



State of New Jersey
GOVERNMENT RECORDS COUNCIL
101 SOUTH BROAD STREET
PO BOX 819
TRENTON, NJ 08625-0819

JON S. CORZINE
Governor

CHARLES A. RICHMAN
Acting Commissioner

FINAL DECISION

November 4, 2009 Government Records Council Meeting

Greg Badini
Complainant

Complaint No. 2008-122

v.

Hunterdon County
Custodian of Record

At the November 4, 2009 public meeting, the Government Records Council (“Council”) considered the October 21, 2009 *In Camera* Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director and all related documentation submitted by the parties. The Council voted unanimously to adopt the entirety of said findings and recommendations. The Council, therefore, finds that:

1. The Custodian has complied with the Council’s June 23, 2009 Interim Order by providing the Council with all records set forth in Paragraph 2 of the Order, as well as a document or redaction index, and a legal certification within the five (5) business days of receiving the Council’s Order.
2. **The *In Camera* Examination set forth in the table below reveals the Custodian has lawfully denied access to the supervisors’ meeting minutes listed in the document index because said minutes are exempt from disclosure pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 as advisory, consultative, or deliberative material. As such, the Custodian has carried his burden of proving a lawful denial of access pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-6.**
3. The Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested superiors’ meeting minutes since those minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
4. Because the results of the *in camera* review determine that the Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested supervisors’ meeting minutes since they are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative



material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 under OPRA, the Custodian did not knowingly and willfully violate OPRA and unreasonably deny access under the totality of the circumstances.

Record or Redaction Number	Record Name/Date	Description of Record or Redaction	Custodian's Explanation/ Citation for Non-disclosure or Redactions	Findings of the <i>In Camera</i> Examination¹
1	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/8/05	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West</u>

¹ **Unless expressly identified for redaction, everything in the record shall be disclosed.** For purposes of identifying redactions, unless otherwise noted a paragraph/new paragraph begins whenever there is an indentation and/or a skipped space(s). The paragraphs are to be counted starting with the first whole paragraph in each record and continuing sequentially through the end of the record. If a record is subdivided with topic headings, renumbering of paragraphs will commence under each new topic heading. Sentences are to be counted in sequential order throughout each paragraph in each record. Each new paragraph will begin with a new sentence number. If only a portion of a sentence is to be redacted, the word in the sentence which the redaction follows or precedes, as the case may be, will be identified and set off in quotation marks. If there is any question as to the location and/or extent of the redaction, the GRC should be contacted for clarification before the record is redacted. The GRC recommends the redactor make a paper copy of the original record and manually "black out" the information on the copy with a dark colored marker, then provide a copy of the blacked-out record to the requester.

			<p>under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
2	<p>Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 12/15/05</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to</p>

		well department problems are discussed and resolved.	excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
3	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated	Minutes of weekly meetings of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from

	12/22/05	superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described	disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
--	----------	---	---	---

			in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
4	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/5/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
5	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/12/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super.	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
6	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/19/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues

			<p>are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
7	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/26/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory,	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-</u>

		<p>management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274</p>	<p>1.1. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	--	---

			(2009).	
8	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/2/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
9	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/9/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
10	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/16/06	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391</p>

			<p><u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>N.J. Super. 534</u> (App. Div. 2007).</p>
11	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/23/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional</p>

		problems are discussed and resolved.	of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
12	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/2/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory,

		<p>County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law</u></p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			<u>Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
13	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/16/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
14	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/23/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
15	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/30/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the

			not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
16	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 4/13/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes

		policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u> , and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009)</u> .	of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u> .
17	Superiors’	Minutes of	The superiors’	The superiors’

	<p>Meeting Minutes dated 4/20/06</p>	<p>weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative</p>	<p>meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	---	---	---	---

			process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
18	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/27/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendatio	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			ns to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
19	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/4/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board</u>	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p><u>of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
20	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/11/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the</p>

		resolved.	<p><u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
21	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 5/18/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative

		<p>Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of</u></p>	<p>material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	--	---	--

			<u>Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
22	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/25/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
23	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/1/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
24	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/8/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West</u></p>

			<p>under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
25	<p>Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 6/15/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to</p>

		well department problems are discussed and resolved.	excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
26	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated	Minutes of weekly meetings of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from

	6/29/06	superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described	disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
--	---------	---	---	---

			in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
27	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/13/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
28	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/27/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super.	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
29	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/10/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues

			<p>are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
30	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 8/17/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory,	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-</u>

