

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

In the Matter of Sean Gaven, et al., City of Newark

CSC Docket Nos. 2017-2400, et al.

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Administrative Appeals

ISSUED: MAY 1 9 2017

(RE)

Sean Gaven, Rory Murphy, Cesar Soares, Christopher Brown, Celso Velez, Matthew Ruane, Lee Douglas III, and Marlin Easter, represented by Patrick Toscano, Jr., Esq., petition the Civil Service Commission (Commission) for retroactive regular appointments effective December 26, 2011 to the title of Police Lieutenant, and for admittance to the promotional examination for Police Captain (PM1345U), Newark.

By way of background, the petitioners ranked 4, 3, 2, 9, 8, 10, 13 and 14 respectively on the eligible list for Police Lieutenant (PM2539K), Newark, which promulgated on March 19, 2009 and expired on February 6, 2013. One certification was made from this eligible list, resulting in one appointment. Subsequently, a second eligible list (PM5035P) was promulgated on February 7, 2013 and expired February 6, 2016. Mr. Soares was appointed from this list with a July 15, 2014 appointment date, and the remaining petitioners are Police Sergeants. Subsequently, the petitioners filed actions in the Superior Court of New Jersey, Law Division, against the City of Newark, and the petitioners and the appointing authority entered into a settlement. This settlement provides for the petitioners' appointments as Police Lieutenant retroactive to December 26, 2011, for seniority and examination purposes within 30 days. Further, the settlement indicates that their working test periods would be considered "waived" and they would be eligible to take a Police Captain examination.

Messrs. Ruane, Douglas, Easter, and Brown applied for the examination for Police Captain (PM1345U), Newark, which had a closing date of September 30,

2016, and were denied eligibility on the basis that they lacked the required amount of permanent status in the title to which the examination was open, in this case, Police Lieutenant. This examination was open to employees in the competitive division currently serving and having an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date as a Police Lieutenant. Permanent service is gained from a regular appointment and the completion of a working test period. In this case, seven of the petitioners were Police Sergeants as of the closing date. They request admittance to the examination based on the settlement. For this exam, 21 candidates were admitted and took the two-part examination in October 2016 and January 2017. The results are not yet available.

Lastly, this settlement agreement was executed prior to authorization by the Department of Community Affairs (DCA). As a result, the waiver for the approval of the promotions will not be signed. However, these promotions will not be barred unless there is a negative impact on the City's financial budget. Going forward, Newark is notified that it must present settlement agreements to DCA representatives before execution and submission to the Commission.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) (Eligibility for promotional examination) states in pertinent part that applicants for promotional examinations shall, by the closing date, meet the criteria of having one year of continuous permanent service for an aggregate of one year immediately preceding the closing date in a title or titles to which the examination is open.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.10(c) provides that when a regular appointment has been made, the Commission may order a retroactive appointment date due to administrative error, administrative delay or other good cause, on notice to affected parties.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-3.4(a) provides that the [Civil Service Commission] may revive an expired eligible list under the following circumstances:

- 1. to implement a court order, in a suit filed prior to the expiration of the list;
- 2. to implement an order of the [Civil Service Commission] in an appeal or proceeding instituted during the life of the list;
- 3. to correct an administrative error;
- 4. to effect the appointment of an eligible whose working test period was terminated by a layoff; or
- 5. for other good cause.

CONCLUSION

A review of the settlement indicates that it substantially complies with Civil Service law and rules. The policy of the judicial system strongly favors settlement. See Nolan v. Lee Ho, 120 N.J. 465 (1990); Honeywell v. Bubb, 130 N.J. Super. 130

(App. Div. 1974); Jannarone v. W. T. Co., 65 N.J. Super. 472 (App. Div. 1961), cert. denied, 35 N.J. 61 (1961). This policy is equally applicable in the administrative area. A settlement will be set aside only where there is fraud or other compelling circumstances. See Nolan, supra. In this matter, no such compelling circumstances exist. Therefore, the Commission orders that the eligible list for Police Lieutenant (PM2539K), Newark eligible list be revived in order to effectuate the appointments of the petitioners to that title on December 26, 2011 for seniority purposes only. Although Mr. Soares was appointed from a subsequent eligible list (PM5035P) on July 15, 2014, he should be recorded as having been appointed on December 26, 2011 from the eligible list for Police Lieutenant (PM2539K).

As to the petitioners' eligibility for the examination for Police Captain (PM1345U), the petitioners must have actually served in and performed the duties of the title of Police Lieutenant during the requisite time-in-grade in order to be The power to award, based on administrative error, delay, or other good cause, retroactive seniority to individuals who have in some way been harmed with the concomitant right to sit for promotional examinations, implicitly recognizes the principle of merit and fitness for promotion. In this regard, the settlement submits that the subject individuals have each been working as Police Lieutenants for a As such, aside from Mr. Soares, who has already significant period of time. completed a working test period, they should be deemed to have served their threemonth working test periods as Police Lieutenant. Further, Messrs. Ruane, Douglas, Easter, and Brown should be admitted to the examination for Police Captain (PM1345U), Newark and be given make-up examinations. Additionally, Messrs. Gaven, Murphy, and Velez should be admitted to the examination upon receipt of their appropriately completed promotional applications and fees. A copy of the promotional application is attached for their use and should be submitted, along with a \$75.00 application fee and a copy of this decision, within 20 days of receipt of this decision to the address listed on the top left of the first page of the application. It is noted that Mr. Soares has been admitted to the examination for (PM1345U).

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that these requests be granted, and the Police Lieutenant (PM2539K), Newark eligible list be revived in order for Messrs. Gaven, Murphy, Brown, Soares, Velez, Ruane, Douglas, and Easter to be appointed retroactive to December 26, 2011 as Police Lieutenants, for seniority purposes only, and the personnel records of these employees be amended in accordance with this decision. It is further ordered that the petitioners' requests for admittance to the Police Captain (PM1345U), Newark promotional examination, except for Mr. Soares, be granted upon receipt of their properly completed promotional applications, and they be considered for prospective appointment only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 17th DAY OF MAY, 2017

Robert M. Czech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries

and

Correspondence

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P. O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachments

c: Sean Gaven CSC Docket No. (2017-2400) Rory Murphy CSC Docket No. (2017-2401) Cesar Soares CSC Docket No. (2017-2402) Christopher Brown CSC Docket No. (2017-2403) Celso Velez CSC Docket No. (2017-2404) Matthew Ruane CSC Docket No. (2017-2405) CSC Docket No. (2017-2406) Lee Douglas III Marlin Easter CSC Docket No. (2017-2407)

Patrick Toscano, Jr., Esq.

Jack Kelly Kecia Daniels Michael Johnson Kelly Glenn Records Center Staple Payment Here

APPLICATION FOR PROMOTIONAL EXAMINAT

NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION —County and Municipal Government

\$25.00 FEE REQUIRED Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

FOR COMMISSION USE ONLY

INSTRUCTIONS: Please print or type. Answer all pertinent questions and ensure that all information is accurate and complete. Sign your name in Block 11. NOTE: No additional information may be accepted after the last date for filing applications has passed. If you change your address, you must notify the Civil Service Commission immediately in writing.

