

Agenda Date: 11/21/17

Agenda Item: 2B

ENERGY

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350
www.nj.gov/bpu/

IN THE MATTER OF THE VERIFIED PETITION OF)	ORDER APPROVING
JERSEY CENTRAL POWER & LIGHT COMPANY FOR)	STIPULATION
THE REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF COSTS INCURRED)	
FOR ENVIRONMENTAL REMEDIATION OF)	
MANUFACTURED GAS PLANT SITES PURSUANT TO)	
THE REMEDIATION ADJUSTMENT CLAUSE OF ITS)	
FILED TARIFF ("2015 RAC FILING"))	DOCKET NO. ER16090922

Parties of Record:

Gregory Eisenstark, Esq., Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP, on behalf of Jersey Central Power & Light Company **Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director,** New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD:

On September 30, 2016, Jersey Central Power and Light Company ("JCP&L" or "Company") filed a petition ("2015 RAC Petition") with the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") seeking review and approval of the actual costs and expenditures incurred by JCP&L relating to the environmental remediation of its former manufactured gas plant ("MGP") sites for the period January 1, 2015 through December 31, 2015 ("2015 RAC Period") and an adjustment to the Remediation Adjustment Clause ("Rider RAC") component of the Company's Societal Benefits Charge ("SBC"). By this Decision and Order, the Board considers a stipulation of settlement ("Stipulation") executed by JCP&L, Board Staff, and the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") (collectively, "Parties") which seeks to resolve the 2015 RAC Petition.

BACKGROUND AND PROCEDURAL HISTORY

JCP&L's Rider RAC, which is a separate component of its SBC,¹ allows for the recovery of reasonably incurred MGP remediation program costs ("MGP Costs"), including carrying costs, amortized over a seven-year rolling average period.

¹ The 2015 RAC Petition did not seek any adjustment of other SBC rate components, i.e. the New Jersey Clean Energy Program, the Universal Service Fund, and Lifeline charges.

In the 2015 RAC Petition, the Company requested an increase in its Rider RAC charge to allow the recovery on an additional \$1.617 million (excluding Sales and Use Tax ("SUT")) on an annual basis. The 2015 RAC Period costs totaled \$8.624 million as calculated below:

\$ = \$000	Amount
Remediation Costs	\$6,574
+ Accrued Interest	\$852
= Net MGP costs	\$7,426
- NRD expenses	(\$99)
- Incentive comp	(\$13)
= 2015 MGP expenses	\$7,314
+ Deferred RAC balances	\$1,310
= Total recoverable	\$8,624

In accordance with previous Board Orders, the Company's proposed Rider RAC charge of \$0.000552² was determined by calculating the sum of: (1) one seventh of the Board approved-deferred RAC under recovered balance at December 31, 2014 of \$64,428,766, exclusive of Natural Resource Damage ("NRD") related and incentive compensation costs and (2) one-seventh of the 2015 RAC related costs (including an under recovered balance of \$1,309,990) of \$8,623,994. The sum of these amounts total \$10,436,109, which was divided by the projected retail sales volumes to yield the proposed Rider RAC charge of \$0.000552.³

Public hearings in this matter were held on September 18, 2017 in Morristown, New Jersey and Freehold, New Jersey. No members of the public attended or filed written comments.

STIPULATION

Following a review of discovery and subsequent settlement discussions, the Parties reached an agreement on the 2015 RAC Petition, and on October 6, 2017 executed the Stipulation. The key terms of the Stipulation are as follows: 4

1. The Company's Rider RAC rate will be increased by \$0.000080 per kWh to \$0.000516 per kWh (excluding SUT).

² All rates quoted herein include SUT, unless otherwise noted.

³ On November 14, 2016, the Board Secretary issued a letter under Docket No. ER16111054 advising all New Jersey electric and gas utilities, pursuant to <u>P.L.</u> 2016, <u>c.</u> 57, that the SUT to be charged to customers for utility service had been changed from 7.0% to 6.875% effective January 1, 2017. As a result of this change in the SUT rate, the \$0.000552 rate per kWh was changed to \$0.000551 per kWh effective January 1, 2017.

⁴ Although described at some length in this Order, should there be any conflict between this summary and the Stipulation, the terms of the Stipulation are controlling, subject to the findings and conclusions of this Order.

2. The impact of this increase on a residential customer taking service under rate classification RS and having an average monthly usage of 500 kWh would be a change in the monthly bill from \$68.33 to \$68.37, an increase of \$0.04 per month or 0.06%.

