

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Joseph Raymond and Raymond Turton, Supervisor of Water Distribution (PM2232T), Fair Lawn

Examination Appeals

CSC Docket Nos. 2016-3296 and : 2016-3457

ISSUED: NOV 1 6 2016 (SLK)

Joseph Raymond and Raymond Turton appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that they were below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Supervisor of Water Distribution (PM2232T), Fair Lawn. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues presented.

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the October 21, 2015 closing date (see attached). The appellants were the only employees that applied for the examination which was cancelled due to a lack of qualified applicants.

On his application, Mr. Raymond indicated that he was provisionally serving as a Senior Water Treatment Plant Operator from August 2015 to the October 21, 2015 closing date, a Senior Maintenance Repairer from May 2013 to July 2015, a Sanitation Driver from October 1998 to April 2013, a Sanitation Worker from June 1992 to September 1998, and a Laborer 1 from February 1991 to May 1992. He also indicated that he possesses a W-2 license. Personnel records indicate that he was provisionally serving as a Senior Water Treatment Plant Operator from August 2015 to the October 21, 2015 closing date, a Senior Maintenance Repairer from May 2013 to August 2015, a Sanitation Driver from March 1998 to May 2013, a Sanitation Worker from May 1992 to March 1998, and a Laborer 1 from February 1991 to May 1992. Agency Services credited him with possessing a W-2 license, but determined that he lacked two years of experience.

On his application, Mr. Turton indicated that he was provisionally serving in the subject title from February 1982 to the October 21, 2015 closing date. He also indicated that he possesses a W-2 license. Personnel records indicate that he was serving provisionally serving in the subject title from August 2015 to the October 21, 2015 closing date, an Assistant Supervisor Public Works from January 2014 to August 2015, a Senior Public Works Repairer from January 1987 to January 2014, and a Public Works Repairer from March 1983 to January 1987. Agency Services credited him with possessing a W-2 license and 1 year and 10 months of experience based on his provisional service in the subject title and as an Assistant Supervisor Public Works, but determined that he lacked 2 months of experience.

On appeal, Mr. Raymond presents that he has been working in the water department for the past four years and possesses several certifications that are relevant to the subject title. While working as a Senior Maintenance Repairer in the water department for three years, he indicates he supervised workers who maintained and repaired water pipes, mains, valves and hydrants, installed water lines and water meters, determined the presence and location of leaks using electronic devices, and worked with contractors to ensure that the proper materials were supplied and to organize the repair and maintenance of water mains. Further, he provides that, over the past two years, he supervised a crew of five employees and outlines how he performs the required duties. Additionally, he submits a letter from Jim Van Kruiningen, Borough Manager, which confirms the appellant's representations.\(^1\)

Mr. Turton indicates that he has been provisionally serving in the subject title since August 2015, he previously served as an Assistant Supervisor Public Works for one year and seven months, and he has been employed by the appointing authority since February 1982 with the majority of his time being spent in the water division. He represents that he supervises eight employees with water distribution tasks and he outlines how he performs the required duties on a daily basis. He submits a letter from Mr. Kruiningen who confirms Mr. Turton's representations and supports his appeal.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional announcement by the closing date. N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(c) provides that, except when permitted for good cause, applicants for promotional examinations with open-competitive requirements may not use experience gained as a result of out-of-title work to satisfy the requirements for admittance to the examination or for credit in the examination process.

¹ This letter was submitted in support of Mr. Raymond's appeal for Senior Water Treatment Plant Operator (PM2208T).

Initially, it is noted that Agency Services correctly determined that the appellants were not eligible for the subject examination. Both appellants were credited with possessing a W-2 license and Mr. Turton was credited with 1 year and 10 months of experience, but Mr. Raymond lacked two years and Mr. Turton lacked two months of the required experience needed to establish eligibility. Any relevant experience that Mr. Raymond gained as a Senior Maintenance Repairer would be out-of-title-work. However, Mr. Van Kruiningen confirmed that Mr. Raymond performed the required out-of-title duties as a Senior Maintenance Repairer from May 2013 to August 2015. Additionally, the examination was cancelled due to a lack of qualified applicants and Mr. Turton continues to serve provisionally in the title under test. Accordingly, good cause exists to accept Mr. Raymond's out-of-title work experience as a Senior Maintenance Repairer and Mr. Turton's provisional experience after the closing date, for eligibility purposes only, and to admit them to the examination.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that these appeals be granted, the cancellation of the examination be rescinded and Joseph Raymond's and Raymond Turton's applications be processed for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 10th DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2016

Robert M. Czech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries

and

Correspondence

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P.O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

c: Joseph Raymond
Raymond Turton
Jim Van Kruiningen
Kelly Glenn
Records Center

NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION COUNTY AND MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES PROMOTIONAL ANNOUNCEMENT



Click here to file Online \$25.00 PROCESSING FEE REQUIRED Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

SYMBOL: PM2232T

TITLE: SUPERVISOR OF WATER DISTRIBUTION

ISSUE DATE: October 01, 2015 TITLE CODE: 04093/ VBRBR2 JURISDICTION: FAIR LAWN DEPARTMENT: PUBLIC WORKS WEIGHT CODE:

SALARY: \$67,519.00 - \$86,228.00

CLOSING DATE: October 21, 2015 JURISDICTION CODE: N02170012

Visit www.state.ni.us/csc And select "Job Announcements" to view this announcement and to file an application

Open to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date and are currently serving in the following title(s):

Assistant Supervisor Water Distribution 00787

Or to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and meet the requirements listed below:

Education: Ability to read, write, speak and understand English sufficiently to perform the duties of this position.

Experience: Two years of supervisory experience in the construction, maintenance, repair and inspection of water distribution facilities.

License: Applicants must possess a W-2 license to operate a public water supply system issued by the New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection.

If you have the required license(s), you must indicate this on your application; proof of the license(s) must be submitted with your application. Failure to do so will result in rejection from the examination process.

IMPORTANT INFORMATION

- 1. NJAC 4A:4-2.6 states that all requirements listed must be met as of the closing date, including assignment to jurisdiction/department, and satisfying the permanent
- 2. ONLY ON-LINE APPLICATIONS WILL BE ACCEPTED. YOU MUST COMPLETE YOUR APPLICATION IN DETAIL. Your score may be based on a
- comparison of your credentials with the job requirements. Failure to complete your application properly may lower your score or cause you to fail.

 3. This examination is open to full-time and part-time permanent employees. If an employment list results from this announcement, it may be certified to fill both fulltime and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the department, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.
- 4. NJAC 4A:4-1.5 states that any employee who is serving on a provisional basis and who fails to file for and take an examination which has been announced for his/her title SHALL BE SEPARATED FROM THE PROVISIONAL TITLE.
- 5. In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced application fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved by DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. PLEASE NOTE THIS REDUCED FEE DOES NOT APPLY TO PUBLIC SAFETY TITLES. (i.e. Police, Fire, Corrections and Sheriff).
- 6. If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, technical support and customer care are available during regular business hours, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. EST, Monday - Friday, excluding holidays and emergency closings. Please Email: OAS.support@csc.state.nj.us or call (609) 292-4144. Please note that application support requests received outside of regular business hours on the closing date will not change the application filing deadline, so PLEASE FILE EARLY.

DPF-256A * Revised 03/09

	•••	