Return your completed application no later than the last date for filing listed on the announce-

No REV 1. Title of Promotion: City: Strace: Zip Code:		COMMISSION USE	E ONLY	2. Social Security Number: 3. Symbol:				
SEN: UE: REV Last: First:	STATUS:			* (see block 10 for additional information)				
NO REV Street: City: State: Zip Code:				4. Name & Address:				
City: State: Zip Code:	SEN:	UE:	REV	Last: First: M.I.				
E-mail address: Daytime Telephone:			NO REV	Street:				
Solicity County: Telephone: County: County: Telephone: County:	Title of Promotion:			City: State: Zip Code:				
Sackground Data Sackground Data				F-mail address:				
Same Source Sou								
5. BACKGROUND DATA 5a. Education (Indicate the highest level Diploma or Degree you have earned): High School Diploma or GED								
High School Diploma or GED	iote: Applications mus	t be postmarked by		(Area Code) - Number				
High School Diploma or GED (A) Associate's Degree (M) Master's Degree (D) Doctorate		and Statement Statement	5. BAC	CKGROUND DATA				
(S) Some College but No Degree (B) Bachelor's Degree (D) Doctorate	a. Education (Indicat	e the highest level D	Diploma or Degree you ha	ave earned):				
Scheck the county in which you prefer to take the examination. Check one box only) Check the syou are a member of: (1) Camden (2) Mercer (3) Essex (4) Monmouth (6) Atlantic (7) Bergen (4) Monmouth (6) Atlantic (7) Bergen (4) Monmouth (6) Atlantic (7) Bergen (5) Be contacted regarding auxiliary aid or reasonable accommodation in taking this examination in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. ADA Assistance: Check the box if you would like to be contacted regarding auxiliary aid or reasonable accommodation in taking this examination in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. ADA Assistance: Title & Appointment Date: American Indian (5) American Indian (5) Or Alaskan Native (5) Or Alaskan Native (7) Are you claiming veterans preference for this examination. If established veterans preference claim form and include the required documents. Claim forms are available on our web site at www.state.nj.us/cs our office at 44 S. Clinton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Completed forms should be the Department of Military and Veterans' Affairs (DMAVA). For more inforvisit their web site at www.state.nj.us/military or contact them at 1-888-865 Note: In accordance with Public Law 2010 e.26, Veterans pay a reduced ap fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with Indian Ava (1) Amortical Process. All 1A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: 10 Your Social Security number will be kept confident used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application at process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA I but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once	High School I	Diploma or GED	(A) Assoc	ciate's Degree (M) Master's Degree				
Check the group you are a member of: (1) Male (2) Female (1) Black (2) White (3) Hispanic (4) Asian (5) or Alaskan Native (5). Check the county in which you prefer to take the examination.	(S) Some Coll	ege but No Degre	e (B) Bache					
Check the group you are a member of: (1) Male (2) Female (1) Black (2) White (3) Hispanic (4) Asian (5) or Alaskan Native (5) or Alaskan Native (6) Atlantic (7) Bergen (7) Bergen (8) American preference for this examination. (8) Atlantic (8) Atlantic (7) Bergen (8) American preference since April 1, 1980, no further action is need of the visit state on our web site at www.state.nj.us/cs our office at 44 S. Climton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Complete documents. Claim forms are available on our web site at www.state.nj.us/cs our office at 44 S. Climton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Complete forms should be the Department of Military and Veterans and Preference with the Americans with Disabilities Act. (8) Atlantic (7) Bergen (8) Atlantic (8) Atlantic (7) Bergen (8) Atlantic (8)	b. Completion of this pa	rt is VOLUNTARY and i	is to be used only for compl	lying with EEOC Guidelines and the New Jersey State Affirmative Action Program.				
Check the county in which you prefer to take the examination. Check one box only		CA 75.7 Combas Side		n you are a member of				
Check one box only) Check YES if you are claiming veterans preference for this examination. If yestablished veterans preference since April 1, 1980, no further action is need obtained to the requirement of the visit of the visit at www.state.nj.us/cs our office at 44 S. Clinton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Completed forms should be the Department of Military and Veterans' Affairs (DMAVA). For more infor visit their web site at www.state.nj.us/military or contact them at 1-888-865 note: In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced ap fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. Present Permanent Title & Appointment Date: **10. Your Social Security number will be kept confident used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application approcess. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA I but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once	Gender: (1) Ma	le [] (2) Femal		American indian				
Cleck TES if you are terraining veteralis preference for this examination. In established veterans preference since April 1, 1980, no further action is need Otherwise, complete a veterans preference claim form and include the required documents. Claim forms are available on our web site at www.state.nj.us/cs our office at 44 S. Clinton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Completed forms should be the Department of Military and Veterans' Affairs (DMAVA). For more information in taking this examination in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. ADA Assistance: Check the box if you would like to be contacted regarding auxiliary aid or reasonable accommodation in taking this examination in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. ADA Assistance: Check the box if you would like to be contacted regarding auxiliary aid or reasonable accommodation in taking this examination in accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced ap fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. Present Permanent Title & Appointment Date: 10. Your Social Security number will be kept confident used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application at process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 1 but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once		which you prefer to	o take the examination.	7. Are you claiming veterans preference? YES NO				
Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: ** 10. Your Social Security number will be kept confident used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application as process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 1 but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once	(1) Camden (4) Monmouth ADA Assistance: Combe contacted accommodate	(6) Atlantic	would like to aid or reasonable amination in accordance	established veterans preference since April 1, 1980, no further action is needed. Otherwise, complete a veterans preference claim form and include the required documents. Claim forms are available on our web site at www.state.nj.us/csc ar our office at 44 S. Clinton Avenue, Trenton, NJ. Completed forms should be mathe Department of Military and Veterans' Affairs (DMAVA). For more informat visit their web site at www.state.nj.us/military or contact them at 1-888-865-83 Note: In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced applie fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved by				
Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application at process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 1 but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once				DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list.				
Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track a records and transactions associated with the application at process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 1 but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once	Procent Permanent	Title & Annaintma	nt Date:	¥ 10 V 0 11 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1				
Name & Title of Immediate Supervisor: process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 1 but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the a unique number will be assigned to you. However, once	Present Permanent	Title & Appointme	nt Date.	used as your applicant I.D. number to identify and track all o				
	Name & Title of Imr	nediate Supervisor	•	process. Collecting this data is permissible under NJSA 11A but its submission is voluntary. If you do not provide the nu				
Telephone Number & Email Address of Immediate Supervisor: you will be responsible for remembering it for any inquiri may have concerning your application or testing process.	Telephone Number	& Email Address o	f Immediate Supervisor	you will be responsible for remembering it for any inquiries you				
1. Signature: I CERTIFY that the statements made by me in this application are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief, and are made a good faith. I understand that if my application is incomplete, it may be rejected. (WARNING: The Civil Service Commission may refuse to examine, or certify after examination, any applicant who makes a false statement of any material fact per NJAC 4A:4-6.2) IOTE: Your application may be released to the Appointing Authority for the purpose of verifying information with regard to your qualifications.		at the statements made	by me in this application are tr	true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief, and are made FORCSC				

