

Farer Fersko, A Professional Association
 600 South Avenue
 Westfield, New Jersey 07901
 Tel: (908) 789-8550
 Fax: (908) 789-8660
 Attorneys for Third-Party Defendant
 Benjamin Moore & Co.

NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION and THE ADMINISTRATOR OF THE NEW JERSEY SPILL COMPENSATION FUND,

Plaintiffs,

v.

OCCIDENTAL CHEMICAL CORPORATION, TIERRA SOLUTIONS, INC., MAXUS ENERGY CORPORATION, REPSOL YPF, S.A., YPF, S.A., YPF HOLDINGS, INC. and CLH HOLDINGS, INC.,

Defendants.

MAXUS ENERGY CORPORATION and TIERRA SOLUTIONS, INC.,

Third-Party Plaintiffs,

vs.

3M COMPANY, *et al.*,

Third-Party Defendants.

: SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW
 : JERSEY
 : LAW DIVISION: ESSEX
 : COUNTY
 :
 : DOCKET NO. L-9868-05 (PASR)
 :
 : CIVIL ACTION
 :
 : **BENJAMIN MOORE & CO.'S
 : SUPPLEMENTAL DISCLOSURE
 : PURSUANT TO CMO XII**
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :
 :

Third-Party Defendant Benjamin Moore & Co. ("Respondent") hereby provides its Supplement to Initial Disclosure pursuant to Case Management Order ("CMO") XII and prior CMO's incorporated therein by reference.

Reservations and Comments

1. Respondent reserves the right to object to the production of any documents or other information on any ground, including relevance and undue burden, and to assert any applicable privilege, including the attorney-client privilege, the work product doctrine, the common interest doctrine, confidentiality, trade secret, State and Federal Homeland Security confidentiality and any other applicable protection. These disclosures are not intended to prejudice or waive any privileges or objections Respondent may have with respect to any outstanding or subsequent requests for discovery.

2. Respondent's investigation in this matter is continuing. Accordingly, it reserves the right to supplement, clarify, and revise these disclosures at any time prior to trial to the extent additional information becomes available or is obtained through discovery. Further, Respondent reserves the right to amend these disclosures to the extent the claims brought by or alleged against Respondent in this litigation are amended.

3. Respondent reserves its right to rely on any facts, documents or other evidence that may develop or come to Respondent's attention during the course of this matter. Respondent's responses are set forth herein without prejudice to its right to assert additional objections or supplement its responses should Respondent discover additional grounds for doing so during the course of this matter.

4. "Documents," excluding electronic e-mail and Electronically Stored Information, shall have the meaning set forth in this Court's August 11, 2009 Order for Preservation of Documents and Data.

5. "Alleged Discharges" shall have the meaning set forth in the Court's CMO

VIII.

6. "Sites," per CMO VIII, shall be defined as those site(s) or properties with which a Third-Party Defendant is associated in the Third-Party Complaint.

7. Document Production requirements set forth in CMO XII, paragraph 21 are read in concert with CMO VIII, paragraph 3 and CMO V, paragraph 8, incorporated by reference in CMO XII, paragraph (1). CMO VIII, *inter alia*, called for a listing of those documents to be produced by Third-Party Defendants with certain excepted categories, the "Excepted Information Categories." To the extent requirements set forth in CMO XII, paragraph 21 are repetitive, burdensome and /or unfairly place a duty of inquiry on Third-Party Defendants as to the Newark Bay Complex locations other than the Sites, disclosures herein are provided with reference to CMO XII paragraph 21(c) unless otherwise noted. With respect to CMO XII, paragraph 21(b), reference is made to information previously furnished by the JDG in connection with CMO V, paragraph 8.

8. Documents subject to claims of privilege have been detailed in a log contemporaneously provided with this Supplemental Disclosure. Respondent objects to the production of documents or other information ordered in CMO XII paragraph 21(b) and paragraph 21(c) that constitute trade secret and are confidential.