- 3. The Company represents that no remediation properties were sold during the RAC remediation period for which the current RAC rate is being established. The Company also represents that any revenues it received from the lease of any remediation properties during the 2015 RAC Period were credited to the deferred RAC balance.
- 4. The Parties agree that the Company's ending recoverable deferred RAC balance at December 31, 2015 was an under-recovered balance of \$73,052,760, subject to the Parties' reservation of their rights to challenge the recovery of expenditures that might be found to have been recorded in error or improperly accounted for in the pending Board Staff audit of RAC expenditures for 2005. In addition to the deferred RAC net balance at December 31, 2015 of \$73,052,760, the Company has deferred: (i) \$749,686 of costs related to NRD issues from 2005 through 2015; and (ii) \$156,325 of incentive compensation paid to personnel who worked on RAC matters from 2006 through 2015. The Parties agree that it is appropriate for such NRD-related and incentive compensation costs to be deferred. The Company represents that the Stipulation does not include the recovery of any administrative, legal, consulting or other costs associated with NRD claims currently being investigated by the New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection or any costs associated with the incentive compensation referenced above. The Parties agree that it is appropriate for NRD-related and incentive compensation costs be deferred. The Parties stipulate and agree that the Board should make no determination in this proceeding as to the reasonableness, or the recoverability under the Company's RAC filings, of NRD damages or related costs or of incentive compensation amounts, if any,
- 5. The Parties agree that NRD-related MGP expenditures of \$98,616 incurred during the 2015 RAC Period are not included in the \$73,052,760 recoverable RAC balance as of December 31, 2015. The Parties agree that incentive compensation of \$13,248 incurred during the 2015 RAC period is not included in the \$73,052,760 recoverable RAC balance as of December 31, 2015. The deferred NRD and incentive compensation amounts have been excluded from the RAC rates set forth above. The Parties expressly reserve their rights to argue their respective positions on these issues in future proceedings, as appropriate.
- 6. JCP&L claims that it is entitled to retain NRD-related costs totaling approximately \$76,000 from two previous RAC years, 2003 and 2004. It is Rate Counsel's and Staff's position that NRD-related costs are not included within the scope of the Board's RAC recovery authorization and therefore are not eligible for recovery through utility RAC clauses. JCP&L does not agree with Rate Counsel's and Staff's position concerning NRD-related cost recovery, but nonetheless agrees that nothing shall affect or limit the Parties' rights to challenge such NRD-related cost recovery in connection with the Company's previous RAC Filings. The Company also reserves all of its rights to contest any such challenge by the Parties. The Company further agrees that it will continue to defer NRD-related MGP costs in future RAC filings pending the final Board resolution of the issue concerning the inclusion of NRD-related costs within the scope of the Board's RAC recovery authorization. The Parties agree that the Company shall be authorized to

continue to defer all additional reasonable and prudent MGP remediation costs and expenses incurred and deferred subsequent to December 31, 2015, including NRD-related and incentive compensation costs, together with accrued interest thereon, for review and inclusion in future annual RAC filings and related adjustments to the Company's Rider RAC, subject to the Board's review and approval. In accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles ("GAAP") as applied by the Company's independent auditors, the deferred RAC balance at December 31, 2015 included certain RAC expense accruals. Although the Parties will continue to review the levels of such accruals in the Company's deferred RAC accounts in future proceedings, the Parties do not object to the use of such GAAP accrual accounting procedures as required by the Company's auditors.

- 7. Consistent with its agreement in the 2005 RAC Filing Stipulation settling the 2005 Annual RAC Filing, which was approved by the Board by Decision and Order dated April 27, 2009 (Docket No. ER06030258), the Company performs outside legal and community relations activities for the purposes of supporting its remediation program and mitigating potential liabilities related to its remediation program. The Company agrees to continue to provide a description and explanation of the expenses incurred for these services in subsequent RAC filings, with claimed confidential information provided pursuant to a confidentiality agreement.
- 8. Also consistent with the 2005 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company agrees to continue to maintain a complaint log for each MGP site that will provide details about complaints (exclusive of formal legal claims or lawsuits) received from property owners, neighboring residents and municipal officials and a description of the Company's actions responding to that complaint.
- The Company agrees that it will continue to include with its RAC filings responses to the minimum filing requirements ("MFRs") as set forth in Exhibit A to the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation which was approved by Board Decision and Order dated March 9, 2011 (Docket No. ER09030194).
- 10. Consistent with the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company will competitively bid remediation projects expecting to cost in excess of \$250,000 with respect to work at existing sites or work at any new sites identified in the future. If competitive bidding is not utilized, the Company will be required to show that competitive bidding was not practical or advantageous under the circumstances.
- 11. The Company will make annual RAC filings, which will not be combined with SBC or System Control Charge filings, regardless of whether it is seeking any change in its RAC recovery rate.
- 12. The Company agrees to provide a final reconciliation of its annual RAC factor recovery within ninety days of the completion of each RAC recovery year, which reconciliation will include the calculation of actual sales volumes that recovered the RAC factor and the resultant net expense or credit amount which is to be carried over to the next recovery year. Implementation and/or adjustment of the RAC factor is subject to the Parties' review of RAC expenditures and reconciliation thereof in the Company's future RAC and/or SBC proceedings.

13. The Parties agree that the terms of the Stipulation shall be deemed to resolve all factual and legal issues relating to the determination of all amounts that were or could have been included in the calculation of the Company's deferred RAC balance through and at December 31, 2015, except as described above with respect to NRD-related costs and incentive compensation costs.

14. JCP&L agrees to file its next annual RAC Filing for the period January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2016 no later than December 1, 2017.

DISCUSSION AND FINDINGS

The Board has reviewed the record in this matter, including the Stipulation. The Board <u>FINDS</u> the Stipulation to be reasonable and in the public interest, being persuaded that the MGP Costs have been thoroughly reviewed. The Board <u>HEREBY FINDS</u> that, the Company's MGP remediation work performed during the 2015 RAC Period was prudent, and the resulting MGP Costs for the 2015 RAC Period are reasonable and prudent.

Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY ADOPTS</u> the Stipulation as its own, as if fully set forth herein and <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> that the Company's RAC rate be set at \$0.000551 per kWh, including SUT for services rendered on or after December 1, 2017 and shall remain in effect until further Order of the Board. Based on the Stipulation, a typical residential customer using 500 kWh per month will see an increase in their monthly bill of \$0.04 or 0.06%.

The Board <u>HEREBY DIRECTS</u> the Company to file revised tariff sheets that conform to the terms and conditions of this Order by December 1, 2017.

The Board <u>FURTHER ORDERS</u> that the NRD related costs of \$749,686 covering the period 2005 through 2015, and \$156,325 for incentive compensation related to the period 2006 through 2015 shall continue to be deferred until such time as the Board addresses the rate recoverability of expenditures related to NRD and incentive compensation via the RAC mechanism.

The Company's costs, including those related to the RAC, will remain subject to audit by the Board. Additionally, the Company will periodically conduct audits of these expenses. This Decision and Order shall not preclude nor prohibit the Board from taking any actions determined to be appropriate as a result of any such audit.