42 Educational Society College A 40 - 1 - 2 -	Title of Promotion:			Symbol: SS#:					
12. Educational Section - College And Graduate Sch announcement, be sure to attach a copy of yo must be evaluated by a recognized evaluation	ur transo								
What is the name and location of the college(s) you attended?		What was your major course of study?		type of degree u earn?	Did you graduate?		If NO, when will you graduate?	Number of credits earned	
Fro To:	m:	Property of Samuel Control of the Co	9 94 90 30%		□Y □	□N	Month / Year		
Froi To:			□Y		N Month / Year				
13. Other Schools or Training Courses - Include burelated to the title for which you are applying.							any training cours	ses that are	
What is the name & location of school/facilit course(s)/training was held?			,	What were the you attended?	dates H	low ma	ny hours per week attend?	Did you complete the program?	
				Month/Yr. TO Month/Yr.		refi 1		\square Y \square N	
			-	Month/Yr. TO I	Month/Yr.			\square Y \square N	
14. Use this space to describe any internships, licer	ses, certi	fications or registrations that you posse	and the second second		Mary and the second second	n for w	hich you are apply	ing.	
A. What type of license(s), certification(s),	and/or re	egistration(s) do you hold?		C. What ty	pe of interi	nship(s) have you com	pleted?	
		3		M/here v	was the inte	arnehii	o(s) completed?		
				vviiele v	was the line	cirioiii	o(s) completed?		
In which state(s) do you hold the license	(s), certif	fication(s), and/or registration(s)?		What we	ere the date	es of t	he internship(s)?		
					ny hours pe part in the				
B. What was the original issue date of the	icense(s	s), certification(s), and/or registration	n(s)?				urriculum? ()	Y 🗆 N	
			gase-li				N o i rogium		
Most is the date of your surrent lines of				Level 1	- 3 Complet	tea	Month/	Year	
What is the date of your current license(s	s), certifi	cation(s), and/or registration(s)?		Lovel 4	- 6 Complet	tod	o 😂 i jin wa wa wa		
45 Employment Board 16							Month/		
15. Employment Record - If you do not proper held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared • What is the name and address of your	st each po k. Since ineligible	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te, , lower your score, or possibly cause yo	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn " be sure it is l. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/complete anace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, list part time, and the number of hours worked per week	et each pook. Since ineligible	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te:, lower your score, or possibly cause yo What is your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn " be sure it is l. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/ complete arace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scoring indicate whether the trate. Failure to co	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared	et each pook. Since ineligible	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te:, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/ complete arace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared	st each po	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te:, lower your score, or possibly cause yo What is your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/ complete arace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer?	st each po	wistion separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te:, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? It position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.)	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/ complete arace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position	et each poek. Since ineligible	wistion separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "te:, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? It position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise?	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/ complete arace is needed	ve prop /year), nd acco d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To	is the each pook. Since ineligible Is the Island Is	what is your title in this position? What is your title in this position? What Is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? essional Staff	full date st paper, ou to fail	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa	ay not receivement (month/complete arace is needed ties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets.	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lispart time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To Month/Year Month/Year	st each pook. Since ineligible Is the Isth Isth Isth Isth Isth Isth Isth Isth	what is your title in this position? What is your title in this position? What Is your title in this position? It your title? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? poort Staff	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/ complete and ace is needed ties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To	st each poolsk. Since ineligible Is the Since Since Is the Since Is the Since	what is your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the grate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To	teach pook. Since ineligible Is the some Professure. Support. Was	what is your title in this position? It your title in this position? What TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? Pessional Staff What was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If yo	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To	Is the support of the	what is your title in this position? What was your title in this position? What was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To	Is the leach poor lead to each poor lead to le	what is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) What was your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? What was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lispart time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position from To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your doubt the same and address of your doubt.	Is the support of the	what is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? What was your title in this position? It is position: PULL TIME? What was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year B What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position?	Is the light of th	what is your title in this position? What TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) port Staff What was your title in this position? It this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is I. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receive nent (month/complete arace is needecties you pece.	ve prop /year), nd accu d, attac	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you no job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year B What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To	is the support of the	what is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) What was your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? What was your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa ne major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the arate. Failure to con- h separate sheets. in this position in	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer?	Is the list of the	sistion separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "tes, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? What is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff What was your title in this position? It this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff what was your title in this position? That was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa me major du of importan me major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the traction of the traction of the separate sheets. In this position	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lis part time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer?	Is the light	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "tex, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff What was your title in this position? It this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff bort Staff mont Staff mont Staff what was your title in this position?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa me major du of importan me major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the traction of the traction of the separate sheets. In this position	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lispart time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To Month/Year Month/Year C What was the name and address of your previous employer?	Is the support of the	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "tex, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? What is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? PART TIME? PART TIME? Average No. hrs. per wk.)	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa me major du of importan me major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the traction of the traction of the separate sheets. In this position	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lispart time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To Month/Year Month/Year C What was the name and address of your previous employer?	Is the light	sistion separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "tee, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members do you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff What was your title in this position? It this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise? essional Staff bort Staff What was your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? Average No. hrs. per wk.) This position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise? The position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? Average No. hrs. per wk.) many staff members did you supervise?	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa me major du of importan me major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the traction of the traction of the separate sheets. In this position	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	
held different positions with the same employer, lispart time, and the number of hours worked per wee application properly may cause you to be declared A What is the name and address of your current employer? What dates have you been employed in this position. From To Month/Year Month/Year What was the name and address of your previous employer? What dates were you employed in this position? From To Month/Year Month/Year C What was the name and address of your previous employer?	Is the support of the	sition separately. Make sure you give your application may be your only "tex, lower your score, or possibly cause you what is your title in this position? What is your title in this position? It is position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? (Average No. hrs. per wk.) In this position: FULL TIME? PART TIME? PART TIME? PART TIME? Average No. hrs. per wk.)	full date st paper, ou to fail List th order List throrder	ible or you m s of employn be sure it is l. If more spa me major du of importan me major du of importan	ay not receivement (month/complete areace is needed ties you pece.	vve propy (year), nd accidental a	per credit for scorin indicate whether the traction of the traction of the separate sheets. In this position	ng purposes. If you ne job was full or omplete your	

CHASAN LEYNER & LAMPARELLO, PC 300 Lighting Way Secaucus, New Jersey 07094-3621 201-348-6000 Attorneys for Defendant

SEAN GAVEN, RORY MURPHY, CESAR SOARES, CHRISTOPHER BROWN, and CELSO VELEZ,

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY LAW DIVISION: ESSEX COUNTY DOCKET NO. ESX-L-958-13

Plaintiffs,

VS.

CITY OF NEWARK,

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

Defendant.