		<p>management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274</p>	<p>1.1. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	--	---

			(2009).	
31	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/7/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
32	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/14/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
33	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/21/06	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391</p>

			<p><u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>N.J. Super. 534</u> (App. Div. 2007).</p>
34	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/12/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional</p>

		problems are discussed and resolved.	of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
35	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/19/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory,

		<p>County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law</u></p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			<u>Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
36	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/26/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
37	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/2/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
38	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/9/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the

			not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
39	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 11/16/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes

		policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u> , and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009)</u> .	of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u> .
40	Superiors’	Minutes of	The superiors’	The superiors’

	<p>Meeting Minutes dated 11/23/06</p>	<p>weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative</p>	<p>meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
41	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/7/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendatio	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			ns to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
42	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/21/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board</u>	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p><u>of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
43	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/11/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the</p>

		resolved.	<p><u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
44	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 1/18/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative

		<p>Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of</u></p>	<p>material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	--	---	--

			<u>Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
45	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/25/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
46	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/1/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
47	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/8/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West</u></p>

			<p>under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
48	<p>Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 2/15/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-</p>

		well department problems are discussed and resolved.	excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007). <u>J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>
49	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated	Minutes of weekly meetings of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from

	22/22/07	superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described	disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
--	----------	---	---	---

			in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
50	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/1/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
51	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/8/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super.	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
52	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/15/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues

			<p>are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
53	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/29/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory,	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-</u>

		<p>management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274</p>	<p>1.1. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	--	---

			(2009).	
54	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/5/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
55	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/12/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
56	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/26/07	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391</p>

			<p><u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>N.J. Super. 534</u> (App. Div. 2007).</p>
57	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/3/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional</p>

		problems are discussed and resolved.	of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
58	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/10/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory,

		<p>County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law</u></p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			<u>Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
59	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/17/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
60	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/24/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
61	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/31/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the

			<p>not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
62	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/7/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes

		<p>policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u>, and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009)</u>.</p>	<p>of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u>.</p>
63	Superiors’	Minutes of	The superiors’	The superiors’

	<p>Meeting Minutes dated 6/14/07</p>	<p>weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative</p>	<p>meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	---	---	---	---

			process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
64	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/21/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendatio	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			ns to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
65	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/28/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board</u>	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p><u>of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
66	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/12/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the</p>

		resolved.	<p><u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
67	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 7/19/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative

		<p>Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of</u></p>	<p>material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	--	---	--

			<u>Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
68	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/26/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
69	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/2/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
70	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/9/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West</u></p>

			<p>under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
71	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/16/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to</p>

		well department problems are discussed and resolved.	excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
72	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated	Minutes of weekly meetings of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from

	8/23/07	superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described	disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
--	---------	---	---	---

			in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
73	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/30/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
74	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/6/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super.	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
75	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/13/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues

			<p>are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
76	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 9/20/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory,	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-</u>

		<p>management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274</p>	<p>1.1. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	--	---

			(2009).	
77	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/27/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
78	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/18/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 <u>N.J. Super.</u> 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
79	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/1/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391</p>

			<p><u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>N.J. Super. 534</u> (App. Div. 2007).</p>
80	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/8/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional</p>

		problems are discussed and resolved.	of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
81	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/15/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory,

		<p>County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law</u></p>	<p>consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			<u>Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
82	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/29/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
83	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/20/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4)	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
84	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/3/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the

			not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
85	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/10/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes

		<p>policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u>, and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009)</u>.</p>	<p>of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007)</u>.</p>
86	Superiors’	Minutes of	The superiors’	The superiors’

	<p>Meeting Minutes dated 1/17/08</p>	<p>weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative</p>	<p>meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	---	---	---	---

			process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
87	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/24/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendatio	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			ns to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
88	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/31/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board</u>	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p><u>of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
89	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/7/08</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the</p>

		resolved.	<p><u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
90	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 2/14/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative

		<p>Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of</u></p>	<p>material pursuant to <u>N</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).<u>J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1.</p>
--	--	--	---	--

			<u>Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
91	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/21/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
92	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/6/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007). <u>S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1.