Production as to Paragraph 21(b)

Copies of all non-privileged Documents other than electronic email discovery, that relate to

(i.) the alleged discharge of any hazardous wastes, hazardous substances, pollutants or contaminants ("Hazardous Materials") to the Newark Bay Complex;

Response - See Reservations and Comments above. See Response to Paragraph 21(c) 1, i., below.

(ii.) the potential pathways and methods by which the Hazardous Materials have been released to the Newark Bay Complex, as well as the quantity, nature and toxicity of such Hazardous Materials;

Response - See Reservations and Comments above. See Response to Paragraphs 21(c), 1, i. - iv., below.

(iii.) other actions relating to properties or operations that may have adversely impacted the environmental condition of the Newark Bay Complex

Response - See Reservations and Comments above.

(iv.) the costs and damages costs and damages sought in connection with any alleged discharge of Hazardous Materials.

Response - See Reservations and Comments above. Respondent further notes that all cross-claims and counterclaims asserting statutory or common law contribution or indemnification and Fourth-Party claims are stayed in the present action and, as such, it has made no such claim against parties in this action at this time.

Production as to Paragraph 21(c)

1. A copy of all Documents relating to the following information for the sites, properties and/or operations with which the Third-Party Defendant is associated in the Third-Party Complaints:

i. the release or discharge of Hazardous Materials from or at that Third Party Defendant's properties or operations.

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

ii. the operations, manufacturing and/or production processes, any Hazardous Materials stored or utilized on the property, and any sampling that took place on the property and any sampling or testing of the materials, by products or waste products used in connection therewith;

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

iii. sampling results from environmental, chemical, or biological testing conducted at that Third Party Defendant's properties;

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

iv. any communications involving that Third-Party Defendant and any branch, department, agency or instrumentality of municipal, State or federal government relating to any discharges or releases of Hazardous Materials or this litigation.

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

2. Any Documents relating to any industrial waste containing Hazardous Materials that was transported to, processed or treated at, or discharged from any of the sites and/or properties with which a Third Party Defendant is associated in the Third Party Complaints.

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

3. Any insurance or indemnity agreement under which another person or entity may be liable to satisfy all or part of a possible judgment in this action or to indemnify or reimburse for payments made to satisfy said judgment.

Response - Respondent limits its response in accordance with the Reservations and Comments above. Documents responsive to this request, to the extent available, are on the enclosed disc, subject to the Reservations and Comments above and to the exceptions set forth in CMO VIII enumerated below.

August 11, 2009 CMO VIII Excepted Information Categories

Excepted Information Categories include the following:

“Information, (“Information”), including, but not limited to, environmental, chemical and/or biological testing of groundwater, surface water, soil or sediment (hereinafter “Sampling Information”) contained in the nexus packages produced pursuant

to paragraph 8(e) of CMO V,” See Paragraph 4(a), as well as information produced under CMO XII, paragraph 21(a);

“Information previously produced to any branch, department, agency or instrumentality of the State of New Jersey including to the New Jersey Department of Environment Protection (“NJDEP”) or Information produced to any other governmental agency or entity whose responsibility it is to oversee environmental compliance in the Newark Bay Complex Area, including, but not limited to, the United States Environmental Protection Agency and the United States Army Corps of Engineers (hereinafter “Governmental Recipients”), See paragraph 21(b);

“Information produced to any Licensed Site Remediation Professional (hereinafter “LSRP”) who is duly licensed by the State of New Jersey at the time of receipt of such Information where such disclosure of Information is intended to be used in connection with any remedial investigation or remedial action having an assigned case number in the NJDEP’s NJEMS system,” See Paragraph 4(c);

“Sampling Information compiled with the expectation of being produced to a Governmental Recipient or an LSRP under Paragraphs 4(b) or 4(c) but which Sampling Information has not yet undergone quality assurance/ quality control or similar analysis,” See Paragraph 4(d);

“Information produced by a third-party defendant to any third-party plaintiff pursuant to the New Jersey Open Records Act or other freedom of information law or regulation, See Paragraph 4(e);