This Settlement Agreement and Release (hereinafter "Agreement"), dated ______ is between Plaintiffs, Sean Gaven, Rory Murphy, Cesar Soares, Christopher Brown, and Celso Velez, and Defendant City of Newark. Plaintiffs and Defendant are referred to collectively as the "Parties."

Background and Purposes of Agreement

- 1.1 Plaintiffs and Defendant are parties to the above captioned action (the "Action").
- 1.2 The Parties have determined that it is in their best interest to enter into this Agreement and thereby (a) amicably resolve all issues in dispute asserted in the Action, or

which could have been asserted in the Action, without any admission of liability or wrongdoing, and (b) dismiss the Action with prejudice and without costs.

2. Effective Date

- 2.1 This Agreement shall not be binding upon the Parties until the Effective Date, which shall be the date when the last of the following has occurred:
 - 2.1.1 The Agreement is approved by the City of Newark's Mayor and Council;
 - 2.1.2 The Agreement has been executed by all of the Parties;
 - 2.1.2 The New Jersey Civil Service Commission approves the Agreement;
 - 2.1.3 If necessary, the New Jersey Department of Community Affairs ("DCA"), and any other necessary agency, approves the Agreement and permits the promotions discussed below; and
 - 2.1.4 The Commission revives promotional list PM 2539K and allows the City to promote from the list, in rank order, through at least Sergeant Marlin Easter.
- 2.2 The Parties will cooperate and use their good faith efforts in securing all necessary approvals.

3. Settlement

The Action is settled in its entirety, subject to the following terms:

3.1 The City shall issue and Plaintiffs shall accept a check made payable to "The Toscano Law Firm, as attorneys for Plaintiffs" in the amount of twentyseven thousand (\$27,000.00) dollars. This payment, however it shall be allocated amongst each of the Plaintiffs, will be reported on an IRS Form 1099, and any other appropriate federal, state, or local tax reporting forms, issued to Plaintiffs.

- 3.2 Payment shall be made within 30 days of the Effective Date of this Agreement.
- 3.3 Plaintiffs Gaven, Murphy, Brown and Velez shall be promoted to the rank of Police Lieutenant within 30 days of the Effective Date of this Agreement. Said promotions shall be deemed effective as of December 26, 2011. However, Plaintiffs waive their rights to any back-pay (including but not limited to related overtime, vacation time, compensatory time and deferred time) associated with these retroactive promotions and back benefits of any nature whatsoever, except as set forth in sections 3.4 through 3.8.
- 3.4 Plaintiff Soares, who has already been promoted to the rank of Lieutenant from a subsequent promotional list, shall be given a promotional date of December 26, 2011.
- 3.5 All Plaintiffs will be entitled to vacation selection seniority computed from a promotional date of December 26, 2011.
- 3.6 For the purposes of taking future promotional examinations, Plaintiffs appointment date shall be December 26, 2011, and the working test period shall be waived so that Plaintiffs are eligible to take the Captain's promotional examination in October of 2016.
- 3.7 Upon the effective date of this Agreement, Plaintiffs Gaven, Murphy, Brown and Velez will be entitled to a total of twenty-seven (27) vacation days per year, as provided for in the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City and Police Superior

Officer's Association of Newark, NJ. Plaintiffs are not entitled to any retroactive vacation days, except that Plaintiffs Gaven, Murphy, Brown and Velez shall be retroactively credited with one (1) vacation day per year for the time period: December 26, 2011 until the execution of this agreement. Moreover, to the extent that Plaintiffs receive their annual allotment of vacation days provided to Police Sergeants for 2016 prior to the Effective Date of this Agreement, then, upon the Effective Date of the Agreement, Plaintiffs shall receive the difference between the twenty-seven (27) days and the number of days they were provided as Sergeants. Plaintiffs are not entitled to 27 vacation days in addition to what they have already received.

- 3.8 The City shall be responsible for paying the pension credit difference (between the salaries of Sergeant and Lieutenant) from December 26, 2011 to the date this Agreement is executed.
- 3.9 Plaintiff Soares shall not receive any additional vacation days pursuant to this settlement, except that Soares shall be retroactively credited with one (1) vacation day per year for the time period: December 26, 2011 until March 27, 2015.
- 3.10 At the time of Plaintiffs' promotions, their pay scale for Police Lieutenant in the Newark Police Department will be based on a promotion date of December 26, 2011.

4. No Representations as to Tax Consequences; Tax Identification

4.1 The amount to be paid under this Agreement will be reflected on IRS Form 1099 Misc. to be issued to the Toscano Law Firm and such form shall be filed with the IRS, indicating that the sum indicated above has been paid under this Agreement as other

income. Defendant does not make any representation as to the tax consequences of the payment hereunder.

4.2 Plaintiffs agree that they will be responsible for the payment of all applicable state, federal and local taxes with respect to the payment described in **Section 3** and will assume full liability with respect to same. Plaintiffs further agree that in the event the IRS or any other taxing authority deems any withholding tax, interest, penalties, or other amounts to be due from Defendant with respect to this settlement payment, Plaintiffs will fully indemnify Defendant and hold it harmless for any sums that they may be required to pay.

5. Release

- up any and all known and unknown claims, rights and causes of action of every kind, whether in law or in equity, against Defendant, its officers, officials, agents, employees, representatives, successors, assigns, and anyone who succeeds to their rights, including, but not limited to, its heirs, or executors of its estate, which now exists or may hereafter arise in connection with the Action. This releases all claims and rights up to the date of this agreement, including those of which Plaintiffs may not be aware and those not mentioned in this Agreement. This Agreement applies to claims resulting from anything which has happened up to the date of the execution of this Agreement.
- 5.2 In addition to releasing any and all claims and rights pursuant to Section 5.1 above, Plaintiffs also specifically release any and all claims which were brought or could have been brought including, but not limited to, the following:

- 5.2.1 Claims against Defendant for misfeasance, malfeasance, nonfeasance or failure to take required official action;
- 5.2.2 Claims alleging a violation of statutory and constitutional promotional rights;
- 5.2.3 Claims alleging violations of Article I, paragraphs 6 (freedom of speech) and 18 of the New Jersey Constitution (freedom of assembly);
- 5.2.4 Claims alleging violations of the New Jersey Law Against Discrimination, N.J.S.A. 10:5-1, et seq. ("LAD"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on the basis of an individual's race, creed, color, religion, sex, national origin, ancestry, age, marital status, affectional or sexual orientation, familial status, handicap, atypical hereditary cellular or blood trait or liability for service in the Armed Forces of the United States;
- 5.2.5 Claims alleging aiding and abetting of discriminatory employment practice(s) in violation of the LAD;
- 5.2.6 Claims alleging violations of the Conscientious Employee Protection Act, N.J.S.A. 34:19-1, et seg., which, among other things, prohibits retaliatory action against an employee under certain specified conditions;
- 5.2.7 Claims arising under the New Jersey Employer-Employee Relations Act, N.J.S.A. 34:13A-1, et seq.;