This Order shall be effective on November 30, 2017.

DATED: 11/21/17

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

RICHARD S. MROZ

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER

DIANNE SOLOMON COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

IRENE KIM ASBURY SECRETARY MARY-ANNA HOLDEN

COMMISSIONER

UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA

COMMISSIONER

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

Agenda Date: 11/21/17

Agenda Item: 2B

IN THE MATTER OF THE VERIFIED PETITION OF JERSEY CENTRAL POWER & LIGHT COMPANY FOR THE REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF COSTS INCURRED FOR ENVIRONMENTAL REMEDIATION OF MANUFACTURED GAS PLANT SITES PURSUANT TO THE REMEDIATION ADJUSTMENT CLAUSE OF ITS FILED TARIFF ("2015 RAC FILING") DOCKET NO. ER16090922

SERVICE LIST

Jersey Central Power and Light Company

Gregory Eisenstark, Esq., Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP 120 Albany Street Plaza New Brunswick, NJ 08901 geisenstark@windelsmarx.com

Carol Pittavino
Rates & Regulatory Affairs-NJ
First Energy Service Company
Greensburg Corporate Center
800 Cabin Hill Drive
Greensburg, PA 15601
cpittavino@firstenergycorp.com

Division of Rate Counsel

140 East Front Street, 4th Fl. Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-003

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director sbrand@rpa.ni.gov

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. fthomas@rpa.nj.gov

Henry Ogden, Esq. hogden@rpa.nj.gov

Maura Caroselli, Esq. mcaroselli@rpa.nj.gov

Department of Law & Public Safety

Division of Law 124 Halsey Street Post Office Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101-45029

Geoffrey Gersten, DAG geoffrey.gersten@law.njoag.gov

Board of Public Utilities

44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Irene Kim Asbury, Esq. Secretary of the Board irene.asbury@bpu.nj.gov

Thomas Walker, Director Division of Energy thomas.walker@bpu.nj.gov

Stacy Peterson, Deputy Director Division of Energy stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

Scott Sumliner
Division of Energy
scott.sumlinerl@bpu.nj.gov

Bethany Rocque-Romaine, Esq. Counsel's Office bethany.romaine@bpu.nj.gov

Megan Lupo, Esq.
Counsel's Office
megan.lupo@bpu.nj.gov

Valerie Haynes
Case Management
valerie.haynes@bpu.nj.gov

Alex Moreau, DAG alex.moreau@law.njoag.gov

Renee Greenberg, DAG renee.greenberg@law.njoag.gov

Patricia Krogman, DAG patricia.krogman@law.njoag.gov

STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

In the Matter of the Verified Petition of Jersey Central Power & Light Company for the Review and Approval of Costs Incurred for Environmental Remediation of Manufactured Gas Plant Sites Pursuant to the Remediation Adjustment Clause of Its Filed Tariff ("2015 RAC Filing")

STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

BPU Docket No. ER16090922

TO THE HONORABLE BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES:

APPEARANCES:

Gregory Eisenstark, Esq. (Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP) for the Petitioner, Jersey Central Power & Light Company

Henry M. Ogden, Esq., Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel, and Maura Caroselli, Esq., Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel, Division of Rate Counsel (Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director)

Renee Greenberg, Alex Moreau and Patricia A. Krogman, Deputy Attorneys General, for the Staff of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities (Christopher S. Porrino, Attorney General of New Jersey)

This Stipulation of Settlement (the "Stipulation") is hereby made and executed as of the dates indicated below, by and among the Petitioner, Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L" or the "Company"), the Staff of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Staff") and the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") (collectively, the "Parties").

The Parties do hereby join in recommending that the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") issue an Order approving the Stipulation, based upon the following terms:

Background

On September 30, 2016, JCP&L filed with the Board a Verified Petition, including supporting schedules, seeking review and approval of costs incurred for environmental remediation of manufactured gas plant sites pursuant to the Remediation Adjustment Clause ("RAC") of its filed Tariff ("2015 RAC Filing"). The RAC is a component of the Company's Societal Benefits Charge ("SBC"). The Verified Petition requested a calculated increase to JCP&L's Rider RAC charge of \$0.000080/kWh (not including SUT), which would recover an additional \$1.617 million annually. The Company proposed that the new rate become effective on January 1, 2017.

The 2015 RAC Filing provided an opportunity to conduct a review of all actual costs and expenditures incurred by JCP&L relating to environmental remediation of its former manufactured gas plant ("MGP") sites for the period from January 1, 2015 through December 31, 2015. As indicated in Attachment A-1 to the Company's Verified Petition (a copy of which is attached hereto as Appendix A), JCP&L sought to recover incremental expenses incurred in connection with its MGP remediation program during calendar year 2015 in the amount of \$6,573,907. The Company also requested recovery of carrying costs for calendar year 2015 in the amount of \$851,961, leaving a net balance of unrecovered MGP costs at December 31, 2015 of \$7,425,868 (net of insurance recovery). The foregoing incremental expense amounts for calendar year 2015 included \$98,616 in costs related to MGP Natural Resource Damage ("NRD") issues and \$13,248 of MGP-related incentive compensation. The Company proposed to continue to defer NRD-related and incentive compensation costs for 2015, but not to recover

such NRD-related and incentive compensation costs, including interest, until there was a final resolution of the issue concerning the inclusion of these costs within the scope of the Board's RAC recovery mechanism. No such NRD-related or incentive compensation costs for 2015 would be deemed to have been recovered by application of over-recoveries from other components of Rider SBC. After subtracting the deferred NRD-related and incentive compensation costs, the net amount submitted for recovery was \$7,314,004 (see Attachment A-1, line 25). In addition, the Company requested recovery of the under-recovered deferred RAC balance of \$1,309,990 at the end of calendar year 2015, resulting in a total of \$8,623,994. (see Attachment A-1, line 29).

