

Agenda Date: 1/27/16 Agenda Item: 2M

ENERGY

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350
www.nj.gov/bpu/

N THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS)	ORDER APPROVING STIPULATION DOCKET NO. GR15070861
LITTOILING I FROOKAINIS)	DOCKET NO. GR 1507000 1

Parties of Record:

Andrew K. Dembia, Esq., New Jersey Natural Gas Company Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD:

By this Order, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") considers a Stipulation of Settlement ("Stipulation") executed by New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG" or "Company"), the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") and Board Staff (collectively, the "Parties").

BACKGROUND/PROCEDURAL HISTORY

On July 17, 2009, the Board authorized NJNG to implement three energy efficiency programs:

1) Home Performance with Energy Star ("HPwES") Enhancements; 2) Enhanced Warm Advantage Rebate Program; and 3) Commercial Customer Direct Install Program¹ ("Original Programs"). The Original Programs were designed to complement or supplement existing New Jersey Clean Energy Program ("NJCEP") offerings including the ongoing WarmAdvantage, COOLAdvantage, HPES, Commercial Direct Install and Smart Start Building programs.

¹ In re Energy Efficiency Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms and I/M/O the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Energy Efficiency Programs with an Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism, BPU Docket Nos. E009010056 and G009010057, Order dated July 17, 2009.

The Original Programs were available to eligible customers for approximately twelve months. In the event there was still program funding available after that period, NJNG could continue to offer the approved programs through December 31, 2010. NJNG was authorized to establish a rate through which it would recover or return to customers all deferred program costs, including rebate costs, customer incentive payments, customer financing costs, and associated reasonable and prudent incremental operation and maintenance expenses. ("EE Rate") These costs were to be recovered through the Company's Rider F. The Company was required to submit an annual cost recovery filing to establish future EE Rates. The annual filing includes updates to the investment levels, operating costs, and reconciled rate recovered to actual cost results.

By Order dated September 24, 2010, the Board authorized NJNG to extend and expand the Original Programs through December 31, 2011² ("September 2010 Order"). In addition to authorizing modifications to the Original Programs, the September 2010 Order also authorized the Company to implement an OPOWER pilot through which customers obtain information about their specific energy use in comparison to comparable households, an incremental incentive for Combined Heat and Power ("CHP") projects undertaken in conjunction with NJCEP, and a program that offers eligible commercial customers an opportunity for customized provisions, Fostering Environmental and Economic Development ("FEED") (collectively, "SAVEGREEN Project" or "SAVEGREEN").

By Order dated January 18, 2012, the Board authorized NJNG to continue its existing SAVEGREEN Project and implement certain proposed SAVEGREEN Project program changes through December 31, 2012, or twelve months from the date the Order approving the SAVEGREEN extension was served, whichever was later.³ By Order dated June 21, 2013, the Board authorized NJNG to further extend the SAVEGREEN Project, with modifications, through June 30, 2015.⁴ The SAVEGREEN Project was further extended through July 31, 2017 by Order dated July 23, 2015.⁵

As part of the current cost recovery mechanism, NJNG is authorized to amortize for recovery is SAVEGREEN investments in customer rebates, incentive payments and customer financing over a two, three, five and ten year period on a straight-line basis, with the rate of return on the unamortized SAVEGREEN investments approved in the previous orders. NJNG computes the rate of return component of its costs, in addition to deducting the accumulated amortization of its investments, by deducting the applicable deferred income taxes related to the amortization of

2

² In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO10030225, Order dated September 24, 2010.

³ In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GR11070425, Order dated January 19, 2012.

⁴ In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Cost Recovery Associated with Energy Efficiency Program, BPU Docket Nos. GO12070640 and GR12070641, Order dated June 21, 2013.("June 2013 Order")

⁵ In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO14121412, Order dated July 23, 2015.

rebates, incentives and financing costs over a two-, three-, five- and ten-year period for book purposes and over a one-year period for tax purposes.

