

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Chris Christie Governor Kim Guadagno Lt. Governor Robert M. Czech Chair/Chief Executive Officer

# MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION DECEMBER 3, 2014

Robert M. Czech, Chairperson Robert E. Brenner Thomas J. Perna Richard E. Williams

#### **DECEMBER 3, 2014**

A regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held on Wednesday, December 3, 2014, in Trenton, New Jersey.

PRESENT: Robert M. Czech, Chairperson, Members Robert E. Brenner, Thomas J. Perna and Richard E. Williams; Pamela Ullman, Deputy Attorney General; Henry Maurer, Director, Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs.

In accordance with L.1975, c.231, the Secretary to the Civil Service Commission opened the meeting with the following statement:

Notice of this meeting was filed with the Secretary of State and sent to the Trentonian, Trenton Times, Courier-Post and Star Ledger on December 2, 2013, and posted at the Civil Service Commission, 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

All actions were by unanimous vote unless otherwise specified.

#### SECTION A – HEARING MATTERS

#### A-1 SETTLEMENTS

In the Matter of Natalie Calloway
Ancora Psychiatric Hospital
Department of Human Services
Release at the end of the working test period

In the Matter of Joanne Gray Woodbridge Developmental Center Department of Human Services Suspension

In the Matter of Kevin Johnson City of Newark Police Department Suspension

In the Matter of Raymond Ojeda City of Newark Police Department Suspension

# RECOMMENDATION OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE IN THE ABOVE CASE – SETTLEMENTS

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission acknowledged the settlements.

# A-2 NOLAN COX - CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-116 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 9963-12

Nolan Cox, County Correction Officer, Mercer County, Department of Public Safety, 45 working day suspension on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee, other sufficient cause, falsification, neglect of duty, loafing, idleness or willful failure to devote attention to tasks which would result in danger to persons or property and violation of administrative procedures and/or regulations involving safety and security.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge - Modify the 45 working day suspension to a five working day suspension.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission rejected the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge and upheld the 45 working day suspension.

# A-3 DAWN GIDDENS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-226 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 10783-13

Dawn Giddens, County Correction Officer, Mercer County, Department of Public Safety, 15 working day suspension on charges of other sufficient cause, violation of an administrative procedure and/or regulation involving safety and security and conduct unbecoming a public employee.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the 15 working day suspension.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

# A-4 DAWN GIDDENS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-479 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 12815-13

Dawn Giddens, County Correction Officer, Mercer County, Department of Public Safety, 10 working day suspension on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee, other sufficient cause and violation of a rule, regulation, policy, procedure, order or administrative decision.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the 10 working day suspension.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

# A-5 TIMOTHY LONDON AND EDMUND JOHNSON-CSC DOCKET NOS. 2012-2183 & 2012-1462 OAL DOCKET NOS. CSV: 1230-12 & 1233-12

Timothy London, Water Meter Reader, Edmund Johnson, Water Meter Reader, City of Trenton, Department of Public Works, six month suspensions, on charges of insubordination, conduct unbecoming a public employee and neglect of duty.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Modify the six month suspensions to three month suspensions.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission rejected the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge and modified the six month suspensions to 30 working day suspensions.

## A-6 RAMKUMARIE RAMCHARAN - CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-1645 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 00588-13

Ramkumarie Ramcharan, Clerk 2, Jersey City Public School District, return to the previously held title at the end of the working test period effective November 28, 2012.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Modify the return to the previously held title and grant a new three month working test period.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission rejected the recommendation of

the Administrative Law Judge and upheld the return to the

previously held title.

**VOTE:** Robert M. Czech (Yes)

Robert E. Brenner (No)

Thomas J. Perna (Yes)

Richard E. Williams (Yes)

# A-7 MICHAEL J. CANAVAN - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-3081 OAL DOCKET NO. CSR: 7368-14

Michael J. Canavan, Senior Correction Officer, Mountainview Youth Correctional Facility, Department of Corrections, removal effective May 21, 2014, on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee, neglect of duty, other sufficient cause, physical or mental abuse of an inmate, falsification, violation of a administrative procedure, and/or regulation involving safety and security and violation of a rule, regulation, policy, procedure, order or administrative decision.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the removal.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

# A-8 TODD SHARP - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1668 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 00783-14

Todd Sharp, Maintenance Worker 1, Department of Transportation, removal effective December 13, 2013, on charges of inability to perform duties and violation of NJDOT guideline for employee conduct and discipline.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the removal.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