- 5.2.8 Claims arising under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended, 42 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 2000e, et seq., or the Civil Rights Act of 1991, as amended, which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's race, color, religion, sex or national origin;
- 5.2.9 Claims arising under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 621, <u>et seq.</u>, ("ADEA"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's age;
- 5.2.10 Claims arising under the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, as amended, 42 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 12101, <u>et seq.</u>, ("ADA"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's disability or handicap;
- 5.2.11 Claims arising under the Family and Medical Leave Act of 1993, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 2601, et <u>seq.</u>, ("FMLA"), which among other things, entitles certain employees to take reasonable leave for medical reasons, for the birth or adoption of a child, and for the care of a child, spouse or parent who has a serious health condition;
- 5.2.12 Claims arising under the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, as amended, 29

 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 701, <u>et seq.</u>, which among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment by federal contractors against individuals with disabilities;

- 5.2.13 Claims arising under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> §1001, <u>et seq.</u>, ("ERISA"), which, among other things, regulates pension and welfare plans and prohibits interference with individual rights protected under that statute;
- 5.2.14 Claims arising under the Older Workers Benefit Protection Act, 29

 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 621, <u>et seq.</u>, ("OWBPA"), which, among other things, amends provisions of ADEA and prohibits discrimination in employment and employment benefits on account of a person's age;
- 5.2.15 Claims alleging violations of <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 11A:2-24 or <u>N.J.A.C.</u> 4A:2-5.1, which prohibit appointing authorities from taking action, or threatening to take action, against an employee in retaliation for an employee's disclosure of information on the violation of any rule, law or abuse of authority;
- 5.2.16 Sections 5.2.6 and 5.2.15 shall specifically prohibit any claims including those that could be pursued in the Courts, in an administrative appeal or through the grievance process that any Plaintiff's transfer constituted harassment, retaliation or any other unlawful conduct.
- 5.2.17 Claims arising under any federal or state statute, rule or regulation, or common law.
- 5.3 Plaintiffs acknowledge the following:

- 5.3.1 They consulted with an attorney of their choosing concerning the legal significance of this Agreement;
- 5.3.2 This Agreement is written in a manner that Plaintiffs understand;
- 5.3.3 The consideration set forth above in Section 3 of this Agreement is adequate and sufficient for Plaintiffs entering into this Agreement and consists of benefits to which Plaintiffs are not otherwise entitled;
- 5.3.4 Plaintiffs have been offered 21 days to consider this Agreement before executing same and that any changes to this Agreement subsequently agreed upon by the Parties, whether material or immaterial, do not restart this period for consideration; and
- 5.3.5 Plaintiffs have been advised that during the seven-day period following their execution of this Agreement, any one of them may revoke their acceptance of this Agreement by delivering written notice to Chasan Leyner & Lamparello, PC, attention Joseph A. Garcia, Counsel for the City of Newark, and that this Agreement shall not become effective or enforceable until after the revocation period has expired for each and every Plaintiff without any one of them revoking their acceptance.

6. Attorney's Fees and Expenses

It is specifically understood and agreed that the amount paid under this Agreement includes all attorney's fees and costs to which Plaintiffs and/or their attorneys may be

entitled and the settlement sum is specifically intended to be inclusive of all attorneys' fees and costs. Plaintiffs understand that by executing this Agreement, they release and walve any claim or right for attorneys' fees and expenses in connection with the within suit. Neither Plaintiffs nor the Toscano Law Firm, Counsel for Plaintiffs, nor anyone acting on their behalf, shall make application for any additional monies in addition to the amounts set forth in this Agreement nor shall any of them make any application for attorneys' fees or costs as those amounts are included in the total payment being made herein.

7. No Admission of Liability

This Agreement is executed and all consideration is given in final settlement of disputed claims, and shall not be construed as an admission of any allegation of liability or wrongdoing by any of the Parties.

8. Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure

8.1 Unless consent is granted, neither the Parties nor their respective attorneys, agents or representatives shall disclose this Agreement or discuss the terms hereof with any third party. However, the information in this Agreement may be communicated to the Parties' spouses, attorneys, tax advisors, and financial advisers. If a Party or their attorney receives an inquiry from any third party about this Agreement, the Party shall respond by saying only that "the matter has been settled." The Parties agree and understand the confidentiality requirements of this Section are a material inducement to their consent to this Agreement, and that a violation of these confidentiality requirements will be deemed a material breach of this Agreement. In the event a Party or their attorney is required by

Court Order to disclose the terms and provisions of this Agreement, the Party shall give all other Parties written notification prior to disclosure.

- acknowledge and recognize that the City of Newark is a public entity, and as such, disclosure of this Agreement by the City may be compelled under the Open Public Records Act, N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1, et seq. ("OPRA"), other statute or common law. The City may also be required to disclose the Agreement in relation to its approval or in relation to its compliance with the terms of the Agreement. Notwithstanding any other term in this Agreement, the Parties agree that the City shall be required to use good faith efforts to prevent disclosure of the terms of this Agreement, but the City, as a public entity and employer of numerous people, cannot guarantee non-disclosure.
- 8.3 The Parties acknowledge that this Agreement will be filed with the Commission and any other necessary State agencies.

9. No Disparaging Statements.

Plaintiffs agree that they will not make any statement(s) that has, have, or can be expected to have the effect of disparaging the Defendant and/or their employees or agents. Defendant City of Newark, as an entity, will not make or adopt any statement(s) that has, have, or can be expected to have the effect of disparaging Plaintiffs, nor will it authorize any of its employees or agents to do so.

Nothing in this Agreement, however, shall bar the City of Newark, its representatives or agents, from justifying the City's rationale for entering this Agreement.

10. Fair Representation

The Parties represent and warrant that their respective attorneys have represented them fully, fairly, and without bias or conflict in connection with the Action.

11. New Jersey Child Support Judgment Search and Potential Liens

11.1 Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 2A:17-56.23(b), Plaintiffs understand and agree that the settlement sum will not be released until such time as they or their attorneys provide Counsel for Newark with a certified copy of a child support judgment search, performed by a private judgment search company, reflecting that each of the Plaintiffs is not a child support judgment debtor. Plaintiffs further understand and agree that in the event it is revealed that any of them is a child support judgment debtor, Plaintiffs will not receive any of the proceeds of the settlement until all outstanding New Jersey child support judgments are satisfied. Plaintiffs also understand and agree that if any child support judgment exceeds the net proceeds of the settlement sum, the entire settlement proceeds will be utilized to satisfy any outstanding child support judgment.

12. Consultation With an Attorney

The Parties have consulted with their attorneys with respect to this Agreement, and reviewed with their attorneys all the terms and conditions of this Agreement before signing this Agreement.

13. Knowing and Voluntary Agreement

The Parties represent and acknowledge that they have had a reasonable amount of time to consider this Agreement, and that in executing this Agreement rely entirely upon their own judgment, beliefs and interests and the advice of their counsel, and they do not rely and have not relied upon any representation or statement made by the other party, or by any agents, representatives or attorneys of the other party, with regard to the subject matter, basis or effect of this Agreement or otherwise, other than as specifically stated in this Agreement. The Parties specifically acknowledge that all releases contained herein are knowing and voluntary.