The resulting net deferred RAC account balance at December 31, 2015, after deduction of such NRD-related and incentive compensation costs, was \$73,052,760, as shown in the following chart:

Jersey Central Power & Light Company Manufactured Gas Plant Remediation Adjustment Clause (RAC)

	Balance			* .				• • •				
	YEAR 2005	YEAR 2006	YEAR 2007	YEAR ZOOS	YEAR 2009	YEAR 2010	YEAR 2011	YEAR 2012	YEAR 2013,	YEAR 2014	YEAR 2015	Total
Actual Expenditures (a)	9,891,329	2,376,664	5,5\$1,093	7,692,538	9,039,821	15.578,590	7,700,028	7,939.16ē	9.455,463	17,085,278	6.573,907	98.985,177
NRD Expenses included above (p)	62,855	157,591	53,434	18,016	69,580	53.563	13,404	83,412	5,116	94,0 65	95,615	749,656
Incentive Compensation included above		27,479	32,141	30,345	. :	13,785	10,E74	11,328	10,259	6,865	13,245	:\$6,325
Net Recoverable Costs	9,831,473	2,191,591	5,498,516	7,614,116	8,950,241	15,511,542	7,655,750	7,901,426	330,085	16,981,316	6,462,013	95,071,166
Carrying Crarges	(830.544)	24,913	37,079	:5,846	191,024	377,790	174,978	358,615	400,136	\$30,971	551, 96 1	1,765,769
Total Including Carrying Coat	9,000,929	2,216,504	5,\$35,597	7,689,592	9,1,14,265	15,553,332	5.130,726	\$,103,665	9,559,203	17,504,798	7,314,504	200,629,935
SBC Over-Recovery Application (c.)	(9.083,785)	(2.401.577)	(5.621.172)	(2.510,262)	(1,523,158)	17,517,2111	<u> </u>	· · · · · ·	<u>.</u>			(29.097.165)
Success	÷						-					71,742,770
Ending under-recovered def RAC datances											1309,995	1309.990
Recoverable Balance at December 31, 2015												73.052.760

⁽a) Nation insurance proceeds, revenue previously collected through base rates and white-off in accordance with 2PU Order, Docket No. ER03121020, (b) The Company maintains that is a entired to retain NRD-related costs totaling approximately 375,000 from 2003-2004.

(c) The application of other over-recovered SEC components, in accordance with ICPEL Tariff Rider SEC, is first application to the deferred carrying cost and next application deferred carry.

The annual amount of \$8,623,994 was proposed to be amortized over a period of seven years, in accordance with the Board Order dated December 16, 1994 in Docket No. ER91121820J, resulting in an annual net recovery amount of \$10,436,109, representing 1/7 of each of the RAC expenditures in the years for each applicable seven-year amortization period, plus the amortization of the deferred RAC expenditures at December 31, 2014. After applying the forecasted retail sales volume of 20,208,847 MWh for the twelve months ending December 31, 2017, the resulting calculated RAC factor is \$0.000516 per kWh (not including SUT), which would be an increase of \$0.000080 per kWh (before SUT) to the current RAC factor of \$0.000436 per kWh (not including SUT), and an increase in annual RAC revenue of approximately \$1.617 million.

Public hearings on the 2015 RAC Filing were duly noticed and thereafter held on September 18, 2017 in Morristown, New Jersey and in Freehold, New Jersey. No members of the public attended.

Following the filing of the 2015 RAC Filing, the Parties engaged in discovery and exchanged additional information during informal discussions and meetings. Based thereon, the Parties have determined to resolve the 2015 RAC Filing in accordance with the terms set forth below.

Stipulation

- 1. The Company's Rider RAC will be increased by \$0.000080 per kWh (not including SUT) to \$0.000516 per kWh (not including SUT).
- 2. The impact of this increase on a residential customer taking service under rate classification RS and having an average monthly usage of 500 kWh would be a change in the monthly bill from \$68.33 to \$68.37, an increase of \$0.04 per month, or 0.06%.

- 3. The Company represents that no remediation properties were sold during the RAC remediation period for which the current RAC rate is being established. The Company also represents that any revenues it received from the lease of any remediation properties during the 2015 RAC period were credited to the deferred RAC balance.
- 4. The Parties agree that the Company's ending recoverable deferred RAC balance at December 31, 2015 was an under-recovered balance of \$73,052,760, subject to the Parties' reservation of their rights to challenge the recovery of expenditures that might be found to have been recorded in error or improperly accounted for in the pending Board Staff audit of RAC expenditures for 2005. In addition to the deferred RAC net balance at December 31, 2015 of \$73,052,760 referred to above, JCP&L has deferred (i) \$749,686 of costs related to NRD issues from 2005 through 2015, and (ii) \$156,325 of incentive compensation paid to personnel who worked on RAC matters from 2006 through 2015. The Parties agree that it is appropriate for such NRD-related and incentive compensation costs to be deferred. The Company represents that this Stipulation does not include the recovery of any administrative, legal, consulting or other costs associated with NRD claims currently being investigated by the New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection or any costs associated with the incentive compensation referenced above. The Parties accordingly stipulate and agree that the Board should make no determination in this proceeding as to the reasonableness, or the recoverability under the Company's RAC filings, of NRD damages or related costs or of incentive compensation amounts, if any.
- 5. The Parties agree that NRD-related MGP expenditures of \$98,616 incurred during the 2015 RAC period are not included in the \$73,052,760 recoverable deferred RAC balance as of December 31, 2015. The Parties agree that the incentive compensation of \$13,248 incurred during the 2015 RAC period is not included in the \$73,052,760 recoverable deferred RAC

balance as of December 31, 2015. The deferred NRD and incentive compensation amounts have been excluded from the RAC factors set forth in herein above. The Parties expressly reserve their rights to argue their respective positions on these issues in future proceedings, as appropriate.