NJNG was required to submit its annual cost recovery filing by June 1st of this year to establish future Rider F rates. However, by correspondence dated May 28, 21015, the Company notified the Board of a delay of its 2015 annual EE rate filing to allow time for the SAVEGREEN Project extension as part of Docket No. GO14121412 to be resolved. The Company indicated that the EE rate recovery filing would be submitted no later than July 31, 2015.

July 2015 Filing

By petition dated July 30, 2015, NJNG filed a petition with the Board, wherein the Company proposed to maintain the EE Rate of \$0.0327 per therm (including Sales and Use Tax ("SUT"), for recovery of the costs associated with the Original Programs as well as the SAVEGREEN Project ("2015 Petition"). According to the 2015 Petition, based on actuals through June 2015 for the reconciliation year ending September 2015 and estimates through September 2016 for the projected period, the current and anticipated levels of activity through September 2016 were expected to result in a projected under-recovered balance of \$0.284 million (including interest) as of September 30, 2016. NJNG proposed to maintain the current EE Rate.

Since there was no rate change requested, public hearings on this petition were not required. Rate Counsel and Staff propounded discovery on NJNG, which was responded to. As part of discovery, NJNG updated its revenue requirement to include actual information through September 30, 2015.

The Company's update results in an anticipated under-recovery of \$0.792 million (including interest) as of September 2016. Despite the update, the Company continues to assert that it is beneficial to maintain the current level of the EE Rate.

STIPULATION

Following discovery, the Parties reached a settlement of all issues, and on January 4, 2016 executed the Stipulation. The Stipulation provides the following:⁶

- 11. The Parties agree that the Company is authorized to recover only those costs associated with the SAVEGREEN Project previously approved in the July 2009, September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, and July 2015 Orders.
- 12. Although the Company's updated revenue requirement indicates a projected under recovered balance of \$0.792 million as of September 30, 2016, the Parties agree that NJNG should maintain the existing EE Rate of \$0.0327 per therm, which includes SUT (\$0.0306 excluding SUT) pursuant to the terms of Rider F of the Company's gas tariff as set forth in Attachment A to the Stipulation. This rate represents no change from the current rate per therm and there will be no impact to the overall bill of the average residential heating customer using 1,000 therms annually. This rate shall be in effect until changed by a future Board Order.

⁶ Although described at some length in this Order, should there be any conflict between this summary and the Stipulation, the terms of the Stipulation control, subject to the findings and conclusion in this Order.

- 13. The Parties agree that actual costs incurred prior to October 1, 2015, as shown in Attachment B to the Stipulation, have been reviewed and deemed prudent and reasonable by the Parties. Actual costs incurred by NJNG after that date are subject to review for reasonableness and prudence in future EE Rate filings.
- 14. The Parties agree that the Company's next annual EE Rate filing will be made on or about June 1, 2016.
- 15. As agreed to by the Parties and authorized in the July 2009, September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, and July 2015 Orders, any variance between costs and recoveries will accrue interest at a rate equal to the Company's monthly commercial paper rate. In the event that commercial paper was not utilized by the Company in the preceding month, the last calculated rate will be used. The interest rate shall not exceed the Company's rate of return as authorized by the BPU in the Company's most recent base rate case, BPU Docket No. GR07110889, or until changed by Board Order. Interest on over/under recoveries will be calculated using simple interest, based on the average beginning and ending over/under recovery balances for the month, on a net-of-tax basis. The sum of the monthly interest to be collected from or credited to ratepayers will be included in the rate calculations for the next annual EE Rate filing.

DISCUSSION AND FINDING

The Board has carefully reviewed the record, including the 2015 Petition, as well as the Stipulation. Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY FINDS</u> that the Stipulation represents a fair and reasonable resolution of the issues, demonstrates that the costs have been reviewed and determined to be both reasonable and prudent, and is therefore in the public interest. The Board <u>HEREBY ADOPTS</u> the attached Stipulation as its own, incorporating by reference its terms and conditions as if fully set forth herein.

As a result of the Board's approval of the Stipulation, customers will not see any change in their annual bills.

This Board Order shall be effective as of February 6, 2016.

The Board <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> NJNG to file revised tariff sheets conforming to the terms of the Stipulation within five (5) days of service of this Order.

