

DRAFT FOR DISCUSSION PURPOSES

PURPOSE & NEED COMPONENT	SCREENING CRITERION	COMPARATIVE CONCEPT SCREENING METRICS			PLEASE NOTE THIS IS A DRAFT, WORK IN PROGRESS that will evolve as planning evolves. Not meant for public circulation beyond the ESC/CAG.
		GOOD	FAIR	POOR	
FLOOD RISK REDUCTION	Reduces Flood Risk from Coastal Storm Surge (Alternatives 1 and 3)	Protects the greatest amount of the Project Area (located within the 100-year floodplain) from coastal storm surge risk.	Protects a moderate amount of the Project Area (located within the 100-year floodplain) from coastal storm surge risk.	Protects the least amount of the Project Area (located within the 100-year floodplain) from coastal storm surge risk.	Plan induces increased flooding from coastal storm surge in the Project Area or elsewhere.
	Reduces Flood Risk from Rainfall /Interior Drainage Challenges (Alternatives 2 and 3)	Provides improved discharge corridors and/or natural storm water storage for most high priority inflow locations/localized flooding areas in the Project Area.	Provides improved discharge corridors and/or natural storm water storage for some high priority inflow locations/localized flooding areas in the Project Area.	Provides improved discharge corridors and/or natural storm water storage for few to none high priority inflow locations/localized flooding areas in the Project Area.	Plan may induce increased flooding from interior rainfall in the Project Area or elsewhere.
	Provides Protection to Vulnerable and Underserved Populations	Protects the greatest number of vulnerable and underserved populations as compared to other concepts.	Protects a moderate number of vulnerable and underserved populations as compared to other concepts.	Protects least number of vulnerable and underserved populations as compared to other concepts.	Plan provides no improved protection to vulnerable or underserved populations, and/or increases the risk to these populations.
	Provides Protection to Critical Infrastructure (emergency services, hospitals, transit facilities)	Protects the greatest amount of critical infrastructure as compared to other concepts.	Protects a moderate amount of critical infrastructure as compared to other concepts.	Protects the least amount of critical infrastructure as compared to other concepts.	N/A
BUILT ENVIRONMENT/HUMAN ENVIRONMENT	Effects to Existing Utilities & Utility Infrastructure	Requires no or only limited relocations of existing utility infrastructure.	Requires a moderate amount of relocations of existing utility infrastructure.	Requires a large amount of relocations of existing utility infrastructure. However, these impacts could be mitigated in concert with Project implementation.	N/A
	Effects to Existing Transportation Network, Local Traffic, and Connectivity	Includes features to improve connectivity (vehicles, bike, pedestrians) of the street system that would improve connections and traffic circulation. Would result in long-term benefits to transportation infrastructure, with no or only limited adverse impacts to transportation infrastructure.	Does not include features to improve connectivity (vehicles, bike, pedestrians) of the street system that would improve connections and traffic circulation. However, the concept would not adversely effect existing or future-planned connectivity. Would result in some adverse impacts to transportation infrastructure. Would not result in any long-term transportation improvements.	May decrease connectivity or traffic circulation at some locations and/or conflict with future opportunities to improve connectivity (vehicles, bike, pedestrians). Would result in significant adverse impacts to transportation infrastructure during construction or operation. Would not result in any long-term transportation improvements.	N/A
	Effects on Land Acquisition/Housing Displacements	May result in land use improvements over the long term. Would not require acquisitions/easements and/or demolition of housing and permanent relocations.	Would not result in land use improvements over the long term. Would require minimal acquisitions/easements and/or demolition of housing and permanent relocations.	Would require numerous acquisitions/easements and/or demolition of housing and permanent relocations.	Would result in extensive land acquisitions/easements and/or demolition of housing and permanent relocations.
	Potential to Provide Increased Waterfront Access	Includes features that would improve waterfront access within the Project Area.	Does not include features that would improve waterfront access within the Project Area.	Would decrease waterfront access within the Project Area.	Would eliminate waterfront access within the Project Area and/or preclude future waterfront access within the Project Area.
	Effects to Recreational, Civic, and Cultural Amenities and Uses	Incorporates many new and/or improved amenities to support recreational, commercial, and cultural activities.	Incorporates few new and/or improved amenities to support recreational, commercial, and cultural activities.	Incorporates no new and/or improved amenities to support recreational, commercial, and cultural activities.	N/A
	Effects to Viewshed and Local Visual Quality	Includes features that would enhance views of water and other natural areas.	Does not include features that would enhance views of water and other natural resources.	Includes features that would eliminate or reduce views of water and natural areas.	N/A
CONSTRUCTION/ MAINTENANCE & OPERATIONS	Constructability	No need to relocate major infrastructure and no major disruption to business operation/public access during construction.	Some need to relocate major infrastructure and/or some major disruption to business operation/public access during construction.	Need to relocate major infrastructure and/or would result in major disruption to business operation/public access during construction.	Construction could not be completed within the scope and budget of the Project.
	Minimizes Long-Term Maintenance & Operation Requirements for Overall System	Features include a large proportion of permanent, self-sustaining structures, with fewer deployable or high maintenance structures, that require a low , long-term operations and maintenance commitment. Few or no features with potential for human error are included.	Features include a moderate proportion of permanent, self-sustaining structures, with more deployable or high maintenance structures, that require a moderate , long-term operations and maintenance commitment. Features with potential for human error are included.	Features include a small proportion of permanent, self-sustaining structures, with a greater number of deployable or high maintenance structures, that require a high , long-term operations and maintenance commitment. Several features with potential for human error are included.	N/A
	Potential to Complete by 2022	High probability that construction would meet Project temporal requirements. Permits required pose no/low risk to project schedule.	Moderate probability that construction would meet Project temporal requirements. Permits required pose a moderate risk to project schedule.	Low probability that construction would meet Project temporal requirements. Permits required pose a significant risk to project schedule.	Construction and initial operating condition could not be achieved by 2022.