# A-9 TAMEKA JEFFERSON- CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1747 & 2014-3083 OAL DOCKET NO. CSV: 782-14 & CSR: 7383-14

Tameka Jefferson, County Correction Officer, Mercer County, Department of Public Safety, 10 and 30 working day suspensions and removal effective May 27, 2014, on charges of conduct unbecoming an employee, violating a rule, regulation, policy, procedure, order or administrative decision regarding lateness, unreasonable excuse for lateness of 15 minutes or less, chronic or excessive absenteeism or lateness, and violation of a last chance settlement agreement.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge - Uphold the 10 and 30 working day suspensions and the removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission rejected the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge and acknowledged the settlement.

#### SECTION B - MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

#### **B-1** Y. D. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-2310

Y. D., represented by Ciro Spina, Esq., appeals her rejection as a Police Officer candidate by the City of Plainfield and its request to remove her name from the eligible list for Police Officer (S9999M) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### **B-2** H. T. L. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1101

H. T. L., represented by James P. Swift, Esq., appeals her rejection as a Police Officer candidate by Atlantic City and its request to remove her name from the eligible list for Police Officer (S9999M) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

#### B-3 S. A. N. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2142

S. A. N., appeals her rejection as a County Correction Officer candidate by Essex County and its request to remove her name from the eligible list for Essex County (C9979M), on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

#### B-4 LAURA LOPES – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1214

Laura Lopes, a Motor Vehicle Operator, Elderly and Handicapped with Monmouth County, petitions the Civil Service Commission for relief regarding her suspension effective November 3, 2014.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

**VOTE:** Robert M. Czech (Abstained)

Robert E. Brenner (Yes)
Thomas J. Perna (Yes)
Richard E. Williams (Yes)

#### B-5 CURTIS ROBINSON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2245

Curtis Robinson, represented by Christopher A. Gray, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission for enforcement of counsel fees awarded in the decision *In the Matter of Curtis Robinson* (CSC, decided February 12, 2014).

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission granted counsel fees in the amount of \$13,447.50.

#### B-6 CHRISTOPHER WARD – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-363

Christopher Ward, a Network Administrator 1 with the Division of Criminal Justice, Department of Law and Public Safety, appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management which determined that his salary was properly calculated under *N.J.A.C.* 4A:3-4.9.

#### B-7 JAMES J. KENNEDY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-748

Morris County requests that James J. Kennedy be provided with a retroactive date of appointment, effective March 13, 2008, as a Juvenile Detention Officer.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

#### B-8 ELIZABETH MULWA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1074

Elizabeth Mulwa, a Staff Nurse 12 Months with the Department of Human Services, Greystone Park Psychiatric Hospital, appeals the determination of her layoff rights and petitions the Civil Service Commission for interim relief regarding her layoff rights.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

# B-9 SHEILA CHAPMAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1127

Sheila Chapman appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services denying her request for a make-up examination for Administrative Clerk (M1040R), Asbury Park.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

### **B-10 JAMES HUANG - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-80**

James Huang appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services denying his request for a make-up examination for County Correction Sergeant (PC2074R), Burlington County.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### B-11 JOSEPH LONGO, III – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1834

Joseph Longo, III appeals the decision of the Division of Selection Services which denied him a make-up examination for Entry-Level Law Enforcement Examination (S9999R).

#### B-12 SEAN NAPIERKOWSKI – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1874

Sean Napierkowski appeals the decision of the Division of Selection Services which denied him a make-up examination for Entry-Level Law Enforcement Examination (S9999R).

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### B-13 JESSE VEGA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-332

Jesse Vega requests a make-up for the open competitive examination for Clerk 2 (M0841R), East Orange.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

### B-14 MANUEL GONZALEZ, JR. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2577

Manuel Gonzalez, Jr. appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management, which found that the appointing authority had presented a sufficient basis to remove the appellant's name from the Correction Officer Recruit (S9988R) Department of Corrections eligible list on the basis of his failure to complete his pre-employment processing.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

### B-15 ANTHONY MURGOLO - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-546

Anthony Murgolo, represented by David J. DeFillippo, Esq., appeals the determination of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management upholding the removal of his name from the eligible list for Correction Officer Recruit (S9988R), Department of Corrections, on the basis of an unsatisfactory criminal record.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this matter be held over.