6. The Company claims that it is entitled to retain NRD-related costs totaling approximately \$76,000 from two previous RAC years, 2003 and 2004. It is Rate Counsel's and Staff's position that NRD-related costs are not included within the scope of the Board's RAC recovery authorization and therefore are not eligible for recovery through utility RAC clauses. JCP&L does not agree with Rate Counsel's and Staff's position concerning NRD-related cost recovery, but nonetheless agrees that nothing shall affect or limit the Parties' rights to challenge such NRD-related cost recovery in connection with the Company's previous RAC Filings. JCP&L also reserves all of its rights to contest any such challenge by the Parties. JCP&L further agrees that it will continue to defer NRD-related MGP costs in future RAC filings pending the final Board resolution of the issue concerning the inclusion of NRD-related costs within the scope of the Board's RAC recovery authorization.¹ The Parties hereby agree that JCP&L shall be authorized to continue to defer all additional reasonable and prudent MGP remediation costs and expenses incurred and deferred subsequent to December 31, 2015, including NRD-related and incentive compensation costs, together with accrued interest thereon, for review and inclusion in future annual RAC filings and related adjustments to the Company's Rider RAC, subject to the Board's review and approval. In accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting

 1 The NRD-related MGP expenditures for the years 2005 through 2015 are as follows (\$):

2005	62,856				
2006	157,594	2009	89,580	2012	83,412
2007	53,434	2010	53,563	2013	5,116
2008	18,046	2011	33,404	2014	94,065
2015	98.616				

Principles ("GAAP") as applied by JCP&L's independent auditors, the deferred RAC balance at December 31, 2015 included certain RAC expense accruals. Although the Parties will continue to review the levels of such accruals in the Company's deferred RAC accounts in future proceedings, the Parties do not object to the use of such GAAP accrual accounting procedures as required by the Company's auditors.

- 7. Consistent with its agreement in the 2005 RAC Filing Stipulation settling the 2005 Annual RAC Filing, which was approved by the Board by Decision and Order dated April 27, 2009 (Docket No. ER06030258), the Company performs outside legal and community relations activities for the purposes of supporting its remediation program and mitigating potential liabilities related to its remediation program. The Company agrees to continue to provide a description and explanation of the expenses incurred for these services in subsequent RAC filings, with claimed confidential information provided pursuant to a confidentiality agreement.
- 8. Also, consistent with the 2005 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company agrees to continue to maintain a complaint log for each MGP site that will provide details about complaints (exclusive of formal legal claims or lawsuits) received from property owners, neighboring residents and municipal officials and a description of the Company's actions responding to that complaint.
- 9. The Company agrees that it will continue to include with its RAC filings responses to the minimum filing requirements ("MFRs") as set forth in Exhibit A to the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation settling the 2006-2008 RAC Filing, which was approved by Board Decision and Order dated March 9, 2011 (Docket No. ER09030194). A list of these MFRs is attached hereto as Appendix B.

- 10. Consistent with the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company will competitively bid remediation projects expecting to cost in excess of \$250,000 with respect to work at existing sites or work at any new sites identified in the future. If competitive bidding is not utilized as provided in this Paragraph 10, the Company will be required to show that competitive bidding was not practical or advantageous under the circumstances.
- 11. Also, consistent with the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company will make annual RAC filings, which will not be combined with SBC or SCC filings, regardless of whether it is seeking any change in its RAC recovery rate.
- 12. Also, consistent with the 2006-2008 RAC Filing Stipulation, the Company agrees to provide a final reconciliation of its annual RAC factor recovery within ninety (90) days of the completion of each RAC recovery year, which reconciliation will include the calculation of actual sales volumes that recovered the RAC factor and the resultant net expense or credit amount which is to be carried over to the next recovery year. Implementation and/or adjustment of the RAC factor is subject to the Parties' review of JCP&L's RAC expenditures and reconciliation thereof in JCP&L's future RAC and/or SBC proceedings.
- 13. The Parties agree that the terms of this Stipulation shall be deemed to resolve all factual and legal issues relating to the determination of all amounts that were or could have been included in the calculation of JCP&L's deferred RAC balance through and at December 31, 2015, except as described in paragraphs 4, 5, and 6 above with respect to NRD-related costs and incentive compensation costs.
- 14. JCP&L agrees to file its next annual RAC Filing for the period January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2016 no later than December 1, 2017.

Conclusion

- 15. The Parties agree that this Stipulation contains mutual balancing and interdependent clauses and is intended to be accepted and approved in its entirety. In the event any particular provision of this Stipulation is not accepted and approved in its entirety by the Board, or is modified by a court of competent jurisdiction, then any Party aggrieved thereby shall not be bound to proceed with this Stipulation and shall have the right, upon written notice to be provided to all other Parties within ten (10) days after receipt of any such adverse decision, to litigate all issues addressed herein to a conclusion. More particularly, in the event this Stipulation is not adopted in its entirety by the Board in an appropriate Order, or is modified by a court of competent jurisdiction, then any Party hereto is free, upon the timely provision of such written notice, to pursue its then available legal remedies with respect to all issues addressed in this Stipulation, as though this Stipulation had not been signed.
- 16. The Parties agree that this Stipulation shall be binding on them for all purposes herein.
- 17. It is specifically understood and agreed that this Stipulation represents a negotiated agreement and, except as otherwise expressly provided for herein:
 - a. By executing this Stipulation, no Party waives any rights it possesses under any prior Stipulation, except where the terms of this Stipulation supersede such prior Stipulation.
 - b. The contents of this Stipulation shall not in any way be considered, cited or used by any of the undersigned Parties as an indication of any Party's position on any related or other issue litigated in any other proceeding or forum, except to enforce the terms of this Stipulation.

