B-39

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Carthaniel Crum, Signal System Superintendent (PM1541U), Plainfield

CSC Docket No. 2017-1770

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: APR 1 1 2017

(RE)

Carthaniel Crum appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services which found that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Signal System Superintendent (PM1541U), Plainfield.

:

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the July 21, 2016 closing date (see attached). As there were no admitted candidates, the examination was cancelled on December 7, 2016.

On his application, Mr. Crum listed three positions: provisional Signal System Superintendent, Signal Technician 2 and Signal Technician 1. The appellant met the general experience requirement and was credited with five months of supervisory experience in the first position. Thus, he was found to be lacking three years, seven months of supervisory experience.

On appeal, Mr. Crum argues that he worked in a supervisory capacity as a Foreman for Joule Maintanence, and that he was self-supervised when he worked for ADK Electric Company. He states that he is a partner in an electric company, and has his own company as well. These positions were not listed on his application. He also argues that he was in an "acting" position as Signal System Superintendent since 2012 (no months given).

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.6(c) provides in pertinent part that applicants for promotional examinations

with open competitive requirements may not use experience gained as a result of out-of-title work to satisfy the requirements for admittance to the examination or for credit in the examination process, unless good cause is shown for an exception. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an application may be amended prior to the announced closing date.

CONCLUSION

In order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). Additionally, supervisory experience includes responsibility for seeing that tasks assigned to subordinates are efficiently accomplished. It involves independent assignment and distribution of work to employees, with oral or written task instructions, and maintenance of the flow and quality of work within a unit in order to assure timely and effective fulfillment of objectives. Supervisors are responsible for making available or obtaining materials, supplies, equipment, and/or plans necessary for particular tasks. Also, they provide on-the-job training to subordinates, when needed, and make employee performance evaluations based on their own judgment. They have authority to recommend hiring, firing, and disciplining of employees. Further, the supervisory experience must have been over subordinates performing the announced experience requirement, in this case, the work involving the repair and maintenance of traffic signals.

The appellant received credit for five months of supervisory experience in his provisional position from March 2016 to the July 2016 closing date. He also indicated that he supervised staff while in the titles Signal Technician 1 and Signal Technician 2. In his description of duties for Signal Technician 2, he indicated that he assumed the duties and responsibilities of the supervisor while he was on vacation. Nonetheless, this is not qualifying experience. First, it is not a supervisory title, and therefore if he supervised while in this title, it is considered out-of-title work and cannot be used to satisfy eligibility requirements. Next, the appellant was not performing all the duties of a supervisor, such as making employee performance evaluations. The appellant provided no supervisory duties for his position as Signal Technician 1. The appointing authority would not support the appellant's claim on appeal that he had been an "acting" Signal System Superintendent since 2012.

Next, on appeal, the appellant states that he was a Foreman for Joule Maintanence, that he was self-supervised when he worked for ADK Electric Company, is a partner in an electric company, and owns a company. Nevertheless, he did not include this information on his application, and on appeal he did not provide any further information, such as the number of hours worked per week, the dates that he was employed, the number of staff he supervised, if any, and the major duties performed. Thus, his experience in these positions cannot be quantified or

qualified. Nevertheless, it does not appear that he was supervising staff who were repairing and maintaining traffic signals.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of the Division of Agency Services that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support his burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 5th DAY OF APRIL, 2017

Robert M. Czech Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and

Correspondence

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission

Written Record Appeals Unit

P.O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Carthaniel Crum Rick Smiley Kelly Glenn Records Center NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION COUNTY AND MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES PROMOTIONAL ANNOUNCEMENT



Click here to file Online Print \$25.00 PROCESSING FEE REQUIRED Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

WEIGHT CODE: *

SALARY: \$73,014.00 - \$105,141.00

CLOSING DATE: July 21, 2016

JURISDICTION CODE: N20120003

SYMBOL: PM1541U

TITLE: SIGNAL SYSTEM SUPERINTENDENT

ISSUE DATE: July 01, 2016 TITLE CODE: 03715@/ GCRVR2

JURISDICTION: PLAINFIELD

DEPARTMENT: PUBLIC AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC SAFETY

Visit www.state.ni.us/csc And select "Job Announcements" to view this announcement and to file an application

Open to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and meet the requirements listed below:

Education: Possession of a high school diploma or a G.E.D.

Experience: Eight (8) years of experience in work involving the repair and maintenance of traffic signals which will have included four (4) years of supervisory experience.

IMPORTANT INFORMATION

- 1. NJAC 4A:4-2.6 states that all requirements listed must be met as of the closing date, including assignment to jurisdiction/department, and satisfying the permanent status requirement.
 2. ONLY ON-LINE APPLICATIONS WILL BE ACCEPTED. YOU MUST COMPLETE YOUR APPLICATION IN DETAIL. Your score may be based on a
- comparison of your credentials with the job requirements. Failure to complete your application properly may lower your score or cause you to fail.

 3. This examination is open to full-time and part-time permanent employees. If an employment list results from this announcement, it may be certified to fill both fulltime and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the department, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.
- 4. NJAC 4A:4-1.5 states that any employee who is serving on a provisional basis and who fails to file for and take an examination which has been announced for his/her title SHALL BE SEPARATED FROM THE PROVISIONAL TITLE.

 5. In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced application fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the
- DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved by DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. PLEASE NOTE THIS REDUCED FEE DOES NOT APPLY TO PUBLIC SAFETY TITLES. (i.e. Police, Fire, Corrections and Sheriff).
- 6. If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, technical support and customer care are available during regular business hours, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. EST, Monday - Friday, excluding holidays and emergency closings. Please Email: OAS.support@csc.state.nj.us or call (609) 292-4144. Please note that application support requests received outside of regular business hours on the closing date will not change the application filing deadline, so PLEASE FILE EARLY.

DPF-256A * Revised 03/09