

STATE OF NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb Chairperson

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION JANUARY 16, 2019

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb, Chairperson Dolores Gorczyca Daniel W. O'Mullan

Philip D. Murphy Governor Sheila Y. Oliver Lt. Governor

New Jersey is an Equal Opportunity Employer

January 19, 2019

A regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held on Wednesday, January 16, 2019 at 10:00 a.m., in Trenton, New Jersey.

PRESENT: Deirdré L. Webster Cobb, Chairperson, Members Dolores Gorczyca and Daniel W. O'Mullan; Pamela Ullman, Deputy Attorney General; Christopher Myers, Director, Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs.

In accordance with L.1975, c.231, the Secretary to the Civil Service Commission opened the meeting with the following statement:

Notice of this meeting was filed with the Secretary of State and sent to the Trentonian, Trenton Times, Courier-Post and Star Ledger on December 20, 2018, and posted at the Civil Service Commission, 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

All actions were by unanimous vote unless otherwise specified.

WITHDRAWAL OF APPEALS

The following appeals were withdrawn and removed from the hearing calendar:

Rene Cora, Truck Driver Heavy, Township of Lakewood, Department of Public Works, six working day suspension.

Wilfredo Gonzalez, Laborer 1, City of Hoboken, Department of Environmental Services, removal.

Carl Rainear, County Correction Captain, County of Cumberland, Department of Corrections, removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission noted the withdrawal of appeals without prejudice.

DISMISSAL FOR FAILURE TO APPEAR

The Civil Service Commission dismissed the following cases without prejudice for failure to appear at the scheduled hearing before the Office of Administrative Law:

Ashley Isip, Judiciary Clerk 2, Monmouth Vicinage, release at the end of the working test period.

Caitlin Sansone, Communicators Operator Trainee, Department of Environmental Protection, release at the end of the working test period.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission noted the dismissal of appeals without prejudice.

SECTION A – HEARING MATTERS

A-1 SETTLEMENTS

Jeffrey Buksar Middlesex County Sheriff's Department Suspension

Bradford Pastrick Township of North Brunswick Department of Parks, Recreation and Community Service Removal Linda Wilson Passaic County Board of Social Services Suspension

RECOMMENDATION OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE IN THE ABOVE CASES – SETTLEMENT

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission acknowledged the settlements.

A-2 ANJI ALBIS

Anji Albis, Human Services Specialist 1, Ocean County Board of Social Services, removal effective December 29, 2017 on charges of insubordination, conduct unbecoming a public employee, neglect of duty and other sufficient cause.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Reverse the removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

A-3 JOSEPH BLOUNT

Joseph Blount, Police Officer, Willingboro Township, Department of Public Safety, 30 working day suspension on charges of violating various departmental rules and regulations.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the 30 working day suspension.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

A-4 JOSEPH CONNORS

Joseph Connors, County Correction Lieutenant, Camden County, Department of Corrections, 30 calendar day suspension on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee, neglect of duty and other sufficient cause.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the 30 calendar day suspension.

ACTION:	The Civil Service Commission	affirmed	the recommendation of
	the Administrative Law Judge.		
VOTE:	Deirdrè L. Webster Cobb	(Yes)	

Dellute L. Webster Cobb	(103)
Dolores Gorczyca	(No)
Daniel W. O'Mullan	(Yes)
	Č,

A-5 JUAREZ HILL (remand)

Juarez Hill, Code Enforcement Officer, City of Newark, Department of Neighborhood and Recreational Services, removal effective January 2, 2015 on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee, misuse of public property and other sufficient cause.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge - Uphold the removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this matter be held over.

A-6 ELVIN URRUTIA

Elvin Urrutia, Senior Correctional Police Officer, Garden State Youth Correctional Facility, Department of Corrections, removal effective May 31, 2018 on charges of conduct unbecoming a public employee and other sufficient cause.

Recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge – Uphold the removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission affirmed the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge.