18. This Stipulation may be executed in any number of counterparts, each of which shall be considered one and the same agreement, and shall become effective when one or more counterparts have been signed by each of the Parties.

WHEREFORE, the Parties hereto have duly executed and do respectfully submit this Stipulation to the Board, and recommend that the Board issue a Final Decision and Order adopting and approving this Stipulation in its entirety in accordance with the terms hereof. The Parties further acknowledge that a Board Order approving this Stipulation will become effective upon the service of said Board Order, or upon such date after the service thereof as the Board may specify, in accordance with N.J.S.A. 48:2-40.

Jersey Central Power & Light Company	Christopher S. Porrino
	Attorney General of New Jersey
	Attorney for
By: VON YOUL	Staff of the Board of Public Utilities
Gregory Eisenstark, Esq.	
Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP	By:
	Alex Moreau
Dated: 10-5-2017	Deputy Attorney General
ŧ	Dated: 10-5-2017-
•	
Stefanie A. Brand, Esq.	
Director, Division of Rate Counsel	
	•
N-M	
$ _{\mathrm{By}}$	
Henry M. Ogden, Esq.	
Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel	
111 6212	
Dated: October 6 201't	

JERSEY CENTRAL POWER & LIGHT COMPANY Derivation of Manufactured Gas Plant (MGP) Remediation Adjustment Charge (RAC) For Tariff Rider Effective January 1, 2017