			<p>designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
93	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/13/08</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West</u></p>

			<p>under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p><u>Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
94	<p>Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/20/08</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to</p>

		well department problems are discussed and resolved.	excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
95	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated	Minutes of weekly meetings of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from

	3/27/08	superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described	disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
--	---------	---	---	---

			in the case of <u>Education Law</u> <u>Center v. NJ</u> <u>Department of</u> <u>Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
--	--	--	--	--

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in the Appellate Division of the Superior Court of New Jersey within forty-five (45) days. Information about the appeals process can be obtained from the Appellate Division Clerk's Office, Hughes Justice Complex, 25 W. Market St., PO Box 006, Trenton, NJ 08625-0006. Proper service of submissions pursuant to any appeal is to be made to the Council in care of the Executive Director at the State of New Jersey Government Records Council, 101 South Broad Street, PO Box 819, Trenton, NJ 08625-0819.

Final Decision Rendered by the
Government Records Council
On The 4th Day of November, 2009

Robin Berg Tabakin, Chair
Government Records Council

I attest the foregoing is a true and accurate record of the Government Records Council.

Janice L. Kovach, Secretary
Government Records Council

Decision Distribution Date: November 9, 2009

**STATE OF NEW JERSEY
GOVERNMENT RECORDS COUNCIL**

***In Camera* Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director
November 4, 2009 Council Meeting**

Greg Badini¹
Complainant

GRC Complaint No. 2008-122

v.

Hunterdon County²
Custodian of Records

Records Relevant to Complaint:

The Hunterdon County Division of Social Service supervisory meeting minutes from November 2005 to the present.

Request Made: April 1, 2008

Response Made: April 18, 2008

Custodian: Robert L. Greene

GRC Complaint Filed: June 12, 2008³

Records Submitted for *In Camera* Examination: The Hunterdon County Division of Social Service supervisory meeting minutes from November 2005 to March 2008 which consist of ninety-five (95) records of varying lengths.

Background

June 23, 2009

Government Records Council's Interim Order. At the June 23, 2009 public meeting, the Government Records Council ("Council") considered the June 16, 2009 Executive Director's Findings and Recommendations and all related documentation submitted by the parties. The Council voted unanimously to adopt the entirety of said findings and recommendations. The Council therefore found that:

1. Because the Custodian failed to notify the Complainant in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business days of a specific date when the Custodian would respond to the Complainant's April 1, 2008 OPRA request, the Custodian's written response to the Complainant's OPRA request is inadequate under OPRA pursuant to Hardwick v. NJ Department of Transportation, GRC Complaint No. 2007-164 (February 2008), and the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request is "deemed" denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g., N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i. and Kelley v. Township of Rockaway, GRC Complaint No. 2007-11 (October 2007).

¹ No legal representation listed on record.

² Represented by Gaetano M. De Sapio, Esq. (Frenchtown, NJ).

³ The GRC received the Denial of Access Complaint on said date.

2. Pursuant to Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, 379 N.J. Super. 346 (App. Div. 2005), the GRC must conduct an *in camera* review of all memoranda responsive to the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request in order to determine the validity of the Custodian's assertion that the records constitute the exemptions cited by the Custodian pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.
3. **The Custodian must deliver⁴ to the Council in a sealed envelope nine (9) copies of the requested unredacted documents (see No. 2 above), a document or redaction index⁵, as well as a legal certification from the Custodian, in accordance with N.J. Court Rule 1:4-4,⁶ that the documents provided are the documents requested by the Council for the *in camera* inspection. Such delivery must be received by the GRC within five (5) business days from receipt of the Council's Interim Order.**
4. The Council defers analysis of whether the Custodian knowingly and willfully violated OPRA and unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances pending the Custodian's compliance with the Council's Interim Order.

June 24, 2009

Council's Interim Order ("Order") distributed to the parties.

July 1, 2009

Certification of the Custodian in response to the Council's Interim Order with the following attachments:

- Certification of Donna Gapas, Division Head of the Divisions of Social Services; and
- Nine (9) bound copies of the unredacted records consisting of ninety-five (95) superiors' meeting minutes from November 2005 to March 2008.

The Custodian certifies that he is the Custodian of Hunterdon County and that the records enclosed are the true and complete copies of the records requested by the Council for an *in camera* review pursuant to its June 23, 2009 Interim Order. The Custodian further certifies that the superiors' meeting minutes constitute minutes of the internal staff meetings of supervisors in the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services. The Custodian certifies that these records are exempt in their entirety.

The Custodian certifies that at the supervisory meetings, supervisors discuss management issues involving internal operations of the department, development of policies and procedures, personnel issues including directions to and evaluation of employees, and

⁴ The *in camera* documents may be sent overnight mail, regular mail, or be hand-delivered, at the discretion of the Custodian, as long as they arrive at the GRC office by the deadline.

