B-19



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Christine Emerson, Department of Environmental Protection

CSC Docket No. 2015-2628

Classification Appeal

ISSUED: MAY 2 0 2015 (LDH)

Christine Emerson appeals the attached decision of the Division of Agency Services (DAS) that determined the proper classification of her position with the Department of Environmental Protection is Senior Clerk Typist. Emerson seeks a Principal Clerk Typist classification.

The record in the present matter establishes that Emerson is currently serving in the permanent title of Senior Clerk Typist. Emerson's position is located in the Water Resource Management, Division of Water Quality, Water Pollution Management Element, Bureau of Pretreatment and Residuals, Department of Environmental Protection. Emerson pursued the matter of her classification with DAS. DAS reviewed all documentation supplied by Emerson and performed an audit of her position. DAS found that the duties and responsibilities of Emerson's position entailed: receiving, reviewing, date stamping and routing all incoming correspondence for the Bureau; proofreading and processing all outgoing regular and certified mailings; answering and routing all incoming phone calls to the Bureau; making an inventory and ordering office supplies for the entire Water Pollution Management Element comprised of three separate Bureaus; receiving, logging and processing permit application fees; typing and proofreading word processing assignments; operating and maintaining the Bureau's copiers, scanners, printers and faxes; scheduling meetings and reserving the appropriate locations for the meetings; assisting in coordinating and scheduling trainings and travel arrangements for the Bureau; coordinating an area for Bureau mass mailings; and

preparing referrals, correspondence and personnel documents. DAS noted that the main distinction between the titles of Senior Clerk Typist and Principal Clerk Typist was the level of difficulty associated with the typing and clerical responsibilities. Additionally, it noted that since the Principal Clerk Typist title was assigned to the "R" bargaining unit, it was considered a primary or first-level supervisory title. DAS found that Emerson had no supervisory responsibilities. Based on a review of Emerson's duties, DAS determined that the duties performed by Emerson were consistent with the definition and examples of work included in the job specification for Senior Clerk Typist.

On appeal to the Civil Service Commission (Commission), Emerson argues that the title of Principal Clerk Typist is a more appropriate title for the duties she performs. She contends that DAS did not accurately reflect the duties and responsibilities of her position. Specifically, she points to her duty of processing checks received which she asserts requires knowledge of chain of custody procedures to ensure checks are secure and forwarded to the Department of the Treasury. In addition, she argues that she is performing high level typing and clerical responsibilities. Specifically, she is a file officer for OPRA and her daily work with the statewide computer databases like NJEMS and MASTERFILE. Lastly, she argues that her lack of supervision should not be a factor in her classification appeal as the job description does not require the supervision of a clerical unit.

CONCLUSION

The definition section of the job specification for Senior Clerk Typist states:

Under supervision, preforms typing and other related clerical work requiring exercise of independent judgment and working knowledge of department rules, regulations, and policies, and/or has charge of the work of a small group of clerk typists, and/or has charge of the designated phase of the typing work of the department; does other related duties as required.

The definition section of the job specification for Principal Clerk Typist states:

Under direction of a supervisory official, does clerical work including typing of a complex and/or technical nature requiring knowledge of department laws, regulations, policies, and procedures as well as the frequent exercise of independent judgment, and/or has charge of the work of clerical unit; does related work as required.

A review of the record reveals that Emerson's position is properly classified by the title of Senior Clerk Typist. The main distinction between the Senior Clerk Typist and the Principal Clerk Typist is the level of difficulty associated with the typing and clerical responsibilities. Incumbents in the title of Senior Clerk Typist type documents in final form without a rough draft. A Senior Clerk Typist assumes responsibility for the propriety of the forms and the arrangement of the final copy and uses independent judgment as to the form, arrangement, spacing, etc., based on the subject matter. Incumbents in this title organize assigned clerical, typing, and other related work and develop effective work methods. A Senior Clerk Typist reviews, checks and certifies reports, applications and other documents for correctness. An incumbent in this title receives and checks applications and fees, and prepares receipts. A Senior Clerk Typist oversees the operation and care of office machines and equipment. Lastly, an incumbent in this title answers non-routine inquires for information within and without the agency.