14. Who is Bound

This Agreement shall be binding upon and inure to the benefit of the Parties hereto, and their respective officers, officials, legal representatives, agents, successors, assigns, heirs and executors.

15. Complete Agreement

This Agreement contains the entire agreement between the Parties with respect to the subject matter, and supersedes all prior agreements or understandings dealing with the same subject matter. No Party has agreed to do anything other than as is expressly stated in this Agreement.

16. Choice of Law

This Agreement shall in all respects be interpreted, enforced and governed by the laws of the State of New Jersey, without regard to its conflict of laws provisions.

17. Modification

No modification or amendment of this Agreement will be enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by the Party to be charged.

18. Severability

Except as set forth below, should any provision of this Agreement be declared or determined by any court of competent jurisdiction to be illegal, invalid or unenforceable, the legality, validity, and enforceability of the remaining parts, terms or provisions shall not be affected thereby and said illegal, unenforceable or invalid part, term, or provision shall be deemed not to be a part of this Agreement. The releases set forth in Section 5 are deemed to be material terms of the Agreement. The elimination of the releases set forth in Section 5 are deemed to be material terms of the Agreement. If any part of the releases are deemed to be unenforceable, or if there is any claim Plaintiffs assert against Defendant that is deemed not to be released under Section 5, then the Defendant may seek to revoke the promotions referenced in Section 3 and seek reimbursement of all payments made to Plaintiffs under this Agreement.

19. Negotiated Agreement; No Construction Against Any Party

This Agreement was not drafted by any of the Parties, but rather is the result of negotiations among the Parties with the benefit of their attorneys. Each Party to this Agreement read this Agreement and has freely and voluntarily executed it. No ambiguity that may arise in this agreement shall be resolved by construing the Agreement against any of the Parties as drafter of same.

20. Attestation of Parties

Each of the Parties represent and warrant that they have carefully read each and every provision of this Agreement, and that they fully understand all of the terms and conditions contained in each provision of this Agreement. Each of the Parties represents

and warrants that they enter into this Agreement voluntarily, of their own free will, without any pressure or coercion from any person or entity whatsoever.

PLEASE READ CAREFULLY. THIS AGREEMENT INCLUDES A RELEASE OF ALL KNOWN AND UNKNOWN CLAIMS, INCLUDING LAWS PROHIBITING DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT.

PLAINTIFFS ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THEY HAVE READ THIS SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, FULLY UNDERSTAND IT AND ARE VOLUNTARILY ENTERING INTO IT.

recuted.	
WITNESS:	
	SEAN GAVEN
Dated:	
WITNESS:	The second secon
	RORY MURPHY
Dated:	
WITNESS:	
	CESAR SOARES
Dated:	
	The state of the s
WITNESS:	

PLEASE READ CAREFULLY. THIS AGREEMENT INCLUDES A RELEASE OF ALL KNOWN AND UNKNOWN CLAIMS, INCLUDING LAWS PROHIBITING DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT.

PLAINTIFFS ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THEY HAVE READ THIS SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, FULLY UNDERSTAND IT AND ARE VOLUNTARILY ENTERING INTO IT.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the parties hereto have caused this Agreement to be duly executed.

Dated: 4/28/16

Dated: 4/28/16

Dated: 4/28/16

Dated: 4/28/16

WITNESS:

Dated: 4/28/16

CESAR SOARES

CHRISTOPHER BROWN

CHRISTOPHER BROWN

PA

CELSO VELEZ

16

WITNESS:

Dated:

CHASAN LEYNER & LAMPARELLO, PC 300 Harmon Meadow Boulevard Secaucus, New Jersey 07094-3621 201-348-6000 Attorneys for Defendant

MATTHEW RUANE, LEE DOUGLAS III, and MARLIN EASTER

Plaintiffs,

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY LAW DIVISION: ESSEX COUNTY DOCKET NO.

VS.

CITY OF NEWARK,

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

Defendant.

This Settlement Agreement and Release (hereinafter "Agreement"), dated ______ is between Plaintiffs, Matthew Ruane, Lee Douglas III, and Marlin Easter, and Defendant City of Newark. Plaintiffs and Defendant are referred to collectively as the "Parties."

1. Background and Purposes of Agreement

- 1.1 Plaintiffs and Defendant are parties to the above captioned action (the "Action").
- 1.2 The Parties have determined that it is in their best interest to enter into this Agreement and thereby (a) amicably resolve all issues in dispute asserted in the Action, or which could have been asserted in the Action, without any admission of liability or wrongdoing, and (b) dismiss the Action with prejudice and without costs.

2. Effective Date

- 2.1 This Agreement shall not be binding upon the Parties until the Effective Date, which shall be the date when the last of the following has occurred:
 - 2.1.1 The Agreement is approved by the City of Newark's Mayor and Council;
 - 2.1.2 The Agreement has been executed by all of the Parties;
 - 2.1.2 The New Jersey Civil Service Commission approves the Agreement;
 - 2.1.3 If necessary, the New Jersey Department of Community Affairs ("DCA"), and any other necessary agency, approves the Agreement and permits the promotions discussed below; and
 - 2.1.4 The Commission revives promotional list PM 2539K and allows the City to promote from the list, in rank order, through at least Sergeant Marlin Easter.
- 2.2 The Parties will cooperate and use their good faith efforts in securing all necessary approvals.

3. Settlement

The Action is settled in its entirety, subject to the following terms:

3.1 The City shall issue and Plaintiffs shall accept a check made payable to "The Law Offices of John McGovern, as attorneys for Plaintiffs" in the amount of seventeen (\$15,000.00) dollars. This payment, however it shall be allocated amongst each of the Plaintiffs, will be reported on an IRS Form 1099, and any other appropriate federal, state, or local tax reporting forms, issued to Plaintiffs.

- 3.2 Payment shall be made within 30 days of the Effective Date of this Agreement.
- 3.3 Plaintiffs shall be promoted to the rank of Police Lieutenant within 30 days of the Effective Date of this Agreement. Said promotions shall be deemed effective as of December 26, 2011. However, Plaintiffs waive their rights to any back-pay (including but not limited to related overtime, vacation time, compensatory time and deferred time) associated with these retroactive promotions and back benefits of any nature whatsoever, except as set forth in sections 3.4 through 3.7.
- 3.4 Plaintiffs will be entitled to vacation selection seniority computed from a promotional date of December 26, 2011.
- 3.6 For the purposes of taking future promotional examinations, Plaintiffs appointment date shall be December 26, 2011, and the working test period shall be waived so that Plaintiffs are eligible to take the Captain's promotional examination in October of 2016.
- 3.7 Upon the effective date of this Agreement, Plaintiffs will be entitled to a total of twenty-seven (27) vacation days per year, as provided for in the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City and Police Superior Officer's Association of Newark, NJ. Plaintiffs are not entitled to any retroactive vacation days. Moreover, to the extent that Plaintiffs receive their annual allotment of vacation days provided to Police Sergeants for 2016 prior to the Effective Date of this Agreement, then, upon the Effective Date of the Agreement, Plaintiffs shall receive the difference between the twenty-seven (27) days and

the number of days they were provided as Sergeants. Plaintiffs are not entitled to 27 vacation days in addition to what they have already received.