The Company's costs will remain subject to audit by the Board. This Decision and Order shall not preclude nor prohibit the Board from taking any actions determined to be appropriate as a result of any such audit.

DATED:

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

RICHARD S. MRO

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER

DIANNE SOLOMON COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

RENE'KIM ASBURY SECRETARY

van 28, 2016

MARY-ANNA HOLDEN COMMISSIONER

UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA COMMISSIONER

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

IN THE MATTER OF THE LETTER PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH THE ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS - DOCKET NO. GR15070861

SERVICE LIST

Jerome May, Director
Division of Energy
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Jerome.may@bpu.state.nj.us

Irene Kim Asbury, Esq.
Secretary of the Board
Office of the Secretary
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Irene.asbury@bpu.state.nj.us

Alice Bator, Chief
Division of Energy
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Alice.bator@bpu.state.nj.us

Stacy Peterson
Division of Energy
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Stacy.peterson@bpu.state.nj.us

Andrea Reid
Division of Energy
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Andrea.reid@bpu.state.nj.us

Alex Moreau, Esq.
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
Post Office Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101-45029
Alex.moreau@dol.lps.state.nj.us

Christopher Psihoules, Esq.
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
Post Office Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101-45029
Christopher.psihoules@dol.lps.state.nj.us

Stefanie A. Brand, Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 sbrand@rpa.state.nj.us

Brian O. Lipman, Litigation Manager Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 blipman@rpa.state.nj.us

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq.
Division of Rate Counsel
140 East Front Street, 4th Floor
Post Office Box 003
Trenton, NJ 08625-0003
Fthomas-friel@rpa.state.ni.us

Sarah H. Steindel, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 ssteindel@rpa.state.ni.us Rachel Boylan, Esq.
Counsel's Office
Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350
Rachel boylan@bpu.state.nj.us

Geoffrey Gersten, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
Post Office Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101-45029
Geoffrey.gersten@dol.lps.state.nj.us

Caroline Vachier, Esq.
Department of Law & Public Safety
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street
Post Office Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101-45029
Caroline.vachier@dol.lps.state.nj.us

Mark Sperduto New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Michael Moscufo New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719 Maura Caroselli, Esq. 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003

Andrew K. Dembia, Esq. New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

France Karras New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Tina Trebino
New Jersey Natural Gas Company
1415 Wyckoff Road
Post Office Box 1464
Wall, NJ 07719

James Corcoran New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719



January 5, 2016

VIA EMAIL AND USPS

Honorable Irene Kim Asbury, Secretary New Jersey Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Re:

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS BPU DOCKET NO. GR15070861

Dear Secretary Asbury:

Enclosed with this letter is a fully executed Stipulation for Provisional Rates in the above captioned matter. Original signature pages will be forwarded when they have been received.

Please do not hesitate to contact me at 732-938-1073 if you need any additional information.

Very truly yours,

Andrew K. Dembia

Regulatory Affairs Counsel

Enclosures

C: Service List (electronically only)

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS BPU DOCKET NO. GR15070861

SERVICE LIST

NJNG

Mark R. Sperduto New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Andrew K. Dembia New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Michael Moscufo New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Tina Trebino
New Jersey Natural Gas Company
1415 Wyckoff Road
P.O. Box 1464
Wall, NJ 07719

France Karras New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

James M. Corcoran New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

NJ BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

Jerome May N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Fl Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Alice Bator N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Fl Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

* Robert Schultheis
N.J. Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Fl
Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Megan Lupo, Legal Specialist N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Fl Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Stacy Peterson N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Fl Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL

 Stefanie A. Brand, Director Division of Rate Counsel
 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625

^{*} Indicates individuals designated to receive hard copies of discovery responses.

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS BPU DOCKET NO. GR15070861

SERVICE LIST

Maura Caroselli, Esq.
 Division of Rate Counsel
 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor
 Trenton, NJ 08625

Brian Lipman, Litigation Manager Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625

Sarah Steindel Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625

Shelly Massey, Paralegal Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Trenton, NJ 08625

* Robert Henkes
Henkes Consulting
7 Sunset Road
Old Greenwich, CT 06870

<u>DEPT. OF LAW & PUBLIC SAFETY –</u> DIVISON OF LAW

Caroline Vachier, Section Chief Deputy Attorney General Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law 124 Halsey Street P.O. Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101

Alex Moreau
Deputy Attorney General
Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101

* Christopher Psihoules
Deputy Attorney General
Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07101

^{*} Indicates individuals designated to receive hard copies of discovery responses.

STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

IN THE MATTER OF THE LETTER)	
PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL)	STIPULATION OF
GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE)	SETTLEMENT
COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH)	
THE ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAM)	
)	BPU DOCKET NO. GR15070861
)	

APPEARANCES:

Andrew Dembia, Esq., New Jersey Natural Gas Company for the Petitioner, New Jersey Natural Gas Company

Sarah H. Steindel, and Maura Caroselli, Assistant Deputy Rate Counsels, (Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel)

Alex Moreau and Christopher M. Psihoules, Deputy Attorneys General, for the Staff of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities (John J. Hoffman, Acting Attorney General of New Jersey)

TO: THE NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

1. On July 31, 2015, New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG" or the "Company") filed a petition (the "Petition") in Docket No. GR15070861 with the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities (the "Board" or "BPU") requesting that the Board maintain the Company's existing Energy Efficiency ("EE") rate of \$0.0327 per therm after-tax. The Company submitted the Petition to comply with the terms of the Board's Order issued on June 21, 2013 in Docket Nos. GO12071640 and GO12070641 ("June 2013 Order"). That Order approved both the continuation of energy-efficiency programs offered through The SAVEGREEN Project® ("SAVEGREEN")

and the recovery of SAVEGREEN investments and operating costs collected through the Board-approved NJNG Tariff Sheet Rider F ("Rider F"). Based on the current and anticipated levels of activity in SAVEGREEN and the projected under-recovered balance of \$0.792 million as of September 30, 2016, NJNG believes that it is appropriate to maintain the EE Rate currently included in Rider F of \$0.0327 per therm after-tax.

BACKGROUND

- 2. NJNG's participation in energy-efficiency programs, collected through Rider F, was originally approved by the Board in an Order dated July 17, 2009¹ and subsequently approved to continue, with modifications in Orders dated September 24, 2010² ("September 2010 Order"), January 18, 2012 ("January 2012 Order") in Docket No. GR11070425, the June 2013 Order and the recently approved Order dated July 23, 2015 ("July 2015 Order") in Docket No. GO14121412 extending the SAVEGREEN Program through July 31, 2017. These Orders all adopted terms of stipulations entered into among the Company, Board Staff, and the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") (collectively the "Parties").
- 3. As stated by the Company in its Petition, the SAVEGREEN energy-efficiency and conservation programs are designed to complement and supplement aspects of New Jersey's Clean Energy Program ("NJCEP") in an attempt to encourage higher levels of customer participation in NJNG's service territory. NJNG maintains that the programs do not duplicate or eliminate any of

¹ <u>I/M/O/ Energy Efficiency Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms and I/M/O/ the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Energy Efficiency Programs with an Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism, BPU Docket Nos. EO09010056 and GO09010057.</u>

² I/M/O the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No.GR11070425. GO10030224.

the NJCEP programs, instead they work to increase customer awareness, enhance participation, and support utilization of NJCEP efforts throughout the State.

- 4. NJNG was authorized to establish a rate through which it can recover from customers SAVEGREEN costs, including rebates, customer incentive payments, customer financing, and associated reasonable and prudent incremental operation and maintenance ("O&M") expenses ("Program Costs"). It was agreed that such Program Costs are subject to recovery pursuant to the terms of Rider F.
- 5. As part of the current cost recovery mechanism, NJNG is authorized to amortize for recovery its SAVEGREEN investments in customer rebates, incentive payments, and customer financing over a two (2), three (3), five (5) and ten (10) year period on a straight line basis, with the rate of return on the unamortized SAVEGREEN investments approved in the September 2010 Order, the January 2012 Order, June 2013 Order, and the July 2015 Order. NJNG computes the rate of return component of its costs, in addition to deducting the accumulated amortization of its investments, by deducting the applicable deferred income taxes related to the amortization of rebates, incentives, and financing costs over a two-, three-, five-, and ten-year period for book purposes and over a one-year period for tax purposes.
- 6. NJNG is to submit a June 1st annual SAVEGREEN cost recovery filing to establish future Rider F rates. The filing has usually been made coincident with, but separate from, NJNG's annual Basic Gas Supply Service filing, and is to include updates to the SAVEGREEN investment levels, operating costs, and reconciled rate recoveries to actual cost results. However, by correspondence dated May 28, 2015, the Company notified the Board of a delay of its 2015 annual EE rate filing since the pending SAVEGREEN Program extension filing was expected to be settled