SECTION B – MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

B-1 F.A.M. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-2270

F.A.M., represented by Robert K. Chewning, Esq. appeals his rejection as a Correctional Police Officer candidate by the Department of Corrections and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Correctional Police Officer (S9988U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-2 J.L.Z. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1922

J.L.Z., represented by Craig. S. Gumpel, Esq., appeals his rejection as a Fire Fighter candidate by the City of Linden and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Fire Fighter (M1548T) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

B-3 MUHAMMAD HAMEEN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-483

Muhammad Hameen appeals the removal of his name from the eligible list for County Correction Officer (S9999U), Camden County on the basis that he falsified his preemployment application.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-4 OSCAR SEGUI – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-599

Oscar Segui appeals his removal from the eligible list for Sheriff's Officer (S9999U), Camden County Sheriff's Office on the basis that he falsified his preemployment application.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-5 NATASHA WHITE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-3046

Natasha White appeals the removal of her name from the eligible list for County Correction Officer (S9999U), Cumberland County, on the basis of an unsatisfactory criminal record.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-6 MICHELE PRUSIK – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1437

Michele Prusik appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services which found that her position with the Department of Law and Public Safety is properly classified as Senior Audit Account Clerk. The appellant seeks a Technical Assistant 3 job classification.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-7 BERGEN COUNTY, SENIOR PROGRAM MONITOR, ET AL. – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2019-690, ET AL.

The Division of Agency Services requests that Bergen County be ordered to return the following certifications for proper disposition: February 6, 2017 certification (OL170140) for Senior Program Monitor (Special); July 5, 2017 certification (OL170803) for Program Monitor (Special); and February 13, 2017 certification (OL170179) for Administrative Analyst (Special/C0628U).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission ordered the appointing authority to properly dispose of the certifications and pay compliance costs in the amount of \$3,000.

B-8 TEN VARIOUS LISTS, NEWARK – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2019-754, ET AL.

The City of Newark's failure to dispose of the certifications for Research Aide (M0412U); Supervisor of Data Processing Operations (M0072T); Senior Planner (M0045V); Coordinator of Contractual Operations (M0929U); Administrative Analyst (M0413U); Program Monitor (M0727U); Assistant Public Information Officer (M0453); Principal Mail Clerk (M0427V); Coordinator of Monitoring and Evaluation (M0262V); and Dental Assistant (M0589V) while provisionals are serving in the titles has been referred to the Civil Service Commission for enforcement.

B-9 ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST (M0279S), CITY OF JERSEY CITY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-849

The Division of Agency Services requests that the City of Jersey City be ordered to return the August 3, 2016 certification of the eligible list for Administrative Analyst (M0279S) for proper disposition.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission granted the appointment waiver and assessed compliance costs.

B-10 BUILDING INSPECTOR (M0111W), MIDDLE TOWNSHIP – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1247

Middle Township requests permission not to make an appointment from the May 15, 2018 certification for Building Inspector (M0111W).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission granted the appointment waiver and assessed selection costs in the amount of \$2,048.

B-11 POLICE AIDE (M0204U), CITY OF JERSEY CITY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-861

The Division of Agency Services requests that the City of Jersey City be ordered to return the August 3, 2016 certification (OL60929) of the eligible list for Police Aide (M0204U) for proper disposition.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission ordered the appointing authority to properly dispose of the certification and pay compliance costs in the amount of \$1,000.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these matters be held over.

B-12 PROGRAM ANALYST (M0689V), CITY OF JERSEY CITY – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-853

The Division of Agency Services requests that the City of Jersey City be ordered to return the February 12, 2018 certification (OL180150) of the eligible list for Program Analyst (M0689V) for proper disposition.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission ordered the appointing authority to properly dispose of the certification and pay compliance costs in the amount of \$1,000.

B-13 TERRY BLANCHETTE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1435

Terry Blanchette appeals the cancellation of the promotional examination for Keyboarding Clerk 3 (PC2650W), Ocean County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-14 JOHN PIENCIAK – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1970

John Pienciak, represented by Michel L. Prigoff, Esq., appeals the bypass of his name on the Deputy Fire Chief (PM3241V), Hillside eligible list.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this matter be held over.