- 3.8 The City shall be responsible for paying the pension credit difference (between the salaries of Sergeant and Lieutenant) from December 26, 2011 to the date this Agreement is executed.
- 3.9 At the time of Plaintiffs' promotions, their pay scale for Police Lieutenant in the Newark Police Department will be based on a promotion date of December 26, 2011.

4. No Representations as to Tax Consequences; Tax Identification

- 4.1 The amount to be paid under this Agreement will be reflected on IRS Form 1099 Misc. to be issued to the Law Offices of John McGovern and such form shall be filed with the IRS, indicating that the sum indicated above has been paid under this Agreement as other income. Defendant does not make any representation as to the tax consequences of the payment hereunder.
- 4.2 Plaintiffs agree that they will be responsible for the payment of all applicable state, federal and local taxes with respect to the payment described in **Section 3** and will assume full liability with respect to same. Plaintiffs further agree that in the event the IRS or any other taxing authority deems any withholding tax, interest, penalties, or other amounts to be due from Defendant with respect to this settlement payment, Plaintiffs will fully indemnify Defendant and hold it harmless for any sums that they may be required to pay.

5. Release

- 5.1 Plaintiffs fully, unconditionally and without limitation waive, release and give up any and all known and unknown claims, rights and causes of action of every kind, whether in law or in equity, against Defendant, its officers, officials, agents, employees, representatives, successors, assigns, and anyone who succeeds to their rights, including, but not limited to, its heirs, or executors of its estate, which now exists or may hereafter arise in connection with the Action. This releases all claims and rights up to the date of this agreement, including those of which Plaintiffs may not be aware and those not mentioned in this Agreement. This Agreement applies to claims resulting from anything which has happened up to the date of the execution of this Agreement.
- 5.2 In addition to releasing any and all claims and rights pursuant to Section 5.1 above, Plaintiffs also specifically release any and all claims which were brought or could have been brought including, but not limited to, the following:
 - 5.2.1 Claims against Defendant for misfeasance, malfeasance, nonfeasance or failure to take required official action;
 - 5.2.2 Claims alleging a violation of statutory and constitutional promotional rights;
 - 5.2.3 Claims alleging violations of Article I, paragraphs 6 (freedom of speech) and 18 of the New Jersey Constitution (freedom of assembly);
 - 5.2.4 Claims alleging violations of the New Jersey Law Against Discrimination, N.J.S.A. 10:5-1, et seq. ("LAD"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on the basis of an

individual's race, creed, color, religion, sex, national origin, ancestry, age, marital status, affectional or sexual orientation, familial status, handicap, atypical hereditary cellular or blood trait or liability for service in the Armed Forces of the United States;

- 5.2.5 Claims alleging aiding and abetting of discriminatory employment practice(s) in violation of the LAD;
- 5.2.6 Claims alleging violations of the Conscientious Employee Protection Act, N.J.S.A. 34:19-1, et seq., which, among other things, prohibits retaliatory action against an employee under certain specified conditions;
- 5.2.7 Claims arising under the New Jersey Employer-Employee Relations Act, N.J.S.A. 34:13A-1, et seq.;
- 5.2.8 Claims arising under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended, 42 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 2000e, <u>et seq.</u>, or the Civil Rights Act of 1991, as amended, which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's race, color, religion, sex or national origin;
- 5.2.9 Claims arising under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 621, et seq., ("ADEA"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's age;

- 5.2.10 Claims arising under the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, as amended, 42 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 12101, <u>et seq.</u>, ("ADA"), which, among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment on account of a person's disability or handicap;
- 5.2.11 Claims arising under the Family and Medical Leave Act of 1993, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 2601, <u>et seq.</u>, ("FMLA"), which among other things, entitles certain employees to take reasonable leave for medical reasons, for the birth or adoption of a child, and for the care of a child, spouse or parent who has a serious health condition;
- 5.2.12 Claims arising under the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, as amended, 29
 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 701, et seq., which among other things, prohibits discrimination in employment by federal contractors against individuals with disabilities;
- 5.2.13 Claims arising under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974, as amended, 29 <u>U.S.C.</u> §1001, <u>et seq.</u>, ("ERISA"), which, among other things, regulates pension and welfare plans and prohibits interference with individual rights protected under that statute;
- 5.2.14 Claims arising under the Older Workers Benefit Protection Act, 29
 <u>U.S.C.</u> § 621, et seq., ("OWBPA"), which, among other things, amends provisions of ADEA and prohibits discrimination in employment and employment benefits on account of a person's age;

- 5.2.15 Claims alleging violations of N.J.S.A. 11A:2-24 or N.J.A.C. 4A:2-5.1, which prohibit appointing authorities from taking action, or threatening to take action, against an employee in retaliation for an employee's disclosure of information on the violation of any rule, law or abuse of authority;
- 5.2.16 Sections 5.2.6 and 5.2.15 shall specifically prohibit any claims including those that could be pursued in the Courts, in an administrative appeal or through the grievance process that any Plaintiff's transfer constituted harassment, retaliation or any other unlawful conduct.
- 5.2.17 Claims arising under any federal or state statute, rule or regulation, or common law.
- 5.3 Plaintiffs acknowledge the following:
 - 5.3.1 They consulted with an attorney of their choosing concerning the legal significance of this Agreement;
 - 5.3.2 This Agreement is written in a manner that Plaintiffs understand;
 - 5.3.3 The consideration set forth above in Section 3 of this Agreement is adequate and sufficient for Plaintiffs entering into this Agreement and consists of benefits to which Plaintiffs are not otherwise entitled;
 - 5.3.4 Plaintiffs have been offered 21 days to consider this Agreement before executing same and that any changes to this Agreement

- subsequently agreed upon by the Parties, whether material or immaterial, do not restart this period for consideration; and
- 5.3.5 Plaintiffs have been advised that during the seven-day period following their execution of this Agreement, any one of them may revoke their acceptance of this Agreement by delivering written notice to Chasan Leyner & Lamparello, PC, attention Joseph A. Garcia, Counsel for the City of Newark, and that this Agreement shall not become effective or enforceable until after the revocation period has expired for each and every Plaintiff without any one of them revoking their acceptance.

6. Attorney's Fees and Expenses

It is specifically understood and agreed that the amount paid under this Agreement includes all attorney's fees and costs to which Plaintiffs and/or their attorneys may be entitled and the settlement sum is specifically intended to be inclusive of all attorneys' fees and costs. Plaintiffs understand that by executing this Agreement, they release and waive any claim or right for attorneys' fees and expenses in connection with the within suit. Neither Plaintiffs nor the Law Offices of John McGovern, Counsel for Plaintiffs, nor anyone acting on their behalf, shall make application for any additional monies in addition to the amounts set forth in this Agreement nor shall any of them make any application for attorneys' fees or costs as those amounts are included in the total payment being made herein.

