In the Matter of Anthony Cattani and Jeffrey Fifield, Network Administrator 1 (PS2088K), Department of Human Services
CSC Docket Nos. 2017-2875 and 2017-2835

ISSUED: JUL 17 2017 (SLK)

Anthony Cattani and Jeffrey Fifield appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that they did not meet the education and experience requirements for the promotional examination for Network Administrator 1 (PS2088K), Department of Human Services. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues presented.

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the November 21, 2016 closing date (see attached). A total of seven employees applied for the examination and one was determined eligible. The one eligible was appointed from certification PS170389.

The Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) credited Mr. Cattani with six years and nine months of experience based on his service as an Information Technology Specialist, but determined that he lacked three months of experience and the equivalent of 18 college credits in mathematics and/or computer science. Agency Services credited Mr. Fifield with eight months of experience based on his 20 general college credits, but determined that he lacked six years and four months of experience and the equivalent of 18 college credits in mathematics and/or computer science. It commented that Mr. Fifield's experience as an Information Technology Specialist contained some aspects of the required experience, but would need clarification.
On appeal, Mr. Cattani and Mr. Fifield both state that they earned enough training hours in mathematics or computer science to satisfy the requirement of possessing the equivalent of 18 college semester hour credits. Mr. Cattani represents that he earned the credits by attending Lyons Institute, which closed in 1988, and Mr. Fifield states that he earned the credits by attending Brick Computer Science Institute, which closed in 2001. However, they both indicate that their transcripts cannot be retrieved and they provide documentation showing the efforts that they made to retrieve these transcripts including contacting the Department of Labor and Workforce Development. However, the Department of Labor and Workforce Development advised that it was not obligated to provide transcripts for institutions that closed more than seven years ago. Mr. Cattani submits a resume that indicates that in addition to his provisional service in the subject title and his service as an Information Technology Specialist from November 2009 to July 2016, he worked in various information technology positions in the private sector as far back as 1990. Mr. Fifield attaches a resume that indicates that in addition to his provisional service in the subject title and his service as an Information Technology Specialist from August 2010 to July 2016, he worked in various information technology positions in the private sector as far back as 1998.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional announcement by the closing date. N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an applicant may amend a previously submitted application only prior to the announced closing date. Further, N.J.A.C. 4A:1-1.2(c) states that the Civil Service Commission (Commission) may relax a rule for good cause in order to effectuate the purposes of Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes.

Initially, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellants did not meet the required experience requirements. Neither Mr. Cattani nor Mr. Fifield included their provisional experience in the subject title or their private sector information technology experience on their applications. On appeal, both appellants provide their complete employment history. The importance of submitting a properly completed application that includes all of the necessary information cannot be overstated, since a complete application provides the only reliable barometer by which Agency Services can make the initial determination whether to admit or reject an applicant. Agency Services has no other tool to rely on in order to make this important initial assessment in an expeditious, fair and efficient manner. Although N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.1(f) proscribes the amendment of an application after the closing date set in the announcement, the Commission notes several circumstances present that provide good cause to permit the appellants to amend their applications in this particular matter. In this regard, the Commission is satisfied that the totality of Mr. Cattani’s information technology experience duties as far back as 1990 and Mr. Fifield’s information technology experience as far back as 1998 warrant their admission to the subject examination. Additionally, the
list is incomplete as there are currently no names on the eligible list. Moreover, the Commission finds that the appellants made a good faith effort to retrieve their transcripts. Therefore, under these circumstances, good cause exists to relax the provisions of N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) and N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.1(f) and accept the totality of the appellants' experience, for eligibility purposes only, and admit them to the subject examination.

It is noted that this remedy is limited to the particular circumstances of this matter and does not set a precedent in any other matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that these appeals be granted and Anthony Cattani's and Jeffrey Fifield's applications be processed for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 13th DAY OF JULY, 2017

[Signature]

Robert M. Czecd, Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

C: Anthony Cattani, 2017-2875
Jeffrey Fifield, 2017-2835
Lori Mattozzi
Kelly Glenn
Records Center