B-15 HOLLY CHESER – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1225

The Department of the Treasury requests the revival of the list for Supervising Pensions Benefits Specialist (PS2553U) to allow for the retroactive permanent appointment of Holly Cheser, effective July 7, 2018.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-16 DOUGLAS BAUM - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1498

Douglas Baum appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Line Worker (PM1638W), Butler.

9

B-17 GEORGE LEWIS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1459

George Lewis appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Electrician (M0638W), Parsippany-Troy Hills.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-18 MICHAEL PAGE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1509

Michael Page appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Mechanic, Diesel (C0520W), Morris County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-19 STEPHEN WATSON - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1503

Stephen Watson appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Senior Sewage Plant Operator/Sewer Repairer 2 (PM1713WN), Millville City.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-20 WILLIAM WEINREICH – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1306

William Weinreich appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that he did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Road Repairer 3 (PC2258W), Hunterdon County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted and the permanent appointment of William Weinreich to the title of Road Repairer 2 be recorded effective August 20, 2017.

B-21 BECKY CANDELORA AND BERNICE JONES – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2019-92 AND 2019-94

Becky Candelora, a former Program Director, Housing Assistance, and Bernice Jones, a former Keyboarding Clerk 2, with the Irvington Housing Authority, represented by Luretha Stribling, Esq., request compensation for their unused leave time upon their May 31, 2018 layoff.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these requests be granted in part.

B-22 ALICIA GRIPPALDI – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-318

The State Parole Board requests relaxation of N.J.A.C. 4A:2-6.1(c) to allow Alicia Grippaldi to rescind her resignation in good standing, effective March 18, 2016, and record the time period from March 18, 2016 to July 22, 2016 in her record as a leave of absence in order to increase her vacation leave based upon her aggregate seniority after such action.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-23 MICHAEL CONRAD, ET AL. - CSC DOCKET NOS. 2018-701, ET AL.

Michael Conrad, Christopher D'Andrea, Miguel Matos, Paul Morales, Sharonda Murrell and Michael Ripp request that their working test periods and those of John Geoghegan and Christopher Yurecko in the County Correction Captain and County Correction Lieutenant titles, respectively, be waived. Conrad, D'Andrea, Morales, Murrell and Ripp also request that they and Matos, Geoghegan and Yurecko receive retroactive appointment dates to the County Correction Captain and County Correction Lieutenant titles, respectively.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these requests be denied.

B-24 JOHN GEOGHEGAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-306

John Geoghegan requests reconsideration of the final administrative determination in *In the Matter of County Correction Captain (PC1189P) and County Correction Lieutenant (PC1202P), Hudson County* (CSC, decided June 7, 2017).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

B-25 BILLIE HAYES – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-3252

Billie Hayes, a former Quality Control Reviewer, Division of Medical Assistance and Health Services, Department of Human Services, represented by William A. Nash, Esq., requests reconsideration of the final decision, rendered on March 27, 2018, which granted the appointing authority's motion for summary decision and upheld the petitioner's removal and resignation not in good standing, effective April 18, 2016.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

B-26 LENORE LEVINE AND KESZIAH FORD – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2018-517 AND 2018-1223

Lenore Levine and Kesziah Ford request reconsideration of the final administrative determination in *In the Matter of County Correction Captain* (*PC1189P*) and *County Correction Lieutenant* (*PC1202P*), *Hudson County* (CSC, decided June 7, 2017).

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these requests be denied.

B-27 ALEXANDER NAVAS - CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-580 AND 2018-581

Alexander Navas, a former Laborer 1 with the Township of West New York, represented by Jason Jones, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission for reconsideration of the final administrative decisions, rendered on March 19, 2018 and April 13, 2018, in which the Director of the Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs denied his request for hearings with respect to his 30-working day suspension and removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-28 J.C-R. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-418

J.C-R., a Technical Support Specialist 1 with the Office of Information Technology, appeals the decision of the Special Assistant to the State Chief Technology Officer, which did not substantiate her allegations to support a finding that she had been subject to a violation of the New Jersey State Policy Prohibiting Discrimination in the Workplace.

