

Agenda Date: 4/15/15 Agenda Item: 3A

CARLE TELEVISION

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu

| | | ONDEE TELEVIOION |
|--|---|-----------------------|
| IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY, INC. FOR RELIEF OF A REQUIREMENT TO EXTEND ITS |) | ORDER |
| FIOS TV SERVICE TO CERTAIN MULTIPLE |) | |
| DWELLING UNIT PROPERTIES LOCATED IN |) | |
| MUNICIPALITIES WHERE EXTENSION OF FIOS TV |) | |
| SERVICE IS REQUIRED UNDER THE TERMS OF ITS |) | DOCKET NO. 0044000524 |
| SYSTEM-WIDE FRANCHISE |) | DOCKET NO. CO11090534 |

Parties of Record:

Gregory M. Romano, Esq., General Counsel, Mid Atlantic Region, Verizon New Jersey, Inc., Basking Ridge, New Jersey for Petitioner **Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, N**ew Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD1:

On September 9, 2011, Verizon New Jersey (Verizon NJ) filed with the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") and its Office of Cable Television ("OCTV") a request for relief from certain deployment requirements pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:5A-25.2(a)(2) and N.J.A.C. 14:18-15.3(a).

Under the requirements of its system-wide franchise granted by the Board in <u>I/M/O the Application of Verizon New Jersey</u>, Inc. for a System-wide Cable Television Franchise, Docket No. CE06110768 (December 18, 2006), and as renewed by the Board in <u>I/M/O the Application of Verizon New Jersey</u>, Inc. for Renewal of a System-wide Cable Television Franchise, Docket No. CE13080756 (January 29, 2014), as well as <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 48:5A-25.2, Verizon is required to make its cable television service available to residential areas of county seats and municipalities with a population density greater than 7,111 persons per square mile of land area that are within Verizon's service area. <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 48:5A-25.2(a)(1)(a) and (b). However, <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 48:5A-25.2 and <u>N.J.A.C.</u> 14:18-15.3 provide that any cable television company that provides more than 40 percent of the local exchange telephone service market in New Jersey shall not be required to provide access to developments or buildings where:

¹ Commissioner Upendra J. Chivukula recused himself due to a potential conflict of interest and as such took no part in the discussion or deliberation of this matter.

- 1. [the system-wide franchisee] cannot access a development or building because of a claimed exclusive arrangement with another cable television company;
- [the system-wide franchisee] cannot access a development or building using its standard technical solutions, under commercially reasonable terms and conditions after good faith negotiation; or
- 3. [the system-wide franchisee] cannot access the public rights-of-way under reasonable terms and conditions.

The Board notes that Verizon provides more than 40 percent of the local exchange telephone service market in New Jersey. <u>I/M/O the Application of Verizon New Jersey</u>, <u>Inc. for a System-wide Cable Television Franchise</u>, supra, page 3.

Verizon claims that it was unable to negotiate access to the 108 properties or multiple dwelling units (MDUs)² noted in its petition, under one of these allowable exceptions, and accordingly, seeks to be relieved from its requirement to extend its cable service, FiOS, to residents of the MDUs. Verizon contends that it was unable to negotiate access to serve the subject properties using its standard technical solutions, under commercially reasonable terms and conditions after good faith negotiations, and therefore, seeks relief pursuant to N.J.A.C. 14:18-15.3(a)1-2. Verizon attached to its petition correspondence from Verizon to representatives of the MDUs, wherein Verizon attempted to gain access to all of the subject properties. Verizon also informed the property owners that it would seek relief from the Board if the property owners continued to be unresponsive to Verizon's efforts to gain access.

Through letters dated June 5, 2012, October 11, 2012, February 5, 2013, September 3, 2013, October 20, 2014 and December 8, 2014, Verizon requested that the Petition be amended to withdraw a total of 27 properties from consideration. The remaining 81 properties subject to this Order are set forth in Appendix A.