by the Parties in early June 2015³. According to the Company, it was anticipated that the Board would consider that stipulation of settlement at its June 17, 2015 agenda meeting. Therefore, the EE rate recovery filing for 2015 would be submitted no later than July 31, 2015 to reflect the currently-approved and recently-decided EE Programs. Due to continuing settlement discussions, the Company agreed to extend the Board's 180 day review period, set to expire on June 30, 2015, until July 31, 2015. The Board subsequently approved a stipulation of settlement at its July 22, 2015 agenda meeting.

PROCEDURAL HISTORY

- 7. Since there was no rate change requested, public hearings on this Petition were not required.
- 8. NJNG has received and responded to all discovery requests that have been propounded in this proceeding by BPU Staff and Rate Counsel.
- 9. The Parties have discussed the matters at issue in this proceeding. Based upon those discussions, the Parties agreed to enter into this Stipulation, in resolution of certain issues raised in or relating to the Company's associated cost recovery mechanism for the SAVEGREEN program, to remain at current levels.
- 10. Specifically, based upon and subject to the terms and conditions set forth herein, the Parties **STIPULATE AND AGREE** as follows:

³ July 2015 Order (BPU Docket No. GO14121412).

STIPULATED MATTERS

- 11. The Parties agree that the Company is authorized to recover only those costs associated with the SAVEGREEN Programs previously approved in the July 2009, September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, and July 2015 Orders.
- 12. Although the Company's updated revenue requirement indicates a projected under recovered balance of \$0.792 million as of September 30, 2016, the Parties agree that NJNG should maintain the existing EE Rate of \$0.0327 per therm, which includes Sales and Use Tax ("SUT") (\$0.0306 excluding SUT) pursuant to the terms of Rider F of the Company's gas tariff, as set forth in Attachment A. This rate represents no change from the current rate per therm and there will be no impact to the overall bill of the average residential heating customer using 1,000 therms annually. This rate shall be in effect until changed by a future Board Order.
- 13. The Parties agree that actual costs incurred prior to October 1, 2015, as shown in Attachment B, have been reviewed and deemed prudent and reasonable by the Parties. Actual costs incurred by NJNG after that date are subject to review for reasonableness and prudence in future EE Rate filings.
- 14. The Parties agree that the Company's next annual EE Rate filing will be made on or about June 1, 2016.
- 15. As agreed to by the Signatory Parties and authorized in the July 2009, September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, and July 2015 Orders, any variance between costs and recoveries will accrue interest at a rate equal to the Company's monthly commercial paper rate. In the event that commercial paper was not utilized by the Company in the preceding month, the last calculated rate will be used. The interest rate shall not exceed the Company's rate of return as authorized by

the BPU in the Company's most recent base rate case, BPU Docket No. GR07110889, or until changed by Board Order. Interest on over/under recoveries will be calculated using simple interest, based on the average beginning and ending over/under recovery balances for the month, on a net-of-tax basis. The sum of the monthly interest to be collected from or credited to ratepayers will be included in the rate calculations for the next annual EE Rate filing.