#### B-16 NATASHI WILLIAMS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2881

Natashi Williams appeals the determination of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management upholding the removal of her name from the eligible list for Correction Officer Recruit (S9988R), Department of Corrections, on the basis of an unsatisfactory background report and falsification of her application.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied

#### B-17 REBECCA ZAYAS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2509

Rebecca Zayas, represented by Carlos Andujar, Jr., Esq., appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management, which found that the appointing authority had presented a sufficient basis to remove the appellant's name from the Correction Officer Recruit (S9987M) Department of Corrections eligible list on the basis of falsification of the employment application.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### B-18 PATRICK BROWN - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-760

Patrick Brown appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that the proper classification of his position with the Department of Environmental Protection is Environmental Specialist 3. The appellant seeks an Environmental Scientist 2, Water Resources job classification.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### B-19 SHAMEESE GAINES – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1726

Shameese Gaines appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management which found that her position with the Department of Health is properly classified as Principal Clerk Typist. The appellant seeks an Administrative Assistant 3 job classification.

#### B-20 GERARD P. HOUCK - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-915

Gerard P. Houck, an Engineering Technician 3 with the Department of Transportation, seeks differential compensation for out-of-title work that he performed based on the Division of Classification and Personnel Management's finding that the proper classification of his position was Engineering Technician 3.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted in part.

#### B-21 MONALISA JACKSON – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1830

Monalisa Jackson appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that her position with Union County is properly classified as Senior Data Control Clerk. The appellant seeks a Principal Data Control Clerk job classification.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

#### B-22 ANDREA LOWNIE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-1713

Andrea Lownie appeals the decision of the Division of Classification and Personnel Management that the proper classification of her position with the Department of Environmental Protection is Senior Technician, Management Information Systems. The appellant seeks an Administrative Analyst 4, Data Processing job classification.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

# B-23 ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST 1 ACCOUNTING (PS3654K), DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1253

The Director, Division of Classification and Personnel Management, on behalf of the Department of Human Services appointing authority, requests that the eligible list for Administrative Analyst 1 Accounting (PS3654K), Department of Human Services be extended for one year beyond its original expiration date.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

# B-24 CORRECTION OFFICER RECRUIT, JUVENILE JUSTICE COMMISSION (\$9986M) – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1144, ET AL.

The Juvenile Justice Commission requests that the names of Kyara Johnson, Jeffrey Malek, Nicole Nightingale, Kathleen Pesina, Ebony Trice, Steven Tursi, and Gerard Vizcarrando be restored to the open competitive list for Correction Officer Recruit, Juvenile Justice Commission (S9986M) and that the list be revived so that they may be considered for current appointments.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

# B-25 HUMAN SERVICES SPECIALIST 1, PASSAIC COUNTY 1 – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1413

The Passaic County Board of Social Services requests that the eligible list for Human Services Specialist 1 (C2150N), be extended for one year beyond its original expiration date.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

#### B-26 PLANETARIUM TECHNICIAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1079

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management recommends reallocation of the Planetarium Technician title to the non-competitive division of the career service in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:3-1.2.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

# B-27 SECURITY GUARD AND SECURITY GUARD (BILINGUAL IN SPANISH AND ENGLISH) – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1402

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management recommends reallocation of the Security Guard and Security Guard (Bilingual in Spanish and English) titles to the non-competitive division of the career service in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:3-1.2.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

#### B-28 SARAMMA ANIL – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-991

Saramma Anil, a Principal Clerk Typist with the Department of Human Services, Greystone Park Psychiatric Hospital, represented by Christopher Young, CWA Local 1040, petitions the Civil Service Commission for reconsideration of the decision rendered on September 3, 2014, which found that her layoff title rights criteria were correctly applied.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

# B-29 COUNTY CORRECTION CAPTAIN (PC1189P) AND COUNTY CORRECTION LIEUTENANT (PC1202P), HUDSON COUNTY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2013-3078

Maria Gaines, Helen Ford, Robert Kalb and Luis Oyola challenge the eligibility of Michael Conrad, John Geoghegan and Christopher Yurecko for the promotional examination for County Correction Captain (PC1189P), Hudson County, and the eligibility of Christopher D'Andrea, Rene Felix, Timothea Gabriel, Miguel Matos, Paul Morales, Sharonda Murrell and Michael Ripp for the promotional examination for County Correction Lieutenant (PC1202P), Hudson County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that the announcements for County Correction Captain (PC1189P), Hudson County, and County Correction Lieutenant (PC1202P), Hudson County be amended to completion of the working test period.