In response to Verizon's petition, the OCTV, by correspondence dated March 19, 2012 and May 2, 2012, provided the property owners the opportunity to comment on Verizon's request for relief. To date, the OCTV received 11 comments representing owners of 14 of the subject properties³. Of the comments received, most object to the design prepared by Verizon, suggesting or insisting on changes to that design for aesthetic issues, to prevent damage, or to preserve property values (Properties 10, 28, 44, 45, 46 and 49). In some of these cases, Verizon prepared new designs for review, but property representatives delayed review or became unresponsive. Other properties indicated various issues, including recent transfers of ownership or control (Properties 23, 24 and 47); an exclusive access agreement with an incumbent provider (Property 18); damage and / or compensation issues (Properties 14, 39 and 51); or general inquiries (Property 48). Staff reviewed each matter and sought responses from Verizon. Staff further worked with Verizon and property owners to address concerns, which resulted in the withdrawal of certain properties from this waiver application.

On February 5, 2013, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel submitted a letter to the Board providing that there were no outstanding issues that would preclude a finding that Verizon met the conditions for waivers for the subject properties and, therefore, it does not object to a grant

2

² The properties specified in Verizon's filing are attached as Appendix A.

³ The Board received additional comments regarding properties which were withdrawn by Verizon and are not addressed herein.

of Verizon's waiver request, subject to the conditions imposed on Verizon pursuant to the June 15, 2011 Board Order in Docket No. CO10100800.

As the Board noted in the Order granting Verizon's System-wide Franchise, both the legislation and Executive Order No. 25 (2006) acknowledge the special significance the issue of access and service to MDUs has in the system-wide franchise scheme. Moreover, the Board stated that Verizon "has committed to providing service to MDUs on a non-discriminatory basis, with specific configurations dependent upon the nature of the MDU In the event [Verizon] cannot find a solution to an MDU issue, [Verizon] has committed to notifying [the Division of Rate Counsel] and the Board with the appropriate information." I/M/O the Application of Verizon New Jersey, Inc. for a System-wide Cable Television Franchise, supra, page 4.

The Board reminds Verizon of its obligation to negotiate with MDU owners in good faith in an attempt to reach an access agreement. Additionally, the Board reminds MDUs that any provision in an incumbent cable operator access agreement purporting to provide for exclusive access is "null and void" under federal law. 47 <u>C.F.R.</u> § 76.2000(a).

Upon review of the Petition, Staff's inquiries and the responsive documents submitted regarding certain properties, the Board <u>HEREBY FINDS</u> Verizon's requested waivers to be consistent with Law and applicable regulations. Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY GRANTS</u> Verizon's amended request for relief subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Nothing contained herein shall limit Verizon or an MDU's ability to subsequently enter into an access agreement or seek access to extend service to an MDU. In the event that Verizon and a property owner should reach an agreement for access to the property, the rights of each party with regard to said access will be governed by the terms of N.J.S.A. 48:5A-49 and N.J.A.C. 14:18-4.5. A copy of all such agreements will be filed with the OCTV within ten (10) days of their execution.
- 2. In the event that Verizon receives a request for service by one or more residents or tenants of any of the properties, but does not have an agreement for access in place, Verizon will immediately commence proceedings for formal access to the property as provided by N.J.S.A. 48:5A-49 and N.J.A.C. 14:18-4.5.
- 3. Within ninety (90) days of the execution of an access agreement or the date that an Order of Access is issued by this Board, Verizon will undertake and complete any and all necessary site surveys, engineering, wiring design and pre-construction activities for the subject property or properties and submit a copy of same to the OCTV.
- 4. Within one-hundred eighty (180) days of the completion of all necessary site surveys, engineering, wiring design and landlord approval of the proposed method of wiring or installation, Verizon will complete all necessary construction needed to extend FiOS service to all residents or tenants of the property.

Within ten (10) days of its completion of all necessary construction needed to extend FiOS service to all residents or tenants of any of the subject property or properties, Verizon will file a certification of completion with the OCTV.

This Order shall be effective on April 27, 2015.