- 16. This Stipulation represents a mutual balancing of interests, contains interdependent provisions and, therefore, is intended to be accepted and approved in its entirety. In the event any particular aspect of this Stipulation is not accepted and approved in its entirety by the Board, any Party aggrieved thereby shall not be bound to proceed with this Stipulation and shall have the right to litigate all issues addressed herein to a conclusion. More particularly, in the event this Stipulation is not adopted in its entirety by the Board in any applicable Order(s), then any Party hereto is free to pursue its then available legal remedies with respect to all issues addressed in this Stipulation as though this Stipulation had not been signed.
- 17. It is the intent of the Parties that the provisions hereof be approved by the Board as being in the public interest. The Parties further agree that they consider the Stipulation to be binding on them for all purposes herein.
- 18. It is specifically understood and agreed that this Stipulation represents a negotiated agreement and has been made exclusively for the purpose of these proceedings. Except as expressly provided herein, NJNG, BPU Staff, and Rate Counsel shall not be deemed to have approved, agreed to, or consented to any principle or methodology underlying or supposed to underlie any agreement provided herein and, in total or by specific item, is in no way binding upon them in any other proceeding, except to enforce the terms of this Stipulation.

WHEREFORE, the Parties hereto do respectfully submit this Stipulation and request that the Board issue a Decision and Order approving it in its entirety, in accordance with the terms hereof, as soon as reasonably possible.

NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY

PETITIONER

ANDREW K DEMBIA

Regulatory Affairs Counsel

NEW JERSEY DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL STEFANIE A. BRAND, DIRECTOR

By: Sarm

Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel

JOHN J. HOFFMAN

ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY

Attorney for the Staff of the Board of Public Utilities

By:

LEX MY REAU

Deputy Attorney General

Date: December 30 2015

Eighth Revised Sheet No. 173 Superseding Seventh Revised Sheet No. 173

RIDER "F"

ENERGY EFFICIENCY - EE

I. Determination of the Rate

The EE rate shall be derived in the following manner:

- 1. An estimate shall be made of the total annual cost related to the programs. This rider will include only expenses for energy-efficiency programs approved by the Board in BPU Docket Nos. GO09010057, GO10030225, GR11070425, GO12070640 and GO14121412 unless modified further by Board Order.
- 2. An estimate shall be made of the total annual volume of prospective jurisdictional sales of gas (in therms) to NJNG's sales and transportation customers.
- 3. The prospective costs (per paragraph (1)) shall be adjusted upward or downward to the extent of the amount of any prior under-recovery or over-recovery to determine the total costs to be recovered and then shall be divided by the estimated total volume of prospective sales (per paragraph (2)), to determine the per unit cost recovery rate.

II. Tracking the Operation of the EE

The Company shall calculate carrying costs on the average monthly balances of under-or over-recovery of deferred costs based upon the Company's monthly commercial paper rate. The carrying cost calculation shall be based on the net of tax beginning and end average monthly balance. The carrying costs shall accrue on a monthly basis and shall be rolled into the balance at the end of each EE recovery year.

In accordance with P.L., 1997 c. 162, the charges applicable under this Rider include provision for the New Jersey Sales and Use Tax ("SUT"), and when billed to customers exempt from this tax, as set forth in Rider "B", shall be reduced by the amount of such tax included therein.

The EE factor shall be credited/collected on a per therm basis within the Delivery Charge for all service classifications to which Rider "F" applies. The EE factor is as set forth below:

\$0.0327

Date of Issue:

July 24, 2015

Issued by: Mark R. Sperduto, Senior Vice President

Wall, NJ 07719

Effective for service rendered on and after August 1, 2015

New Jersey Natural Gas Energy Efficiency Recovery Rates

(\$000)

(4000)		
A struct I land on // Overn) management of 0/20/45	¢	(4,000)
Actual Under/(Over) recovery at 9/30/15	\$	(1,693)
Estimated Revenue Requirements (Oct 2015 through Sep 2016):	œ.	2.025
RGGI	\$	2,025
EE Extension		3,818
July 2013 Programs		8,376
August 2015 Programs		9,466
Total Amount to be Recovered	\$	21,994
	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	
Per Therm Recovery		
Firm Throughput (000 therms)		692,607
Calculated Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0318
Calculated After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0340
Current Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0306
Current After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0327
Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm Increase/ (Decrease)	\$	-
After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm Increase/ (Decrease)	\$	-

NOTE: NJNG proposes no change to its current EE Rate