



## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

## FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Linda Hoffman, Library Director (PM1010U), Borough of Woodland Park

**Examination Appeal** 

CSC Docket No. 2017-573

**ISSUED:** 

**99 2017** 

(ABR)

Linda Hoffman appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services), which found that she did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for Library Director (PM1010U), Borough of Woodland Park (Woodland Park).

The subject examination was announced with a closing date of May 23, 2016 and was open, in part, to applicants with a Master's degree in Library or Information Science and five years of library experience including work in the service, circulation, and reference areas, two years of which must have been in a supervisory capacity. The subject examination was cancelled on August 26, 2016, as the appellant was the only applicant and she was deemed ineligible.

On her application, the appellant indicated, in relevant part, that she possessed a Master's degree in Library and Information Science and that she served provisionally as a Library Director from November 2015 to the closing date of the examination (May 2016); as a Supervising Library Assistant from January 2013 to October 2015; as a Principal Library Assistant from March 2011 to December 2012; as a Senior Library Assistant from July 2008 to April 2011; as a Library Assistant from July 2006 to July 2008. Agency Services credited the appellant with seven months of the indicated general library work experience based upon her service as a provisional Library Director, but determined that she was ineligible for the subject

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Agency records indicate that the appellant was appointed to the title of Library Assistant, effective August 1, 2006.

examination because she did not possess the required additional four years and five months of the above-noted library experience, including two years in a supervisory capacity. Specifically, Agency Services determined that applicable duties in the reference area would be out-of-title work for the title of Supervising Library Assistant and applicable duties in the reference, service, and circulation departments would be out-of-title work for the title of Principal Library Assistant and that the appellant was not performing applicable duties at the required level and scope in any of her other indicated positions. Furthermore, the appellant was not credited with any supervisory experience because she did not indicate that she supervised any professional staff.

On appeal, the appellant argues that she possesses over 20 years of experience in the areas of circulation, technical services and reference. Accordingly, she maintains that all of the experience listed on her application should be credited as applicable experience for subject examination. With regard to applicable supervisory experience for the subject examination, the appellant states that she has supervised employees and students at the Alfred H. Baumann Free Public Library (Baumann Library) since beginning her employment there in August 2006. She indicates that she supervised the entire library staff as an acting Library Director from September 2009 to January 2010 and again in April 2011. She also contends that she supervised a Librarian 1 from July 2012 to August 2013. She further states that since 2014, she has worked in the development of all areas of the library, including performance evaluations, budgeting, internal policies, board meetings, public meetings and other planning initiatives. Furthermore, she highlights her education, participation in professional organizations and community outreach efforts.

Maureen Mulroony, Baumann Library Board President and Kevin Galland, Borough Administrator for Woodland Park, state that the appellant has worked in all areas of the library, including circulation, technical services, reference, and adult and children services, since August 2006. The Borough Administrator adds that the appellant has been supervising employees and students since she was hired in 2006, including an employee who has been serving in the title of Library Associate since July 2015. The Borough Administrator also verifies that appellant served as an acting Library Director from September 2009 to January 2010 and in April 2011. Robert Lindsley and Anne Krautheim, former Library Directors for the Baumann Library also verify that the appellant's duties since August 2006 have included circulation, reference, technical services, programming and the supervision of staff.

Agency records indicate that the appellant continues to serve provisionally in the subject title.

## CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a)2 provides that applicants must meet all requirements specified in a promotional examination announcement by the closing date. N.J.A.C. 4A:1-1.2(c) provides that a rule may be relaxed for good cause shown in a particular situation.

Initially, it is noted that Agency Services correctly determined that the appellant was ineligible for the subject examination. However, the record evidences that the examination situation is not competitive since the examination was cancelled, given that the appellant was the only applicant and she was deemed ineligible. On appeal, the appellant provides letters of support from the Borough Administrator and her former supervisors, verifying her duties at the Baumann Library since August 2006. Additionally, the appellant continues to serve provisionally in the subject title. Therefore, based on the totality of the circumstances in this matter, good cause exists to relax the provisions of N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a)2 and permit the appellant's application to be processed. In so doing, the remedy provided herein is limited to the facts of this case and may not be used as precedent in any other matter.

## **ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be granted, the cancellation of the examination be rescinded and the appellant's application be processed.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 7<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF JUNE, 2017

Robert M. Czech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence

Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Linda Hoffman Kevin Galland Kelly Glenn Records Center

immistrator and not fromer supervisors or many net make a primary of the superior continues of the superior of the superior of the subject of

Therefore are ordered that was support to required to manage and the resource of the resource

w should be pursued to the forms.

TO STAN DAY OF SHARES

ob m M, Caedy h up erab**n** n ii baryaco Commigaion