with respect to Giraldi, primarily performing the duties of an Administrative Analyst 3, Fiscal Management would be considered out-of-title work for incumbents in the Technical Assistant, Community Affairs title series. However, Smith has verified that Giraldi performed the required out-of-title duties while serving in that series and Zippel has clarified her provisional experience in the title under test. Similarly, Zippel has verified that McCoach has been performing the required duties of an Administrative Analyst 3, Fiscal Management since September 2015. Additionally, the subject examination was cancelled since the appellants were the only applicants and they continue to serve provisionally in the title under test. Under these circumstances, good cause exists to accept Giraldi's out-of-title work experience, the clarification of the appellants' experience, and provisional experience after the closing date and admit them to the subject examination.

### ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that these appeals be granted, the examination cancellation be rescinded, and the appellants' applications be processed for prospective employment opportunities.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE  
19<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF APRIL, 2017



Robert M. Czech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries  
and  
Correspondence

Director  
Division of Appeals  
and Regulatory Affairs  
Written Record Appeals Unit  
Civil Service Commission  
P.O. Box 312  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0312

Attachment

- c. Katie Giraldi  
Brian McCoach  
Lisa Blauer  
Kelly Glenn  
Records Center

NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION-STATE SERVICE

**PROMOTIONAL ANNOUNCEMENT**

**\$25.00 PROCESSING FEE REQUIRED**  
 Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

SYMBOL: <b>PS3928U</b>	WEIGHT CODE: *
TITLE: <b>ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST 3 FISCAL MANAGEMENT</b>	SALARY: <b>\$64,677.00 - \$92,012.00</b>
ISSUE DATE: <b>November 01, 2016</b>	CLOSING DATE: <b>November 21, 2016</b>
TITLE CODE: <b>50075H/KXRR7</b>	CLASS CODE: <b>26</b>
DEPARTMENT: <b>OIT/OFFICE OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY</b>	
UNIT SCOPE: <b>U955 Finance and Administration</b>	

**Visit [www.state.nj.us/csc](http://www.state.nj.us/csc)  
 And select "Job Announcements"  
 to view this announcement and to file an application**

**Open to employees in the competitive division who are currently serving in a title to which the announcement is open and have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the following title(s):**

**Administrative Analyst 2 Fiscal Management**

**Or to employees in the non-competitive division who are currently serving in a title to which the announcement is open and have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the following title(s), and meet the requirements listed below:**

**State Budget Specialist 1**

**Or to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and who meet the requirements listed:**

Education: Graduation from an accredited college or university with a Bachelor's degree including or supplemented by twenty-one (21) credit hours in any combination of Accounting, Business Administration, Economics or Finance courses. Applicants must provide proof of the supplemental credit requirement. This is to be done by attaching a transcript to your application. (Foreign degrees /transcripts must be evaluated by a recognized evaluation service.) Failure to do so will result in rejection from the examination process.

Experience: Three (3) years of experience in work involving fiscal analysis and evaluation, budgeting and management operations in government, business and/or a management consulting firm.

Applicants who do not possess the Bachelor's degree but who do possess the twenty-one (21) credit hours listed above, may substitute the remaining education with experience as indicated above on a year for year basis with thirty (30) semester hour credits being equal to one (1) year of experience.

Note: A Master's degree from an accredited college or university in one of the areas listed above may be substituted for one (1) year of experience; a Doctorate in one of the above areas may be substituted for two years (2) of experience. You must indicate the details of your Master's and/or Doctorate degree on your application. (Foreign degrees/transcripts must be evaluated by a recognized evaluation service.) Failure to do so will result in rejection from the examination process.

License: Appointees will be required to possess a driver's license valid in New Jersey only if the operation of a vehicle rather than employee mobility, is necessary to perform the essential duties of the position. The responsibility for ensuring that employees possess the required motor vehicle license, commensurate with the class and type of vehicles they operate, rests with the Appointing Authority.

**IMPORTANT INFORMATION**

- NJAC 4A:4-2.6 states that all requirements listed must be met as of the closing date, including assignment to the department and unit scope, and satisfying the permanent status requirement.**
- ONLY ON-LINE APPLICATIONS WILL BE ACCEPTED. YOU MUST COMPLETE YOUR APPLICATION IN DETAIL.** Your score may be based on a comparison of your credentials with the job requirements. Failure to complete your application properly may lower your score or cause you to fail.
- This examination is open to full- and part-time permanent employees. If an employment list results from this announcement, it may be certified to fill full-time and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the unit scope, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.
- NJAC 4A:4-1.5 states that any employee who is serving on a provisional basis and who fails to file for and take an examination which has been announced for his/her title **SHALL BE SEPARATED FROM THE PROVISIONAL TITLE.**
- In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, **Veterans pay a reduced application fee of \$15.00** if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the Department of Military and Veterans Affairs (DMAVA) (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.). Those claiming Veterans Preference but have not yet received approval from DMAVA must pay the full application fee and may request a refund if the claim is approved at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. **PLEASE NOTE THIS REDUCED FEE DOES NOT APPLY TO PUBLIC SAFETY TITLES.**
- SPECIAL NOTE TO ALL APPLICANTS** Please make sure you are assigned to the unit scope indicated above. If you do not know your unit scope assignment, please contact your Human Resource Office. If you file an application for this announcement and you are not assigned to the unit scope indicated above, **YOU WILL BE FOUND INELIGIBLE FOR THIS EXAM AND YOUR APPLICATION FEE WILL NOT BE REFUNDED.**
- If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, technical support and customer care are available during regular business hours, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. EST, Monday - Friday, excluding holidays and emergency closings. Please Email: [OAS.support@csc.state.nj.us](mailto:OAS.support@csc.state.nj.us) or call (609) 292-4144. Please note that application support requests received outside regular business hours on the closing date will not change the application filing deadline so **PLEASE FILE EARLY.**
- Application fees submitted via personal check or money order must be postmarked within **five (5) business days** of submitting your application. If your fee is postmarked after five (5) business days, or is returned as invalid, you will be declared ineligible and denied admittance to the examination process.

DPF-256A \* Revised 03/09