⁵ The document or redaction index should identify the document and/or each redaction asserted and the lawful basis for the denial.

⁶ "I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment."

issues concerning day-to-day operations. Further, the Custodian certifies that the meetings are held to discuss, deliberate, consult, and advise on decisions concerning operations in the Social Services Department. The Custodian certifies that the meetings are a management technique for the purposes of evaluating problems and planning for decisions that need to be made. Therefore, the Custodian certifies that these notes do not need to be disclosed under OPRA for the following reasons:

1. They are not records required to be maintained.
2. They constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.
3. They are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
4. They are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).

Ms. Gapas certifies that she is the Division Head of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services. Ms. Gapas also certifies that supervisory staff meetings provide an opportunity for her to consult with her supervisors, to determine projects, programs and the direct course of action in the department, and ensure the efficient administration of the department. Further, Ms. Gapas certifies that these meetings provide an opportunity for the supervisors to collaboratively discuss issues and for her to consult with them about the office, how it runs, employee performance and the assignment and reassignment of staff. Ms. Gapas certifies that the supervisors discuss information about which she deliberates.

Ms. Gapas certifies that the Complainant is a non-supervisory employee of the department and president of the largest employee union in the County (Communications Worker Association). Also, Ms. Gapas certifies that she is concerned that the release of these minutes to employees who are being supervised would be counterproductive, would affect morale, would affect the abilities of the supervisors to be frank and communicate their thoughts and concerns about what is going on in the workplace, as well as interfere with her ability to manage the department. Further, Ms. Gapas certifies that it would be inappropriate for employees to hear the alternatives discussed about many problems that are resolved without any further interaction with employees. Lastly, Ms. Gapas certifies that the minutes involve discussions involving personnel issues and management decisions concerning the day-to-day operations and long-term and strategic planning which would not be appropriate for employees or the public to have.

Analysis

Whether the Custodian complied with the Council’s June 23, 2009 Interim Order?

At its June 23, 2009 public meeting, the Council determined that because the Custodian has asserted that the requested records were lawfully denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 as advisory, consultative or deliberative material, the Council must determine whether the legal conclusion asserted by the Custodian is properly applied to the records at issue pursuant to Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, 379 N.J. Super. 346 (App. Div. 2005). Therefore, the GRC must conduct an *in camera* review of the requested records to determine the validity of the Custodian's assertion that the requested records were properly denied.

The Council therefore ordered the Custodian to deliver to the Council in a sealed envelope nine (9) copies of the requested unredacted documents, a document or redaction index, as well as a legal certification from the Custodian, in accordance with N.J. Court Rule 1:4-4, that the documents provided are the documents requested by the Council for the *in camera* inspection. Such delivery was to be received by the GRC within five (5) business days from receipt of the Council's Interim Order or on June 30, 2009.

The Custodian provided the GRC with the requested records and the Custodian's certification reiterating that all the records are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material in compliance with the Council's June 23, 2009 Interim Order in a timely manner. Therefore, the Custodian complied with the Council's June 23, 2009 Interim Order.

Whether the Custodian unlawfully denied the Complainant access to the requested records by asserting those records are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1?

The Custodian asserts that he lawfully denied the Complainant access to the superiors' meeting minutes because said records (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative ("ACD") material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009). Conversely, the Complainant asserts that the requested records are government records that are not exempt from disclosure under OPRA.

OPRA excludes from the definition of a government record "inter-agency or intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material." N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1. It is evident that this phrase is intended to exclude from the definition of a government record the types of documents that are the subject of the "deliberative process privilege."

In O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, GRC Complaint No. 2004-93 (April 2006), the Council stated that "neither the statute nor the courts have defined the terms... 'advisory, consultative, or deliberative' in the context of the public records law. The Council looks to an analogous concept, the deliberative process privilege, for guidance in the implementation of OPRA's ACD exemption. Both the ACD exemption and the deliberative

process privilege enable a governmental entity to shield from disclosure material that is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. Deliberative material contains opinions, recommendations, or advice about agency policies. In Re the Liquidation of Integrity Insurance Company, 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000); In re Readoption With Amendments of Death Penalty Regulations, 182 N.J.149 (App. Div. 2004).”