Emerson's duties and responsibilities are more consistent with the title of Senior Clerk Typist. Emerson performs duties that are routine and require little to no exercise of independent judgment. In addition, Emerson's duties are not of a technical nature that would require knowledge of department laws, regulations, policies and procedures. She does not make any judgments on the execution of her assignments nor does she perform complex typing duties. In this regard, Emerson's job duties entail, in part, typing and signing letters to return checks to the applicant on deficient applications when instructed; reviewing and proofreading all outgoing correspondence originating in the Bureau; and answering calls received by the Bureau.

However, the Commission finds it necessary to make one last comment with regard to the DAS's statement that an incumbent in the title of Principal Clerk Typist must supervise. The Commission does not agree. In this regard, this agency recognizes that job specifications necessarily must permit incumbents at certain levels in a title series the opportunity to perform either the highest level of technical duties associated with the title series or perform supervisory duties. If this were not permitted, employees with requisite technical experience in a particular field could never gain supervisory experience or be groomed for supervisory positions. Conversely, it is also recognized that a work unit necessarily requires employees who are technically competent to perform more complex duties, but are not necessarily inclined or skilled to assume supervisory duties. Thus, some titles are "permissive" in regard to supervisory duties, but not every incumbent in the title supervises. For example, in In the Matter of Alexander Borovskis, et al. (MSB, decided July 27, 2005), it was explained that the dual duties track in the Principal Engineer, Transportation title, a primary, or first level supervisory title, is appropriate for this title. Moreover, given that the Project Engineer, Construction is a higher level, or second level, supervisory title, that requires an incumbent to "supervise the work program and staff of a design team in the design unit," it is

necessary to actually supervise staff at the Principal level in order to establish eligibility. In this matter, a review of the job specification for Principal Clerk Typist reveals that an incumbent in that title does clerical work including typing of a complex and/or technical nature requiring knowledge of department laws, regulations, policies, and procedures as well as the frequent exercise of independent judgment, and/or has charge of the work of clerical unit (emphasis added). Therefore, the mere fact that Emerson does not supervise would not be sufficient, in and of itself, to determine that she was not performing the duties of a Principal Clerk Typist. However, as discussed above, a review of her duties reveals that she is properly classified as a Senior Clerk Typist. Accordingly, Emerson has failed to establish that Agency Services' determination, that she was properly classified as a Senior Clerk Typist, was incorrect.

ORDER

Therefore, the Civil Service Commission concludes that the proper classification of Christine Emerson's position is Senior Clerk Typist.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON

THE 20th DAY OF MAY, 2015

Robert M. Czech Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and

Correspondence

Henry Maurer Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P.O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

c: Christine Emerson Deni Gaskill Kenneth Connolly Joseph Gambino



CHRIS CHRISTIE
Governor
KIM GUADAGNO
Lt. Governor

STATE OF NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION Agency Services P. O. Box 313 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0313

ROBERT M. CZECH Chair/Chief Executive Officer

March 4, 2015

Ms. Christine V. Emerson
New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection
Division of Water Quality
Bureau of Pretreatment and Residuals
PO Box 420 Mail Code 401-02B
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0420

Re: Classification Appeal Senior Clerk Typist Position #085009 CPM #10140187 Employee ID #000332862

Dear Ms. Emerson:

This is to inform you, and the Department of Environmental Protection, of our determination concerning the classification appeal referenced above. Our review involved a detailed analysis of the Position Classification Questionnaire (DPF-44S); organization chart; your Performance Assessment Review (PAR); your statements; the statements of your supervisor, division director, and appointing authority; and a desk audit that was conducted January 13, 2015.

Issue:

You are appealing the current classification of your position, Senior Clerk Typist. You contend that your current duties and responsibilities are consistent with those of a Principal Clerk Typist.

Organization:

The position is located in Water Resource Management, Division of Water Quality, Water Pollution Management Element, Bureau of Pretreatment and Residuals, Department of Environmental Protection. You are supervised by Anthony Pilawski, Environmental Specialist 4 (S28), and you have no supervisory responsibility.

Date: March 4, 2015

Findings of Fact:

The position performs the following duties and responsibilities:

Receives, reviews, date stamps, and routes all incoming correspondence for the Bureau.

- Proofreads and processes all outgoing regular and certified mailings.
- Answers and routes all incoming phone calls to the Bureau.
- Inventories and orders office supplies for the entire Water Pollution Management Element comprised of three (3) separate Bureaus.
- Receives, logs, and processes permit application fees.
- Types and proofreads word processing assignments.
- Operates and maintains the Bureau's copiers/scanners/printers/faxes.
- Schedules meetings and reserves the appropriate location for Bureau staff.
- Assists in coordinating and scheduling training and travel arrangements for the Bureau
- Coordinates and obtains supplies and an area for Bureau mass mailings.
- Prepares referrals, correspondence, and personnel documents.