DATED: 4/15/15

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

BY:

RICHARD S. MRO PRESIDENT

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER MARY-ANNA HOLDEN COMMISSIONER

DIANNE SOLOMON COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

SECRETARY

HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

Appendix A

| Property Name (if applicable) | Address | Municipality | |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--------------|-----------|
| Parkview Terrace | | | |
| Apartments | 702 5 th Avenue | Asbury Park | |
| 2. The Capri | 302 5th Avenue | Asbury Park | |
| | 1100 Atlantic | | |
| 3. Stephen Manor | Avenue | Asbury Park | |
| 4. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 5. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | 32 West Church | | ` |
| 6. Crest Arms | Street | Bergenfield | |
| 7. | 85 West Main Street | Bergenfield | |
| | 372-378 South | | |
| 8. | Washington Avenue | Bergenfield | |
| | 24-26 East Fort Lee | | |
| 9. | Road | Bogota | |
| | | Bradley | |
| 10. MacInnes Flats | 501 Lake Terrace | Beach | |
| | 436 Anderson | Cliffside | |
| 11. | Avenue | Park | |
| | | Cliffside | |
| 12. | 245 Lawton Avenue | Park | |
| 13. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | 160 Palisade | Cliffside | |
| 14. | Avenue | Park | |
| | 334-336 Palisade | Cliffside | |
| 15. | Avenue | Park | |
| 16. Fairview Gardens | 580 Fairview Avenue | Fairview | |
| 17. | 92 Anderson Avenue | Fairview | |
| | 1241 Anderson | | |
| 18. Plateau Gardens | Avenue | Fort Lee | |
| 19. | 400 Midland Avenue | Garfield | |
| | 26 Van Winkle | | |
| 20. | Avenue | Garfield | |
| | 7104 Hudson | | |
| 21. | Avenue | Guttenberg | |
| 22. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 23. | 143 71st Street | Guttenberg | |
| 24. | 147 71st Street | Guttenberg | |
| 25. | 66 Jackson Street | Hackensack | |
| 26. Willow Court Apartments | 895 Main Street | Hackensack | |
| 27. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | 807 Washington | | |
| 28. The Seacaucus | Street | Hoboken | |
| | | . 100011011 | |
| | 130-132 Adams | | |

| Property Name (if applicable) | Address | Municipality | |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|-----------|
| 30. | 461 4th Street | Hoboken | |
| 31. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 32. | 727-733 Jefferson Street | Hoboken | |
| 33. Courtyard at Jefferson | 801 Madison Street | Hoboken | |
| 34. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 35. | 349 7th Street | Jersey City | |
| 36. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 37. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 38. | 700 Grove Street | Jersey City | |
| 39. Grandview Terrace | 3060 JFK Boulevard | Jersey City | |
| 40. | 248 Fowler Avenue | Jersey City | |
| 41. | 1-3 Nelson Avenue | Jersey City | |
| 42. Fallen Manor | 43 Church Street | Keansburg | |
| 43. | 238 Harrison Avenue | Lodi | |
| 44. | 15 Massey Street | Lodi | |
| 45. | 20 Rennie Place | Lodi | |
| 46. | 50 Brookside Avenue | Lodi | |
| 47. | 53 Chestnut Street | Lodi | |
| 48. | 1 Twombly Court | Morristown | |
| 49. The Carlton | 63 Hill Street | Morristown | |
| 50. | | Wichiotown | WITHDRAWN |
| | 6115 Granton | North | |
| 51. Westview Towers | Avenue | Bergen | |
| 52. | 8301 4th Avenue | North Bergen | |
| 53. | 8114 5th Avenue | North Bergen | |
| 54. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 55. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 56. | 245 Grand Avenue | Palisades Park | |
| 57. | 428 Grand Avenue | Palisades Park | |
| 58. Austin Manor | 49 Austin Street | Ridgefield Park | |
| 59. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 60. | 435 Teaneck Road | Ridgefield Park | |
| 61. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 62. Hopes Crossing | 1 Vans Way, et al | Toms River | |
| , | 1024 Greenwood | | |
| 63. | Avenue | Trenton | |