The deliberative process privilege is a doctrine that permits government agencies to withhold documents that reflect advisory opinions, recommendations and deliberations submitted as part of a process by which governmental decisions and policies are formulated. NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132, 150, 95 S. Ct. 1504, 1516, 44 L. Ed. 2d 29, 47 (1975). Specifically, the New Jersey Supreme Court has ruled that a record that contains or involves factual components is entitled to deliberative-process protection under the exemption in OPRA when it was used in decision-making process *and* its disclosure would reveal deliberations that occurred during that process. Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274, 966 A.2d 1054, 1069 (2009). This long-recognized privilege is rooted in the concept that the sovereign has an interest in protecting the integrity of its deliberations. The earliest federal case adopting the privilege is Kaiser Alum. & Chem. Corp. v. United States, 157 F. Supp. 939 (1958). The privilege and its rationale were subsequently adopted by the federal district courts and circuit courts of appeal. United States v. Farley, 11 F.3d 1385, 1389 (7th Cir.1993).

The deliberative process privilege was discussed at length in In Re Liquidation of Integrity Insurance Co., 165 N.J. 75 (2000). There, the court addressed the question of whether the Commissioner of Insurance, acting in the capacity of Liquidator of a regulated entity, could protect certain records from disclosure which she claimed contained opinions, recommendations or advice regarding agency policy. *Id.* at 81. The court adopted a qualified deliberative process privilege based upon the holding of McClain v. College Hospital, 99 N.J. 346 (1985), Liquidation of Integrity, *supra*, 165 N.J. at 88. In doing so, the court noted that:

“[a] document must meet two requirements for the deliberative process privilege to apply. First, it must have been generated before the adoption of an agency's policy or decision. In other words, it must be pre-decisional. ... Second, the document must be deliberative in nature, containing opinions, recommendations, or advice about agency policies. ... Purely factual material that does not reflect deliberative processes is not protected. ... Once the government demonstrates that the subject materials meet those threshold requirements, the privilege comes into play. In such circumstances, the government's interest in candor is the "preponderating policy" and, prior to considering specific questions of application, the balance is said to have been struck in favor of non-disclosure.” (Citations omitted.) *Id.* at 84-85.

The court further set out procedural guidelines based upon those discussed in McClain:

“[t]he initial burden falls on the state agency to show that the documents it seeks to shield are pre-decisional and deliberative in nature (containing opinions, recommendations, or advice about agency policies). Once the

deliberative nature of the documents is established, there is a presumption against disclosure. The burden then falls on the party seeking discovery to show that his or her compelling or substantial need for the materials overrides the government's interest in non-disclosure. Among the considerations are the importance of the evidence to the movant, its availability from other sources, and the effect of disclosure on frank and independent discussion of contemplated government policies.” In Re Liquidation of Integrity, *supra*, 165 N.J. at 88, citing McClain, *supra*, 99 N.J. at 361-62, 492 A.2d 991.

In In Re Liquidation of Integrity, *supra*, 165 N.J. at 84-5, the judiciary set forth the legal standard for applying the deliberative process privilege as follows:

- (1) The initial burden falls on the government agency to establish that matters are both *pre-decisional* and *deliberative*.
 - a. Pre-decisional means that the records were generated before an agency adopted or reached its decision or policy.
 - b. Deliberative means that the record contains opinions, recommendations, or advice about agency policies or decisions.
 - i. Deliberative materials do not include purely factual materials.
 - ii. Where factual information is contained in a record that is deliberative, such information must be produced so long as the factual material can be separated from its deliberative context.
 - c. The exemption covers recommendations, draft documents, proposals, suggestions, and other subjective documents *which reflect the personal opinions of the writer rather than the policy of the agency*.
 - d. Documents which are protected by the privilege are those which *would inaccurately reflect or prematurely disclose the views of the agency, suggesting as agency position that which is only a personal position*.
 - e. To test whether disclosure of a document is likely to adversely affect the purposes of the privilege, courts ask themselves *whether the document is so candid or personal in nature that public disclosure is likely in the future to stifle honest and frank communications within the agency*.

The GRC conducted an *in camera* examination on the submitted records. The results of this examination are set forth in the following table:

Record or Redaction Number	Record Name/Date	Description of Record or Redaction	Custodian's Explanation/ Citation for Non-disclosure or Redactions	Findings of the <i>In Camera</i> Examination ⁷
1	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/8/05	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education,</u>	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education,</u> 391 <u>N.J. Super. 534</u> (App. Div. 2007).

