



In the Matter of Hector Ortiz, Assistant Director of Public Works (PM0004T), Jersey City

CSC Docket No. 2015-3151

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

**Examination Appeal** 

ISSUED: **JUL** 1 7 2015 (CSM)

Hector Ortiz appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that, per the substitution clause, he was below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Assistant Director of Public Works (PM0004T), Jersey City.

:

:

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the closing date of January 21, 2015 (see attached). The subject examination was cancelled on June 8, 2015 since the two applicants were deemed ineligible.

The appellant indicated on his application that he was provisionally serving in the title under test from February 2014 to the closing date, January 2015. From June 1994 to February 2014 he was a Director of Motorized Equipment and from November 1988 to June 1994 he was a Mechanic. The appellant does not possess a Bachelor's degree. Agency Services credited the appellant with one year of general and one year of management experience based on his provisional service in the title under test but determined that the remainder of his experience was not applicable. Therefore, he would need an additional eight years of general and two years of management experience to qualify for the examination.

On appeal, the appellant explains that the appointing authority's Department of Public Works consists of the Automotive, Building and Streets and Parks and Forestry divisions along with one community center. In fact, he states that the Automotive Division has been part of the Department of Public Works for more than 50 years. The appellant highlights his extensive management

experience as a Director of Motorized Equipment since 1994 until his provisional appointment to the subject title and states that he served as the Acting Assistant Director of Public Works from 2003 to 2006. Mark Redfield, Director, Department of Public Works, verifies that the Automotive Division has been part of the department for more than 50 years. Additionally, he confirms that the appellant served in an acting capacity in the title under test due to business necessity from 2003 to 2006 and again in 2013.

## CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date.

Initially, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellant was not eligible for the subject examination. As of the closing date, the appellant was credited with one year of general and one year of management experience based on his provisional service in the title under test and would need an additional eight years of general and two years of management experience to qualify for the subject examination. The appellant did not specify on his application that he served in an acting capacity in the title under test from 2003 to 2006 or in 2013. The importance of submitting a properly completed application that includes a listing of all duties is essential since a complete application provides the only reliable barometer by which this agency can make the initial determination whether to admit or reject an applicant as no other tool is available to rely on in order to make this important initial assessment in an expeditious, fair, and efficient manner. However, in accordance with *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(g), the Civil Service Commission (Commission) can accept clarifying information in eligibility appeals. Information submitted on appeal pertaining to duties in a given position that expands or enlarges information previously submitted is considered clarifying and is accepted. However, any documentation indicating work in a setting that was not previously listed on an application or resume cannot be considered after the closing date. Thus, the Commission can only consider information provided on appeal regarding the positions listed on the appellant's original application.

In this case, the appellant explained and Mr. Redfield confirmed that he performed the required duties in an acting capacity for four years and that the Automotive Division is part of the Department of Public Works. Although the appellant's experience as a Director of Motorized Equipment does not precisely mirror what is required to establish eligibility for the title under test, the Commission is satisfied that the totality of his experience managing a maintenance program warrants his admission to the examination. Additionally, the appellant continues to serve provisionally in the title under test and the examination was cancelled due to a lack of qualified applicants. Accordingly, the Commission accepts

the appellant's clarification of his experience, for eligibility purposes, and admits him to the examination.

# **ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be granted, the examination cancellation be rescinded, and the appellant's application be processed for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE

15<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF JULY, 2015

Robert M. Czech Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence Henry Maurer
Director
Division of Appeals
and Regulatory Affairs
Written Record Appeals Unit
Civil Service Commission
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

### Attachment

c. Hector Ortiz Mark Redfield Kelly Glenn Joseph Gambino NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION COUNTY AND MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES



S25.00 PROCESSING FEE REQUIRED Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

#### PROMOTIONAL ANNOUNCEMENT

SYMBOL: PM0004T

TITLE: ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS

ISSUE DATE: January 01, 2015
TITLE CODE: 07150/ M6RJR8

JURISDICTION: JERSEY CITY DEPARTMENT: PUBLIC WORKS

WEIGHT CODE: \*

SALARY: \$19,800.00 - \$63,930.00

CLOSING DATE: January 21, 2015

JURISDICTION CODE: N09060009

Visit www.state.nj.us/csc And select "Job Announcements" to view this announcement and to file an application

Open to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and meet the requirements listed below:

Education: Graduation from an accredited college or university with a Bachelor's degree. You must indicate either possession of a degree or total number of college credits completed to date on your application. (Foreign degrees/transcripts must be evaluated by a recognized evaluation service.) Failure to do so will result in rejection from the examination process.

Applicants who do not possess the required education may substitute additional experience as indicated on a year for year basis with thirty (30) semester hour credits being equal to one (1) year of experience.

Experience: Five (5) years of experience in the development, administration, and implementation of public works or other similar construction/maintenance programs, three (3) years of which shall have included management responsibilities.

Note: Possession of a Master's degree in Business Administration, Public Administration, Industrial Management, Industrial Engineering, Management Science, or in a program related to the organization, operation, administration, and control of private or public organizations from an accredited college or university may be substituted for one (1) year of the non-supervisory experience. You must indicate the details of your Master's degree on your application. (Foreign degrees/ transcripts must be evaluated by a recognized evaluation service.) Failure to do so will result in rejection from the examination process.

License: Appointees will be required to possess a driver's license valid in New Jersey only if the operation of a vehicle rather than employee mobility, is necessary to perform the essential duties of the position. The responsibility for ensuring that employees possess the required motor vehicle license, commensurate with the class and type of vehicles they operate, rests with the Appointing Authority.

Note: This announcement may be tested via the Management Test Battery (MTB). Under the guidelines of the MTB program, an applicant's score will be retained and applied to subsequent promotional or open competitive announcements for titles tested under this program. For information regarding the Management Test Battery, please refer to our website http://www.state.nj.us/csc/seekers/about/steps/step7.html

#### Corrected 1/12/15

#### IMPORTANT INFORMATION

- 1. NJAC 4A:4-2.6 states that all requirements listed must be met as of the closing date, including assignment to jurisdiction/department, and satisfying the permanent status requirement.
- 2. YOU MUST COMPLETE YOUR APPLICATION IN DETAIL. Your score may be based on a comparison of your credentials with the job requirements. Failure to complete your application properly may lower your score or cause you to fail.
- 3. This examination is open to full-time and part-time permanent employees. If an employment list results from this announcement, it may be certified to fill both full-time and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the department, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.

  4. NJAC 4A:4-1.5 states that any employee who is serving on a provisional basis and who fails to file for and take an examination which has been announced for his/her title SHALL BE SEPARATED FROM THE PROVISIONAL TITLE.
- 5. In accordance with Public Law 2010 c 26, Veterans pay a reduced application fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved by DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. PLEASE NOTE THIS REDUCED FEE DOES NOT APPLY TO PUBLIC SAFETY TITLES. (i.e. Police, Fire, Corrections and Sheriff).
- 6. If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, technical support and customer care are available during regular business hours, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. EST, Monday Friday, excluding holidays and emergency closings. Please Email: OAS.support@esc.state.nj.us or call (609) 292-4144. Please note that application support requests received outside of regular business hours on the closing date will not change the application filing deadline, so PLEASE FILE EARLY.

DPF-256A \* Revised 03/09