Line No. 12/31/2014 Year 2015 12/31/2015 Data Sources	_	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Through		Total as of	
MGP Remediation Costs Total MGP remediation costs incurred (a) \$ 50,168,335	Line		Through 12/31/2014	Year 2015	Total as of	
MGP Remediation Costs Total MGP remediation costs incurred (a) \$ 50,166,335 Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued (150,822) Feating (29,997,165) Lies Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 433,073 Feating (197,197,197) Total MGP costs approved for recovery \$ 20,379,454 Total MGP costs approved for recovery \$ 20,379,454 ER12000738 (print) (197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197) Total MGP costs approved for recovery \$ 20,379,454 ER12000738 (print) (197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197,197,197) Feating (197,197,197,197,197,197,197,197,197,197,						Data Sources
Total MGP remediation costs incurred (a) \$ 50,168,235 Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accured (150,882) (29,997,165) Line Na. 1 brough 3 Postnote (b) Postnote (c) Pos	_	MGP Remediation Costs	1.7	(2)	(0)	
2 Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued (150,92) (29,937)165 Fontnoie (b) Line Nos. 1 through 3 Application of over-recovered SBC (29,037)165 Line Nos. 1 through 3 Fontnoie (b) Line Nos. 1 through 3 Fontnoie (c) Exercise Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs (103,751 Extraction of Compensation Program (ICP) Costs (103,751 Extraction of Compensation Program (ICP) Costs (103,751 Extraction of Costs and Costs incurred S. 7,004 Extraction of Costs and Costs incurred S. 7,004 Extraction of Costs and Costs incurred S. 7,004 Extraction of Costs and Costs incurred Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 474,978 Extraction of Costs and Costs an	1		\$ 50.166.335			
3 Application of over-recovered SBC	2	Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued				
1 Total net MGP costs at 123/1/10 after SBC applications \$0.918.276	3	Application of over-recovered SBC				Fontnote (h)
Sees: Noturial Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 435,073 Footnote (c)	4	Total net MGP costs at 12/31/10 after SBC applications				1 ''
East: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 103.751 February (ICP) Costs	5	Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses	435.073			
Total MGP costs approved for recovery \$20,379,454 ER10300114 (27)217.0	6	Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs				1 ''
Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 474,978 5,775,006 12,121,2014, 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 1	7	Total MGP costs approved for recovery				ER10020130 (6/15/11) &
Garrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 474,978	8	Total MGP remediation costs incurred	\$ 7,700,028			ER12080751 (11/21/2014)
10 Total net MGP costs at 12/31/11 S 8,175,006 Line Nos. 8 + 9	9	Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued	474,978			
Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 33,404 Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 5,81,30,728	10	Total net MGP costs at 12/31/11	\$ 8,175,006			
Total MGP costs approved for recovery \$8,130,728 ER12080751 (11/21/2014)	11	Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses	33,404			į.
Total MGP remediation costs incurred (Year 2012 through Year 2014) \$ 34,539,907 1,589,722 ER15040499 Total unrecovered MGP costs at 12/31/14 36,129,629 Une Nos. 14 + 15 Total unrecovered MGP costs at 12/31/14 36,129,629 Une Nos. 14 + 15 Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 28,452 Footnote (c) Total MGP costs submitted for recovery \$ 35,918,584 ER15040499 (07/29/2016) Total MGP remediation costs incurred \$ 6,573,907 Attachment B-1 Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 851,981 Attachment B-1 Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 5 7,425,868 Une Nos. 20 + 21 Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 98,616 Footnote (c) Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 13,248 Footnote (c) Total MGP costs submitted for recovery \$ 5,7314,004 Une Nos. 22 less 23 & 24 Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$ 64,428,766 \$ 7,314,004 \$ 71,742,770 Une s2 Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$ 64,428,766 \$ 7,314,004 \$ 71,742,770 Une s2 Derivation of Tariff Rider RAC: \$ 64,428,766 \$ 7,314,004 \$ 71,742,770 Une s2 Total recoverable MGP remediation costs inclunder-recovery \$ 64,428,766 \$ 8,623,994 \$ 73,052,760 Une Nos. 27 + 28 Control of the second deferred RAC balances \$ 9,204,110 \$ 1,231,999 \$ 1,436,109 Une Nos. 27 + 28 Control of the second deferred RAC balances \$ 9,204,110 \$ 1,231,999 \$ 1,436,109 Une Nos. 27 + 28 Control of the second deferred RAC factor (5 per kWh) before SUT \$ 0,000436 \$	12	Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs	10,874			Footnote (d)
Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 1,589,722	13	Total MGP costs approved for recovery	\$ 8,130,728			ER12080751 (11/21/2014)
Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 1,589,722	14	Total MGP remediation costs incurred (Year 2012 through Year 2014)	\$ 34,539,907			ER15040499
Total unrecovered MGP costs at 12/31/14 17 Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 182,9629 182,452 183,918,584 182,693 182,6	15					
17 Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 182,593 28,452 Footnote (c)			17			
Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 28,452 \$ 35,918,584 Foctnote (a)						1
Total MGP costs submitted for recovery \$ 35,918,584 ER15040499 (07/29/2016) Total MGP remediation costs incurred						1 ''
Carrying cost on deferred MGP costs accrued 851,961 Attachment G-1 Total unrecovered MGP costs at 12/31/15 \$7,425,868 Line Nos. 20 + 21 Footnote (c) St. Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 13,248 Footnote (d) Line Nos. 22 less 23 & 24						
Total unrecovered MGP costs at 12/31/15 \$7,425,868 Une Nos. 22 + 21	20	Total MGP remediation costs incurred		\$ 6,573,907		Attachment B-1
Less: Natural Resources Damages (NRD) expenses 98,616 13,248 Footnote (c)				851,961		Attachment G-1
Less: Incentive Compensation Program (ICP) Costs 13,248 5 7,314,004 1 Ine Nos. 22 less 23 & 24				\$ 7,425,868		Line Nos. 20 + 21
Total MGP costs submitted for recovery \$ 7,314,004 Line Nos. 22 less 23 & 24				98,616		Footnote (c)
Derivation of Tariff Rider RAC: Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$ 64,428,766 \$ 7,314,004 \$ 71,742,770 Columns (1) through (2)				13,248		Footnote (d)
Derivation of Tariff Rider RAC: 27 Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$64,428,766 \$7,314,004 \$71,742,770 \$1,309,990 \$1,309,9	25	Total MGP costs submitted for recovery		\$ 7,314,004		Line Nos. 22 less 23 & 24
Derivation of Tariff Rider RAC: 27 Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$64,428,766 \$7,314,004 \$71,742,770 Une 32	26	Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses	\$ 64,428,766	\$ 7,314,004	\$ 71,742,770	Columns (1) through (2)
Total recoverable MGP remediation expenses \$64,428,766 \$7,314,004 \$71,742,770 Une 32						
Ending under-recovered deferred RAC balances 0 1,309,990 1						
29 Tot.recoverable MGP remediation costs incl.under-recovery RAC recovery period (years) Net annual recoverable MGP expenses 20 Retail sales forecasted (Mwh) 21 Calculated RAC factor (\$ per kWh) 22 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) 23 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT 24 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) before SUT 25 Retail sales forecasted (Mwh) 26 Retail sales forecasted (Mwh) 27 S 9,204,110 28 Retail sales forecasted (Mwh) 29 (20,208,947) 20,000516 20,			\$ 64,428,766	\$ 7,314,004	\$ 71,742,770	Line 32
RAC recovery period (years) 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7						Attachment A-2 (14)
Net annual recoverable MGP expenses \$ 9,204,110 \$ 1,231,999 \$ 10,436,109 Une 29 divided by Une 30			\$ 64,428,766	\$ 8,623,994		
32 Retail sales forecasted (Mwh) 20,208,947 12 mos. Ended 12/31/17 33 Calculated RAC factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT \$ 0,000436 Line 31 divided by Line 32 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) before SUT \$ 0,000436 Rider RAC effective 8/8/16 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT \$ 0,000080 Line 33 - Line 34			7			ER91121820J 12/16/94 Order
33 Calculated RAC factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT 34 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) before SUT 35 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT 36 0.000436 Rider RAC effective 8/8/16 37 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT	31	Net annual recoverable MGP expenses	\$ 9,204,110	\$ 1,231,999	\$ 10,436,109	Line 29 divided by Line 30
33 Calculated RAC factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT 34 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) before SUT 35 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT 36 0.000436 Rider RAC effective 8/8/16 37 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT	32	Retail sales forecasted (Mwh)			20,208,947	12 mos, Ended 12/31/17
34 RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh) 35 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT \$ 0.000080 Une 33 - Line 34						
35 Calculated increase/(decrease) in RAC Factor (\$ per kWh) before SUT \$ 0.000080 Une 33 - Line 34	34	RAC factor currently in effect (\$ per kWh)				
36 Proposed Rider RAC revenue increase effective 12/1/16 \$ 1,617,000 Line 32 x Line 35						
	36	Proposed Rider RAC revenue increase effective 12/1/16			\$ 1,617,000	Line 32 x Line 35

JERSEY CENTRAL POWER & LIGHT COMPANY Derivation of Manufactured Gas Plant (MGP) Remediation Adjustment Charge (RAC) For Tariff Rider Effective January 1, 2017

FOOTNOTES:

- (a) Total cost incurred is net of:

 Write-off in accordance with RAC Stipulation and BPU Order ER03121020 (\$2,500,000);
 Insurance proceeds received (\$36,100,000);
 MGP revenue previously collected through base rates (\$16,877,403).