⁷ **Unless expressly identified for redaction, everything in the record shall be disclosed.** For purposes of identifying redactions, unless otherwise noted a paragraph/new paragraph begins whenever there is an indentation and/or a skipped space(s). The paragraphs are to be counted starting with the first whole paragraph in each record and continuing sequentially through the end of the record. If a record is subdivided with topic headings, renumbering of paragraphs will commence under each new topic heading. Sentences are to be counted in sequential order throughout each paragraph in each record. Each new paragraph will begin with a new sentence number. If only a portion of a sentence is to be redacted, the word in the sentence which the redaction follows or precedes, as the case may be, will be identified and set off in quotation marks. If there is any question as to the location and/or extent of the redaction, the GRC should be contacted for clarification before the record is redacted. The GRC recommends the redactor make a paper copy of the original record and manually "black out" the information on the copy with a dark colored marker, then provide a copy of the blacked-out record to the requester.

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
2	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/15/05</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
3	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 12/22/05	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
4	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 1/5/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
5	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/12/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
6	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/19/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
7	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/26/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
8	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/2/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
9	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 2/9/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
10	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 2/16/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
11	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/23/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
12	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/2/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
13	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/16/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
14	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/23/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
15	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/30/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
16	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 4/13/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
17	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/20/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
18	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/27/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
19	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/4/06	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
20	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/11/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
21	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 5/18/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
22	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 5/25/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
23	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/1/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
24	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/8/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
25	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/15/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
26	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/29/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
27	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 7/13/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
28	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 7/27/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
29	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/10/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
30	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/17/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
31	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/7/06	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
32	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/14/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
33	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 9/21/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
34	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 10/12/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
35	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/19/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
36	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/26/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
37	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/2/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
38	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/9/06</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
39	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 11/16/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
40	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 11/23/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
41	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/7/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
42	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/21/06	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
43	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/11/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
44	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/18/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
45	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 1/25/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
46	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 2/1/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
47	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/8/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
48	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/15/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007). <u>J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
49	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 22/22/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
50	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/1/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
51	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/8/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
52	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/15/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
53	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/29/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
54	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/5/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
55	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/12/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
56	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 4/26/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
57	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 5/3/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
58	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 5/10/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
59	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/17/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
60	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/24/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
61	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 5/31/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
62	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/7/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
63	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 6/14/07	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions</p>

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
64	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 6/21/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
65	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 6/28/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
66	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/12/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
67	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/19/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
68	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 7/26/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
69	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 8/2/07	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions</p>

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
70	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 8/9/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
71	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/16/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
72	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/23/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
73	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 8/30/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
74	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/6/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
75	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 9/13/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
76	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 9/20/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
77	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 9/27/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
78	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 10/18/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
79	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/1/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			<p>391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
80	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 11/8/07</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department</p>

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
81	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 11/15/07	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material</p>	<p>The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u>. because the minutes are notes of discussions</p>

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
82	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 11/29/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
83	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 12/20/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
84	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/3/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
85	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/10/08</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
86	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 1/17/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
87	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 1/24/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
88	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 1/31/07	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
89	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/7/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
90	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/14/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007). <u>J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>

			<p>recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	
91	<p>Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 2/21/08</p>	<p>Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>,</p>	<p>The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>

			391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
92	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/6/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the

			<p>memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u>, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).</p>	<p>court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007). <u>S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1.</p>
93	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/13/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> . because the minutes are notes of discussions

		procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1., (3)</u> are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
94	Superiors’ Meeting Minutes dated 3/20/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the	The superiors’ meeting minutes (1) are not records	The superiors’ meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as

		<p>Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.</p>	<p>required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u>, (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ</u></p>	<p>advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in <u>O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u>, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).</p>
--	--	---	---	---

			Department of Education, 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
95	Superiors' Meeting Minutes dated 3/27/08	Minutes of weekly meetings of the superiors of the Hunterdon County Division of Social Services at which management issues and policy and procedures, as well department problems are discussed and resolved.	The superiors' meeting minutes (1) are not records required to be maintained, (2) constitute intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative material specifically excluded from the definition of government records under <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> , (3) are internal memory aides not subject to disclosure under OPRA pursuant to <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007), and (4) are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations to the Division Head and to the Board of Chosen Freeholders and are exempt	The superiors' meeting minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.</u> because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in <u>O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education</u> , 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

			under the common law deliberative process more fully described in the case of <u>Education Law Center v. NJ Department of Education</u> , 198 N.J. 274 (2009).	
--	--	--	--	--

Thus, the Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested superiors’ meeting minutes since those minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1. because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court’s decision in O’Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).