| Property Name (if applicable) | Address | Municipality | |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------|-----------|
| | 2-500 Fairview Drive; 1-30 Carver | | |
| 64. North 25 Housing Corp. | Lane | Trenton | |
| 65. | 319 8th Street | Union City | |
| 66. | 715 28th Street | Union City | * |
| 67. | 801 West Street | Union City | |
| 68. | 208 48th Street | Union City | |
| | 311, 315, 317 8th | | |
| 69. | Street | Union City | |
| 70. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 71. | 409 15th Street | Union City | |
| 72. | 725 18th Street | Union City | |
| 73. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 74. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 75. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | 1716 Summit | | |
| 76. | Avenue | Union City | |
| 77. | 700A 22nd Street | Union City | |
| 78. | 520 28th Street | Union City | |
| | 1202 Bergenline | | |
| 79. | Avenue | Union City | |
| | 4500 Bergenline | | |
| 80. | Avenue | Union City | |
| 81. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 82. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 83. | 3701 Park Avenue | Union City | |
| 84. | 325 8th Street | Union City | |
| 85. | 309 8th Street | Union City | |
| | 4816 Hudson | | |
| 86. | Avenue | Union City | |
| 87. | 60 Reservoir Avenue | Wallington | |
| 88. | 23 Brook Avenue | Wallington | |
| 89. | 3-5 Potter Place | Weehawken | |
| 90. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | | West New | |
| 91. | 4901 Murphy Place | York | |
| | | West New | |
| 92. | 429 61st Street | York | |
| | 6308 Hudson | West New | |
| 93. | Avenue | York | |
| | | West New | |
| 94. | 6311 Dewey Avenue | York | |
| | | West New | |
| 95. | 411 58th Street | York | |
| | | West New | |
| 96. | 525 51st Street | York | |
| 97. | | | WITHDRAWN |

| Property Name (if | Address | Municipality | |
|-------------------|-----------------|--------------|-----------|
| applicable) | | | |
| 98. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 99. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 100. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| 101. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | | West New | |
| 102. | 233 61st Street | York | |
| 103. | | | WITHDRAWN |
| | | West New | |
| 104. | 304 60th Street | York | |
| | | West New | |
| 105. | 316 59th Street | York | |
| | 6004 Buchanan | West New | |
| 106. | Place | York | |
| | 5129 Bergenline | West New | |
| 107. | Avenue | York | |
| | 5309 Hudson | West New | |
| 108. | Avenue | York | |

IN THE MATTER OF VERIZON NEW JERSEY, INC FOR RELIEF OF A REQUIREMENT TO EXTEND ITS FIOS TV SERVICE TO CERTAIN MULTI-DWELLING UNIT PROPERTIES LOCATED IN MUNICIPALITIES WHERE EXTENSION OF FIOS TV SERVICE IS REQUIRED UNDER THE TERMS OF ITS SYSTEM-WIDE FRANCHISE

DOCKET NO. CO11090534

Gregory M. Romano, Esq. Vice President and General Counsel Verizon New Jersey, Inc. 540 Broad Street, Floor 20 Newark, NJ 07102

William D. Smith, Esq. Assistant General Counsel Verizon 140 West Street 27th Floor New York, NY 10007

William Kettleson Vice President, Government Affairs Comcast 1191 Fries Mill Road Franklinville, NJ 08322

Cathleen Sims DeVito, Senior Director Northeast Government Relations Time Warner Cable, Northeast-NYC 120 East 23rd Street, 7th Floor New York, NY 10010

Dennis C. Linken, Esq. Scarcini & Hollenbeck, LLC 1100 Valley Brook Avenue Post Office Box 790 Lyndhurst, NJ 07071-0790

R. Thurman Barnes, Area Director Government and Public Affairs, NJ Cablevision Systems Corporation 124 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608

Sidney A. Sayovitz, Esq. Schenck, Price, Smith & King Post Office Box 905 Morristown, NJ 07963 Lawanda R. Gilbert, Esq., Acting Director Board of Public Utilities Office of Cable Television 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

William H. Furlong, Bureau Chief Richard Wagenblast, Admin. Analyst I Anthony Udechukwu, Admin Analyst II Board of Public Utilities Office of Cable Television 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Carol Artale, Esq. Legal Specialist Counsel's Office Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Geoffrey R. Gersten
Deputy Attorney General
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
Post Office Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101-45029

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003

Christopher White, Esq. Maria Novas-Ruiz Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003