B-29 CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

Submitted for adoption are the Civil Service Commission minutes of its meeting of December 19, 2018.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission adopted the minutes of its meeting on December 19, 2018.

B-30 B.R.S. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1930

B.R.S. appeals his rejection as a Correctional Police Officer candidate by the Department of Corrections and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Correctional Police Officer (S9988U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-31 PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO N.J.A.C. 4A

Submitted for the Commission's approval is a Notice of Proposal for various amendments to *N.J.A.C.* 4A. Substantive and technical amendments are proposed.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission approved the proposed amendments for public notice and comment.

B-32 VICTOR BERMUDEZ – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1431

Victor Bermudez, a County Correction Officer with Cumberland County, represented by Stuart J. Alterman, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission for interim relief regarding his immediate suspension without pay commencing on May 22, 2018.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this petition be denied.

B-33 C.L. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1301

C.L., represented by Richard E. Incremona, Esq., appeals his rejection as a Police Officer candidate by the City of Asbury Park and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Police Officer (S9999U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

B-34 K.M. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1027

K.M., represented by Robert K. Chewning, Esq., appeals his rejection as a Police Officer candidate by Florence Township and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Police Officer (S9999U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-35 T.P. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-1010

T.P. appeal his rejection as a Correctional Police Officer candidate by the Department of Corrections and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Correctional Police Officer (S9988U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-36 B.O.R. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-2337

B.O.R. appeals her rejection as a Correctional Police Officer candidate by the Department of Corrections and its request to remove her name from the eligible list for Correctional Police Officer (S9988U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-37 T.L.R. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-2648

T.L.R., represented by Craig S. Gumpel, Esq. appeals his rejection as a Fire Fighter candidate by the City of Elizabeth and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Fire Fighter (M1518T) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

B-38 J.S. – CSC DOCKET NO. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-2326

J.S. appeals his rejection as a Correctional Police Officer candidate by the Department of Corrections and its request to remove his name from the eligible list for Correctional Police Officer (S9988U) on the basis of psychological unfitness to perform effectively the duties of the position.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-39 DWAYNE DAY, SR. – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-426

Dwayne Day, Sr. appeals his removal from the eligible list for Sheriff's Officer (S9999U), Camden County Sheriff's Office on the basis that he falsified his application.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-40 GIOVANNI LEONE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-141

Giovanni Leone appeals his removal from the eligible list for Police Officer (S9999U), Cinnaminson on the basis that he falsified his application.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-41 DAVID PAUL - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-480

David Paul appeals his removal from the eligible list for Sheriff's Officer (S9999U), Camden County Sheriff's Office on the basis that he possessed an unsatisfactory driving record.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-42 APRIL SCOTT - CSC DOCKET NOS. 2018-3672 AND 2018-3673

April Scott requests reconsideration of the final decision, rendered on April 4, 2018, which upheld her removal from the eligible lists for Police Officer (S9999R), Bloomfield Township, on the basis of an unsatisfactory criminal background.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be denied.

B-43 JENNIE HILL, ET AL. - CSC DOCKET NOS. 2018-3162, ET AL.

Jennie Hill, Maureen Hedden, Elaine Silvestri and Maria Valte appeal the decisions of the Division of Agency Services regarding the proper classification of their positions in the Department of the Treasury.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that the appeals of Jennie Hill, Elaine Silvestri and Maria Valte be denied and the appeal of Maureen Hedden be granted.

B-44 LAURA FLYNN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1034

Laura Flynn appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements, per the substitution clause for education, for the open-competitive examination for Senior Community Program Specialist (S0361W), Statewide.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be granted.

B-45 ANAIDA GIRAU – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1753

Anaida Girau appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services which found that she was below the minimum requirements in experience for a qualifying examination for Standards and Procedures Technician 1.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-46 KARINNE SEFERIAN – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1191

Karinne Seferian appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open-competitive examination for the dual title Administrative Secretary/Office Services Manager (C0502V), Hudson County.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-47 CYNTHIA RIOS – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1390

Cynthia Rios appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Assessing Aide (M0290W), City of Perth Amboy.