Whether the Custodian’s denial of access to the requested superiors’ meeting minutes rises to the level of a knowing and willful violation of OPRA and unreasonable denial of access under the totality of the circumstances?

OPRA states that:

“[a] public official, officer, employee or custodian who knowingly or willfully violates [OPRA], and is found to have unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances, shall be subject to a civil penalty ...” N.J.S.A. 47:1A-11.a.

OPRA allows the Council to determine a knowing and willful violation of the law and unreasonable denial of access under the totality of the circumstances. Specifically OPRA states:

“... If the council determines, by a majority vote of its members, that a custodian has knowingly and willfully violated [OPRA], and is found to have unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances, the council may impose the penalties provided for in [OPRA]...” N.J.S.A. 47:1A-7.e.

Certain legal standards must be considered when making the determination of whether the Custodian’s actions rise to the level of a “knowing and willful” violation of OPRA. The following statements must be true for a determination that the Custodian “knowingly and willfully” violated OPRA: the Custodian’s actions must have been much more than negligent conduct (Alston v. City of Camden, 168 N.J. 170, 185 (2001)); the Custodian must have had some knowledge that his actions were wrongful (Fielder v. Stonack, 141 N.J. 101, 124 (1995)); the Custodian’s actions must have had a positive element

of conscious wrongdoing (Berg v. Reaction Motors Div., 37 N.J. 396, 414 (1962)); the Custodian's actions must have been forbidden with actual, not imputed, knowledge that the actions were forbidden (Berg); the Custodian's actions must have been intentional and deliberate, with knowledge of their wrongfulness, and not merely negligent, heedless or unintentional (ECES v. Salmon, 295 N.J.Super. 86, 107 (App. Div. 1996).

Because the results of the *in camera* review determine that the Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested superiors' meeting minutes since they are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 under OPRA, the Custodian did not knowingly and willfully violate OPRA and unreasonably deny access under the totality of the circumstances.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The Executive Director respectfully recommends the Council find that:

1. The Custodian has complied with the Council's June 23, 2009 Interim Order by providing the Council with all records set forth in Paragraph 2 of the Order, as well as a document or redaction index, and a legal certification within the five (5) business days of receiving the Council's Order.
2. **The *In Camera* Examination set forth in the above table reveals the Custodian has lawfully denied access to the supervisors' meeting minutes listed in the document index because said minutes are exempt from disclosure pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 as advisory, consultative, or deliberative material. As such, the Custodian has carried his burden of proving a lawful denial of access pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-6.**
3. The Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested superiors' meeting minutes since those minutes are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 because the minutes are notes of discussions designed to develop pre-decisional recommendations about the operations and personnel issues of the department consistent with the court's decision in O'Shea v. West Milford Board of Education, 391 N.J. Super. 534 (App. Div. 2007).
4. Because the results of the *in camera* review determine that the Custodian lawfully denied access to the requested supervisors' meeting minutes since they are exempt from disclosure as advisory, consultative or deliberative material pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1 under OPRA, the Custodian did not knowingly and willfully violate OPRA and unreasonably deny access under the totality of the circumstances.

Prepared and
Approved By: Catherine Starghill, Esq.
Executive Director

October 21, 2009



State of New Jersey
GOVERNMENT RECORDS COUNCIL
101 SOUTH BROAD STREET
PO BOX 819
TRENTON, NJ 08625-0819

JON S. CORZINE
Governor

JOSEPH V. DORIA, JR.
Commissioner

INTERIM ORDER

June 23, 2009 Government Records Council Meeting

Greg Badini
Complainant

Complaint No. 2008-122

v.

County of Hunterdon
Custodian of Record

At the June 23, 2009 public meeting, the Government Records Council (“Council”) considered the June 16, 2009 Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director and all related documentation submitted by the parties. The Council voted unanimously to adopt the entirety of said findings and recommendations. The Council, therefore, finds that:

1. Because the Custodian failed to notify the Complainant in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business days of a specific date when the Custodian would respond to the Complainant’s April 1, 2008 OPRA request, the Custodian’s written response to the Complainant’s OPRA request is inadequate under OPRA pursuant to Hardwick v. NJ Department of Transportation, GRC Complaint No. 2007-164 (February 2008), and the Complainant’s April 1, 2008, OPRA request is “deemed” denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g., N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i. and Kelley v. Township of Rockaway, GRC Complaint No. 2007-11 (October 2007).
2. Pursuant to Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, 379 N.J. Super. 346 (App. Div. 2005), the GRC must conduct an *in camera* review of all memoranda responsive to the Complainant’s April 1, 2008, OPRA request in order to determine the validity of the Custodian’s assertion that the records constitute the exemptions cited by the Custodian pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.
3. **The Custodian must deliver¹ to the Council in a sealed envelope nine (9) copies of the requested unredacted documents (see No. 2 above), a**

