

Summary of Comments by Peer Review Panel

Modeling overview

Model and EMP assert that reducing GHG will have a minimal economic impact on NJ.

Is there a contingency plan if emission reductions are costlier than anticipated? (Brunnermeier, Seneca)

What happens if less than the efficiency anticipated over a study period is actually obtained? (Many)

EMP is "so dependent on demand side measures that it will be extremely important to be sure those assumptions are robust." Example: EMP seeks to cut 2020's peak demand by 5.7 GW, which seems huge with a BAU peak of 25.6 GW (Victor)

What level of scenario planning is included in the EMP?

For example "it is very hard to get a feel for whether sensitivity analysis spans the range of plausible actual outcomes for demand response. These kinds of details really matter because so much is riding on what happens on the demand side." (Victor)

What cost benefit analysis was done on the energy efficiency and demand response initiatives? (Brunnermeier, Hulkower, Victor, Faruqi et al.)

Document / Presentation Issues

EMP has a "perspective that NJ is an island, or should be. These assumptions sit behind the entire analysis, and ... narrow NJ's options needlessly. Wouldn't it be better for NJ to explore a wider range of low-carbon options, especially for generation? If someone builds advanced coal with carbon storage in PA and sells the power under contract to NJ isn't that just as good (or even better since someone else has the power plant in their back yard?)." (Victor)

EMP also has "lack of attention to how actions in other states and at the federal level will affect outcomes." "Document is strikingly silent on the federal government" Many issues "depend much more on federal action than on anything inside NJ" (extension of investment tax credit, new nuclear power incentives, advanced coal development, LNG development) (Victor)

EMP did not clearly state its practical priorities-which policies (adopted by which parts of the NJ government or others) are most pivotal. EMP lacks a definitive outline and timeframe for implementation of programs (Victor, Ramapo, et al.)

EMP needs to clearly state that the 20% reduction in electricity consumption goal is measured against future growth. This approach essentially produces a flat demand line. (Hulkower)

EMP needs to emphasize that a comprehensive approach that examines and implements all supply and demand technologies is the most appropriate approach. (EPRI, Hulkower et al.)

Public Outreach

EMP needs to clearly state the importance of energy efficiency, visually show efficiency's impact on specific sectors or industries and inform NJ citizens better about energy issues.

EMP has no concrete goals with regard to educating the public, through public forums, educational and curriculum initiatives. (Many)

EMP should address cross-sector strategies rather than focus only on electricity and heating fuel challenges (EPRI)

Plans for deploying a Smart Grid needed much more emphasis (Lapson, Socolow, et al.)

Cost Issues

Capital and operating costs for conventional generation, renewable energy, and efficiency measures need better explanations to educate the general public. These costs also need to be re-examined as they have been rapidly increasing. (EPRI, Hulkower, Victor, et al.)

NJ needs smart grid systems to be non-proprietary systems based on open architecture and industry-accepted standards to assure that systems are interoperable

Re-examine the 1500 MW of combined heat and power goal. It seems to be an ambitious goal considering the limited CHP construction that has occurred in recent years. The subsidies necessary to promote new CHP plants could be significant and should be measured against investments in efficiency, renewables and other carbon reduction strategies on a dollars invested per ton of carbon reduced basis. (Hulkower, Lapson, et al.)

Renewables

Consider including an incentive for geothermal heating and cooling. Consider classifying geothermal as a renewable. (Northrup and Hulkower)

Consider adding a wave power program (Northrup)