7. No Admission of Liability

This Agreement is executed and all consideration is given in final settlement of disputed claims, and shall not be construed as an admission of any allegation of liability or wrongdoing by any of the Parties.

8. Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure

- agents or representatives shall disclose this Agreement or discuss the terms hereof with any third party. However, the information in this Agreement may be communicated to the Parties' spouses, attorneys, tax advisors, and financial advisers. If a Party or their attorney receives an inquiry from any third party about this Agreement, the Party shall respond by saying only that "the matter has been settled." The Parties agree and understand the confidentiality requirements of this Section are a material inducement to their consent to this Agreement, and that a violation of these confidentiality requirements will be deemed a material breach of this Agreement. In the event a Party or their attorney is required by Court Order to disclose the terms and provisions of this Agreement, the Party shall give all other Parties written notification prior to disclosure.
- 8.2 The provisions of **Section 8.1** shall apply to all Parties, however, the Parties acknowledge and recognize that the City of Newark is a public entity, and as such, disclosure of this Agreement by the City may be compelled under the Open Public Records Act, N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1, et seq. ("OPRA"), other statute or common law. The City may also be required to disclose the Agreement in relation to its approval or in relation to its compliance with the terms of the Agreement. Notwithstanding any other term in this Agreement, the Parties agree that the City shall be required to use good faith efforts to

prevent disclosure of the terms of this Agreement, but the City, as a public entity and employer of numerous people, cannot guarantee non-disclosure.

8.3 The Parties acknowledge that this Agreement will be filed with the Commission and any other necessary State agencies.

9. No Disparaging Statements.

Plaintiffs agree that they will not make any statement(s) that has, have, or can be expected to have the effect of disparaging the Defendant and/or their employees or agents. Defendant City of Newark, as an entity, will not make or adopt any statement(s) that has, have, or can be expected to have the effect of disparaging Plaintiffs, nor will it authorize any of its employees or agents to do so.

Nothing in this Agreement, however, shall bar the City of Newark, its representatives or agents, from justifying the City's rationale for entering this Agreement.

10. Fair Representation

The Parties represent and warrant that their respective attorneys have represented them fully, fairly, and without bias or conflict in connection with the Action.

11. New Jersey Child Support Judgment Search and Potential Liens

11.1 Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 2A:17-56.23(b), Plaintiffs understand and agree that the settlement sum will not be released until such time as they or their attorneys provide Counsel for Newark with a certified copy of a child support judgment search, performed by a private judgment search company, reflecting that each of the Plaintiffs is not a child support judgment debtor. Plaintiffs further understand and agree that in the event it is

revealed that any of them is a child support judgment debtor, Plaintiffs will not receive any of the proceeds of the settlement until all outstanding New Jersey child support judgments are satisfied. Plaintiffs also understand and agree that if any child support judgment exceeds the net proceeds of the settlement sum, the entire settlement proceeds will be utilized to satisfy any outstanding child support judgment.

12. Consultation With an Attorney

The Parties have consulted with their attorneys with respect to this Agreement, and reviewed with their attorneys all the terms and conditions of this Agreement before signing this Agreement.

13. Knowing and Voluntary Agreement

The Parties represent and acknowledge that they have had a reasonable amount of time to consider this Agreement, and that in executing this Agreement rely entirely upon their own judgment, beliefs and interests and the advice of their counsel, and they do not rely and have not relied upon any representation or statement made by the other party, or by any agents, representatives or attorneys of the other party, with regard to the subject matter, basis or effect of this Agreement or otherwise, other than as specifically stated in this Agreement. The Parties specifically acknowledge that all releases contained herein are knowing and voluntary.

14. Who is Bound

This Agreement shall be binding upon and inure to the benefit of the Parties hereto, and their respective officers, officials, legal representatives, agents, successors, assigns, heirs and executors.

15. Complete Agreement

This Agreement contains the entire agreement between the Parties with respect to the subject matter, and supersedes all prior agreements or understandings dealing with the same subject matter. No Party has agreed to do anything other than as is expressly stated in this Agreement.

16. Choice of Law

This Agreement shall in all respects be interpreted, enforced and governed by the laws of the State of New Jersey, without regard to its conflict of laws provisions.

17. Modification

No modification or amendment of this Agreement will be enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by the Party to be charged.

18. Severability

Except as set forth below, should any provision of this Agreement be declared or determined by any court of competent jurisdiction to be illegal, invalid or unenforceable, the legality, validity, and enforceability of the remaining parts, terms or provisions shall not be affected thereby and said illegal, unenforceable or invalid part, term, or provision shall be deemed not to be a part of this Agreement. The releases set forth in **Section 5** are deemed to be material terms of the Agreement. The elimination of the releases set forth in **Section 5** are deemed to be material terms of the Agreement. If any part of the releases are deemed to be unenforceable, or if there is any claim Plaintiffs assert against Defendant that is deemed not to be released under **Section 5**, then the

Defendant may seek to revoke the promotions referenced in Section 3 and seek reimbursement of all payments made to Plaintiffs under this Agreement.

19. Negotiated Agreement; No Construction Against Any Party

This Agreement was not drafted by any of the Parties, but rather is the result of negotiations among the Parties with the benefit of their attorneys. Each Party to this Agreement read this Agreement and has freely and voluntarily executed it. No ambiguity that may arise in this agreement shall be resolved by construing the Agreement against any of the Parties as drafter of same.

20. Attestation of Parties

Each of the Parties represent and warrant that they have carefully read each and every provision of this Agreement, and that they fully understand all of the terms and conditions contained in each provision of this Agreement. Each of the Parties represents and warrants that they enter into this Agreement voluntarily, of their own free will, without any pressure or coercion from any person or entity whatsoever.

PLEASE READ CAREFULLY. THIS AGREEMENT INCLUDES A RELEASE OF ALL KNOWN AND UNKNOWN CLAIMS, INCLUDING LAWS PROHIBITING DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT.

PLAINTIFFS ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THEY HAVE READ THIS SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, FULLY UNDERSTAND IT AND ARE VOLUNTARILY ENTERING INTO IT.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the parties hereto have caused this Agreement to be duly executed.

WITNESS

Dated: 4/29/16

WITNESS:

Dated: 4/29/16

WITNESS:

Dated: 4/29/16

MATTHEW RUANE

LEE DOUGLAS III

MARLIN EASTER

WITNESS:	CITY OF NEWARK,	
	BY: 1/1	
Dated:	WILLIE PARKER, ESQ. CORPORATION COUNSEL	

DANTO BRADICA, ALEBOULOVICI MARKARDA SANTO VICENTARIA DAGA SANTO DATECHO PO COMER GARDOUSONO PERMINDO SERVICIONO CARA MARKA MARKA

ATTEST:

KENNETH LOUIS
CITY CLERK
DATE: 11/29/16