Review and Analysis:

The duties and responsibilities of the position were compared to those described within the class specification for Senior Clerk Typist and Principal Clerk Typist.

The definition section of the class specification for your current title, Senior Clerk Typist (A08, 23233), states:

> "Under supervision, performs typing and other related clerical work requiring exercise of independent judgment and working knowledge of department rules, regulations, and policies, and/or

Date: March 4, 2015

has charge of the work of a small group of clerk typists, and/or has charge of the designated phase of the typing work of the department; does other related duties as required."

A Senior Clerk Typist exercises independent judgment in performing typing and general clerical duties as assigned. Incumbents in this title type documents in final form without rough draft. A Senior Clerk Typist assumes responsibility for the propriety of the forms and the arrangement of the final copy and uses independent judgment as to the form, arrangement, spacing, etc. based on the subject matter. Incumbents in this title organize assigned clerical, typing, and other related work and develop effective work methods. A Senior Clerk Typist reviews, checks, and certifies reports, applications, and other documents for correctness. Incumbents in this title receive and check applications and fees, and prepare receipts. A Senior Clerk Typist oversees the operation and care of office machines and equipment. An incumbent in this title answers non-routine inquiries for information within and without the agency.

The definition section of the specification for the title, Principal Clerk Typist (R12, 223234), states:

> "Under direction of a supervisory official, does clerical work including typing of a complex and/or technical nature requiring knowledge of department laws, regulations, policies, and procedures as well as the frequent exercise of independent judgment, and/or has charge of the work of a clerical unit; does related work as required."

A Principal Clerk Typist is expected to perform complex, technical clerical work including typing and to review reports, applications, and other documents for correctness where difficult determinations are concerned.

The main distinction between the Senior Clerk Typist and the Principal Clerk Typist is the level of difficulty associated with the typing and clerical responsibilities. Additionally, the Principal Clerk Typist is assigned to the "R" bargaining unit and as such is considered the primary or first-level of supervision. A supervisor must complete performance evaluations of subordinate staff.

Date: March 4, 2015

Your position sorts and date stamps all incoming correspondence for the Bureau. Your position coordinates Bureau mailings associated with the Discharge Monitoring Reports. Your position prepares special requests for printed material to support the Discharge Monitoring Reports mailings. Your position processes check payments accompanying permit applications and renewals including logging the payment with the Program Interest Number, copying the check to accompany the application, and securing the check in the safe until forwarding to the Department of Treasury for deposit. Your position types and signs letters to return checks to the applicant on deficient applications when instructed. Your position answers calls received by the Bureau, determining the appropriate concern of the caller and where to direct the call. Your position orders supplies for the entire Element comprised of three (3) separate Bureaus. Your position schedules meetings and locations for the staff as required. Your positon reviews requests for travel for completeness and provides the appropriate account number prior to forwarding for further processing. Your position reviews and proofreads all outgoing correspondence originating in the Bureau. Your position provides administrative and clerical support for the Bureau comprised of two (2) technical sections and one (1) administrative section. Your position types referrals, correspondence, and personnel documents as required. Your position types word processing assignments as provided by the staff.

A Principal Clerk Typist is considered a first-level supervisor and is expected to directly supervise subordinate staff. Your positon has no supervisory responsibilities. Therefore the Principal Clerk Typist is an inappropriate classification for the position.

Determination:

By copy of this letter, the Appointing Authority is advised that your position is properly classified as Senior Clerk Typist (A08, 23233).

The class specification for Senior Clerk Typist is descriptive of the general nature and scope of the functions that may be performed by an incumbent in this position. However, the examples of work are for illustrative purposes and are not intended to restrict or limit performance of related tasks not specifically listed.

Please be advised that in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:3-3.9, you may appeal this decision within twenty (20) days of receipt of this letter. The appeal should be addressed to the Written Records Appeals Unit, Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs, P.O. Box 312, Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312. Please note that the submission of an appeal must include a copy of the determination being appealed as

Date: March 4, 2015

well as written documentation and/or argument substantiating the portions of the determination being disputed and the basis for the appeal.

Sincerely,

Human Resource Consultant 5

Agency Services

MTB/rej C: Robin Liebeskind

Veronica Kirkham CPM #10140187