# B-30 JOSEPH LANG, ET AL. – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2015-342, 2015-1335, 2015-1336, 2015-1337 AND 2015-1338

Joseph Lang, a Fire Lieutenant with Harrison, represented by Brian Kincaid, Esq., appeals the appointing authority's failure to regularly appoint him from the (then) second-level supervisor Battalion Fire Chief (PM3517L) eligible list in 2011. Additionally, Harrison requests revival of the expired eligible list for Battalion Fire Chief (PM3517L), so that it can be certified and promotional appointments can be made for the second-level supervisory title of Fire Captain.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied and the request be granted in part, and the Battalion Fire Chief (PM3517L), Harrison, eligible list be revived in order for Messrs. Nichirco and Dwyer to be appointed retroactive to September 6, 2011.

#### B-31 ANDREW S. BENO – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-726

Andrew S. Beno appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for Road Repair Supervisor (PC0602S), Union County.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

### B-32 LILIAN CAPARRUVA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-842

Lilian Caparruva appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that she was below the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Assistant Superintendent of Weights and Measures (PM0645S), Elizabeth.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

#### B-33 BEVAN CARRUTHERS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1093

Bevan Carruthers appeals the change in the test mode for the promotional examination for Manager 2 Division of Motor Vehicles (PS8987T), Motor Vehicle Commission.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

### **B-34 DIANE CURCIO – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1059**

Diane Curcio appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that she did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for Assistant Municipal Clerk (PM0762S), West Milford.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

#### B-35 JAMES DUNCAN, III – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-834

James Duncan, III appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Building Services Coordinator 3 (PS1426K), Department of Children and Families.

#### B-36 RHONDA MCDONALD - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-170

Rhonda McDonald appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Personnel Assistant (M0117S), Irvington.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

# B-37 EDWARD ORAVSKY, JR. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-79

Edward Oravsky, Jr., appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services that he did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for General Supervisor, Parks (PM0199S), Hamilton Township.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

### B-38 MAUREEN O'ROURKE - CSC DOCKET NO. 2014-2622

Maureen O'Rourke appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services, which found that, per the substitution clause for education, she did not meet the experience requirement for the promotional examination for Assistant Buyer (PS2824K), Department of Human Services.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

### B-39 MICHELLE PIERCE-YOUNG - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-168

Michelle Pierce-Young appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services which fund that she did not possess one year of continuous permanent service as a Deputy Municipal Court Administrator by the closing date for the promotional examination for Municipal Court Administrator (PM0527S), Ocean City.

#### B-40 PANAYIOTA REYNOLDS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-282

Panayiota Reynolds appeals the determination of the Division of Selection Services and Recruitment that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Assistant Purchasing Agent (PM0306S), West Orange.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

#### **B-41 CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES**

Submitted for adoption are the Civil Service Commission minutes of its meeting of November 19, 2014.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission adopted the minutes of its

meeting of October 22, 2014.

**VOTE:** Robert M. Czech (Yes)

Robert E. Brenner (Yes)

Thomas J. Perna (Abstained)

Richard E. Williams (Yes)

#### **B-42 CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING DATES FOR 2015**

The proposed Civil Service Commission dates are submitted for approval.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission adopted the Civil Service Commission meeting dates for 2015.

#### B-43 SHERRI JONES – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1362

The Board of Public Utilities requests that the provisions of N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.1(c) be relaxed in order to allow Sherri Jones to be provisionally appointed, pending promotional examination procedures, to the title of Program Specialist 3.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

#### B-44 CHARLES KEENAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1451

The Borough of Elmwood Park (Elmwood Park), on behalf of Charles Keenan, requests that he be permitted to participate in the intergovernmental transfer program and to complete his working test period as a Police Officer with Elmwood Park.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

#### B-45 CRYSTINA BURT - CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1252

Crystina Burt requests that she be permitted to amend her application for the Entry Level Law Enforcement Examination (\$9999R).

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

# B-46 WEIGHTS AND MEASURES APPRENTICE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2015-1571

The Division of Classification and Personnel Management recommends reallocation of the Weights and Measures Apprentice title to the non-competitive division of the career service in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:3-1.2.

**ACTION:** The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

There being no further business before the Civil Service Commission, the meeting was adjourned to convene on Wednesday, December 17, 2014, at 10:00 a.m., at 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

Robert M. Czech Chairperson Civil Service Commission