B-48 THURMAN BRIDGERS, JR., ET AL. – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2019-1539, ET AL.

Thurman Bridgers, Jr., Felicia Bryant, Beverly Dewberry, Jennifer Jones, Manuel Rodriguez, Rebecca Stepniewski, Katrina Waith and Tonia Walker appeal the validity of the promotional examination for Senior Communications Operator (PS6190I), Department of Corrections.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these matters be held over.

B-49 THOMAS HUBBARD - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-176

Thomas Hubbard appeals the multiple-choice portion of the promotional examination for District Parole Supervisor (PS5491I), State Parole Board.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-50 JAMES WOOD, JR. - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1449

James Wood, Jr. appeals the test administration of the physical performance portion of the examination for Fire Fighter (M1562T), Passaic, and requests a make-up examination.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this appeal be denied.

B-51 WOODBRIDGE FIRE DISTRICTS 8, 11 AND 12 – CSC DOCKET NOS. 2019-517, ET AL.

Woodbridge Fire Districts 8, 11 and 12, represented by Richard Braslow, Esq., appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services regarding providing appointments to various individuals who were identified as paid employees.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that these appeals be denied and the positions of compensated individuals be recorded in CAMPS.

B-52 OVERTIME PROGRAM, DEPARTMENT OF LAW AND PUBLIC SAFETY, DIVISION OF STATE POLICE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1792

The Division of Agency Services on behalf of the Department of Law and Public Safety (DL&PS), Division of State Police, Office of Forensic Sciences, requests that the provisions of N.J.A.C. 4A:3-5.3 be relaxed to provide individuals in the non-limited, non-exempt titles of Forensic Scientist 1, DL&PS and Forensic Scientist 2, DL&PS, cash compensation at one and one-half times the regular rate for hours worked between 35 and 40 hours.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this request be granted.

B-53 RUTH DIPALMA – CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1496

Ruth DiPalma, a Cashier with the City of Union City, represented by Christopher P. Kelly, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission for interim relief of her removal.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this petition be denied.

B-54 DEBRA MCCAULEY - CSC DOCKET NO. 2019-1536

Debra McCauley, a County Correction Officer with the Camden County Department of Corrections, represented by Micole C. Sparacio, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission for reconsideration of the final administrative decision, rendered on November 14, 2018, in which the Director of the Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs denied her request for a hearing with respect to her six working day suspension.

ACTION: The Civil Service Commission directed that this petition be denied.

B-55 SHANDOR WINE – CSC DOCKET NO. 2018-3206

The Jersey City Public Library, represented by Ronald C. Hunt, Esq., petitions the Civil Service Commission (Commission) for reconsideration of the final administrative decision, rendered on April 18, 2018, in which the Commission modified Shandor Wine's removal to a 45 working day suspension and granted back pay, benefits, and seniority.

ACTION:	The Civil Service Commission	n directed	that	this	petition	be
	denied.					
VOTE:	Deirdrè L. Webster Cobb	(Yes)				
	Dolores Gorczyca	(Yes)				
	Daniel W. O'Mullan	(No)				

PUBLIC PORTION

Billie Hayes made several comments. He offered his opinion that the public comment section should be at the beginning of the meeting and not at the end and his belief that personnel matters should not be discussed during the public portion of the meeting. He also asked, regarding his agenda matter (B-25), whether the Commission would reverse its determination to deny his request for reconsideration based on a pending matter he filed in another forum that may bear on its decision. The Chairperson responded that the Commission had already voted on the matter and would not re-open it and that he would receive a detailed written copy of the Commission's decision. She also indicated that staff would explain the process going forward.

There being no further business before the Civil Service Commission, the meeting was adjourned to convene on Wednesday, February 6, 2019, at 10:00 a.m., at 3 Station Plaza, Trenton, New Jersey.

> Deirdré L. Webster Cobb Chairperson Civil Service Commission