(b) Application of over-recovered SBC components at year-end in accor	dance wi	h T	ariff Rider SBC:		
			Annual	_ C	umulative
	2004	\$	(6,424,026)		
	2005		(2,639,759)		
	2006		(2,401,577)		
	2007		(5,621,172)		
	2008		(2,640,262)		
	2009		(1,523,158)		
	2010		(7,847,211)	\$ (29,097,165)
	2011		-		29,097,165)
	2012		•	Ġ	29,097,165)
	2013		-	(2	29,097,165)
	2014		-	(2	29,097,165)
	2015		-	(2	29,097,165)
(c) NRD Expenses incurred by year:			Annual	C	umulative
	2005	\$	62,856		
	2006		157,594		
	2007		53,434		
	2008		18,046		
	2009		89,580		
	2010		53,563	\$	435,073
	2011		33,404		468,477
	2012		83,412		551,889
	2013		5,116		557,005
	2014		94,065		651,070
	2015		98,616		749,686
(d) ICP Costs by year:			Annual	Cı	umulative
	2006	\$	27,479		
	2007		32,141		
	2008		30,346		
	2009		-		
	2010		13,785	\$	103,751
6	2011		10,874		114,625
9	2012		11,328		125,953
	2013		10,259		136,212
	2014		6,865		143,077
	2015		13,248		156,325

Jersey Central Power & Light Company RAC Minimum Filing Requirements

As part of the Company's annual RAC filing, the Company will provide responses to the following Minimum Filing Requirements ("MFRs"). The requests, unless noted otherwise, relate to the historical 12-month RAC period. The data shall be provided by February 15 of the calendar year following the historical 12-month RAC period.

- 1. The Company currently provides a vendor summary as Attachment D with its annual filing. This Attachment provides a summary of the expenditures incurred by vendor by site for the twelve-month RAC period. Hereafter, the Attachment will be supplemented with a general description of the services provided by each vendor. The data noting expenditures incurred through November are submitted to the Parties by December 31 of the filing period. The data are updated with the expenditures incurred through December and submitted to the Parties by January 31 of the year following the filing period.
- 2. Identify the three MGP sites with the highest level of expenditures during the prior RAC period. For each identified site, provide a copy of the latest work plan, remediation report, or major work product submitted to the NJDEP. The copies should include the narrative portion of the report or work plan but need not include the technical supporting workpapers, charts and tables.
- 3. For each of the same three MGP sites, provide all correspondence between the Company and the NJDEP concerning submissions for the site, reply comments, and other major items which have a material impact on remediation activities and associated costs incurred by the Company. The correspondence should span the twelve-months preceding December 31st of the most recent RAC period.
- 4. For each of the same three MGP sites, provide expense documentation for any contractor or supplier whose invoices for the RAC period exceed \$250,000 in aggregate. The expense documentation should include descriptions of services rendered, applicable invoices, and any tracking of invoiced charges vs. budgets. The expense detail need not include expense reports or time sheets, but it should include supporting documentation for any subcontractor and third party expenses totaling \$100,000 or more for the period.
- 5. For each of the same three MGP sites, provide a narrative description and organization chart for that site, showing the vendors and project control structure for the remediation effort. The response should show what entities supervise all significant contractors and subcontractors and which Company personnel are involved in site and remediation supervision and control.
- 6. Provide a detailed narrative describing Company activities and any reimbursements related to insurance claims or potentially responsible parties' liabilities for all of the Company's MGP sites. The narrative, with supporting documentation, should cover the prior RAC period. In addition, the Company will provide a listing of all insurance reimbursements received from each insurance company through the end of the year covered by the filing,

but need not disclose any insurance company's identity.

- 7. Provide copies of any RAC audit reports or related materials prepared by the Board's Audit Staff, FERC, or the Company's internal or external auditors during the previous twelve months. To the degree applicable, please also provide any materials prepared in response to the audits or in compliance with any audit findings.
- 8. Provide a narrative concerning all material events, whether related to NJDEP mandates or not, which could have an impact on the Company's ultimate MGP remediation liability, with claimed confidential information provided pursuant to a confidentiality agreement. The narrative should encompass all sites, whether or not active remediation efforts on the site are under way.
- 9. Provide schedules and supporting workpapers and documents, which show the reconciliation of the prior period RAC expenditures and recoveries as well as the derivation of the deferred tax credit and the interest accrual on any unamortized balances.
- 10. Provide the Company's bid evaluation studies, reports, workpapers or other material related to the two largest MGP remediation contracts awarded during the previous RAC period. The response should include the criteria utilized for bid evaluation and the comparisons between the terms and conditions offered by the competitive bidders.
- 11. Provide documentation relating to the two largest supplemental contract amendments authorized by the Company during the previous RAC period. The response should provide the contractor's request for supplemental funding, the reasons cited for the request, and the Company's evaluation and action taken concerning the request.
- 12. Provide documentation relating to any instances during the previous RAC period where the Company sought to modify, change, or eliminate the NJDEP site remediation requirements for any of its MGP sites. The response should provide copies of any such Company requests, the NJDEP responses, and the ultimate outcome concerning the requests.
- 13. Provide a calculation of the carrying costs that the Company seeks to recover in this filing, including workpapers and supporting documentation.
- 14. The Company currently provides a schedule that summarizes the expenditures incurred by major cost category by site on a quarterly basis. These data are, and will continue to be, reported as Attachment C with its annual filing.
- 15. For each of the Company's MGP sites, provide a schedule showing the status of the remediation effort and estimated dates for the completion of remaining milestones, along with a discussion of major remediation problems. The Parties understand that the timeframes to complete the remediation efforts are subject to a great deal of uncertainty due to factors beyond the Company's control.

Appendix B

- 16. Provide an update concerning the status of discussions with the NJDEP concerning its NRD initiative as well as any other NRD-related activities, with claimed confidential information provided pursuant to a confidentiality agreement. Such update will include information about NRD-related expenditures during the prior RAC period and related documentation, as well as total NRD-related expenses deferred to date.
- 17. Provide information about unreasonable delays in remediation efforts caused by the inability to obtain requisite approvals, clearances or other rights from the NJDEP, local authorities or property owners, or other circumstances that are unduly impeding remediation efforts. The Company will address issues that are outside of the ordinary experience for these matters.