NATURAL ENVIRONMENT	Effects to Existing Hazardous Waste Sites	Features may facilitate the implementation of remedial investigation and remedial actions or reduce the potential to spread contamination, a long-term beneficial effect.	Features are primarily compatible with ongoing remedial investigations and remedial actions.	Features would interfere with ongoing remedial investigations or remedial actions, but not preclude such investigations or actions.	Significant impacts to hazardous waste sites, remedial investigations, and/or remedial actions, and/or results in potential to spread contamination in the environment.
	Effects to Berry's Creek Remediation	No potential for physical, hydrologic, or hydraulic impacts to Berry's Creek Study Area that may impact remediation plan.	Potential physical, hydrologic, or hydraulic impacts to Berry's Creek Study Area that may impact remediation plan.	Physical, hydrologic, or hydraulic impacts to Berry's Creek Study Area that may impact remediation plan.	Would result in significant impacts to Berry's Creek remedial activities, and/or result in potential to spread contamination in the environment.
	Effects on the Transport of Environmental Contaminants/ Sediments during Flood Events	In affected areas, would prevent the inadvertent transport of unsecured hazardous materials during flooding. Contaminated sediments would not be re-suspended. No increase in impacts in unaffected areas.	In affected areas, would reduce the inadvertent transport of unsecured hazardous materials during flooding. The resuspension of contaminated sediments may occur, but effects would be of short duration and could be mitigated using best management practices. No increase in impacts in unaffected areas.	In affected areas, unsecured hazardous materials would continue to be subject to transport by floodwaters as under current conditions. The ongoing resuspension of contaminated sediments would occur, as would the continued dispersion of same throughout the environment similar to existing levels.	Would increase transportation or resuspension of contamination and/or contaminated sediments during flood events as compared to current conditions.
	Effects to Ecological Resources, including Wetlands, "Waters of the US," and Water Quality	Includes features that protect and/or enhance ecological and water resources in the Project Area. Would result in long-term ecological resource improvements .	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance ecological and water resources in the Project Area. Would result in no potential for long-term ecological resource improvements . Overall, neutral or minor adverse effects would be expected.	Includes features that would result in adverse impacts to ecological and water resources over the long term. Concept does not include features that would protect and/or enhance water resources in the Project Area.	Would result in significant adverse impacts to ecological and/or water resources in the Project Area or elsewhere, and/or would impact existing wetland mitigation banks and ongoing wetlands restoration activities.
	Effects to Fisheries and Essential Fish Habitat (EFH)	Includes features that protect and/or enhance connectivity of fisheries habitats and/or facilitate fish migration. No adverse impacts to EFH.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance connectivity of fisheries habitats and/or facilitate fish migration. Minimal adverse impacts to EFH.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance connectivity of fisheries habitats and/or facilitate fish migration. Moderate adverse impacts to EFH, including the potential loss of EFH.	Would result in significant adverse impacts to EFH in the Project Area or elsewhere.
	Effects on Other Sensitive Ecological Resources (e.g. Protected Species)	Includes features that protect and/or enhance protected species habitats. No adverse effects to protected species.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance protected species habitats, but may afford opportunities for further habitat enhancements. No adverse effects to protected species.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance protected species habitats, and does not afford opportunities for further habitat enhancements. Potential adverse effects to protected species.	Would result in significant adverse effects to protected species.
	Effects to Historic and Prehistoric Cultural Resources	Includes features that protect and/or enhance cultural resources management in the Project Area. No effects to cultural resources listed on or potentially eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance cultural resources management in the Project Area. No adverse effects to cultural resources listed on or potentially eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.	Does not include features that protect and/or enhance cultural resources management in the Project Area. Would result in adverse effects to cultural resources listed on or potentially eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.	Would result in significant adverse impacts to cultural resources in the Project Area or elsewhere.
COSTS & BENEFITS	Provides Benefits to the Project Area and Community	High potential to achieve maximum monetary benefits, including flood risk reduction, co-benefits, and others.	Moderate potential to achieve monetary benefits, including flood risk reduction, co-benefits, and others.	Low potential to achieve monetary benefits, including flood risk reduction, co-benefits, and others.	No potential to achieve monetary benefits, including flood risk reduction, co-benefits, and others.
	Can be Implemented within Available Funding Limits	Concept could be implemented within available funding limits.	N/A	Cost to implement concept exceeds available or other identified funds , but a subset of the concept's features that achieve independent utility could be implemented within available funding limits.	Concept could not be implemented within available or other identified funding limits.
	Has a Positive Benefit/Cost Ratio (BCR)	Concept has a high potential to have a BCR > 1.0.	Concept has a moderate potential to have a BCR > 1.0.	Concept has a low potential to have a BCR > 1.0.	Concept has no potential to have a BCR > 1.0.
		GOOD	FAIR	POOR	POTENTIAL FATAL FLAW*
PURPOSE & NEED COMPONENT	SCREENING CRITERION	COMPARATIVE CONCEPT SCREENING METRICS			PLEASE NOTE THIS IS A DRAFT, WORK IN PROGRESS that will evolve as planning evolves. Not meant for public circulation beyond the ESC/CAG.