¹The *in camera* documents may be sent overnight mail, regular mail, or be hand-delivered, at the discretion of the Custodian, as long as they arrive at the GRC office by the deadline.



document or redaction index², as well as a legal certification from the Custodian, in accordance with N.J. Court Rule 1:4-4,³ that the documents provided are the documents requested by the Council for the *in camera* inspection. Such delivery must be received by the GRC within five (5) business days from receipt of the Council's Interim Order.

4. The Council defers analysis of whether the Custodian knowingly and willfully violated OPRA and unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances pending the Custodian's compliance with the Council's Interim Order.

Interim Order Rendered by the
Government Records Council
On The 23rd Day of June, 2009

Robin Berg Tabakin, Chair
Government Records Council

I attest the foregoing is a true and accurate record of the Government Records Council.

Kathryn Forsyth
Government Records Council

Decision Distribution Date: June 24, 2009

² The document or redaction index should identify the document and/or each redaction asserted and the lawful basis for the denial.

³ "I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment."

**STATE OF NEW JERSEY
GOVERNMENT RECORDS COUNCIL**

**Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director
June 23, 2009 Council Meeting**

Greg Badini¹
Complainant

GRC Complaint No. 2008-122

v.

County of Hunterdon²
Custodian of Records

Records Relevant to Complaint: Hunterdon County Division of Social Service supervisory meeting minutes from November 2005 to the present.

Request Made: April 1, 2008

Response Made: April 18, 2008

Custodian: Robert L. Greene

GRC Complaint Filed: June 12, 2008³

Background

April 1, 2008

Complainant's Open Public Records Act ("OPRA") request. The Complainant requests the records relevant to this complaint listed above on an official OPRA request form.

April 18, 2008⁴

Custodian's response to the OPRA request. The Custodian responds in writing to the Complainant's OPRA request on the fifth (5th) business day following receipt of such request. The Custodian requests additional time to respond to the Complainant's request. The Custodian states that the Complainant will be notified once a determination has been made as to the availability of the requested records.

June 6, 2008

Letter from the Custodian to the Complainant. The Custodian states that access to the requested record is denied because the minutes contain personnel information that is sensitive and private. The Custodian also states that supervisory meetings are not public meetings.

¹ No legal representation listed on record.

² Represented by Gaetano M. De Sapio, Esq. (Frenchtown, NJ).

³ The GRC received the Denial of Access Complaint on said date.

⁴ The evidence of record shows that the Custodian received the Complainant's April 1, 2008 OPRA request on April 11, 2008.

June 12, 2008

Denial of Access Complaint filed with the Government Records Council (“GRC”) with the following attachments:

- Complainant’s OPRA request dated April 1, 2008.
- Letter from the Custodian to the Complainant dated June 6, 2008.

The Complainant states that he submitted an OPRA request to the Custodian on April 1, 2008. The Complainant states that the Custodian denied access to the requested records on June 6, 2008, stating that the records contain personnel information that is sensitive and private and that the supervisory meetings minutes are not public meetings.

The Complainant contends that the requested records are government records pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1 et seq. and do not fall within any privilege or exemption contained in OPRA. Additionally, the Complainant asserts that the Custodian’s denial does not comply with OPRA because the cited exemptions do not exempt the records from disclosure in their entirety. The Complainant requests that all records responsive be provided by the Custodian.

The Complainant agrees to mediate this complaint.

July 18, 2008

Offer of Mediation sent to the Custodian.

July 25, 2008

The Custodian agrees to mediate this complaint.

July 28, 2008

Complaint referred to mediation.

February 19, 2009

Complaint referred back from mediation.

February 20, 2009

Letter from the GRC to the Complainant. The GRC informs the Complainant that he has the opportunity to amend this Denial of Access Complaint prior to the GRC’s request for the Statement of Information from the Custodian. The GRC states that the Complainant’s response is due by close of business on February 27, 2009.⁵

March 3, 2009

Request for the Statement of Information sent to the Custodian.

March 10, 2009

E-mail from the Custodian’s Counsel to the GRC. Counsel requests an extension of time until March 17, 2009 to provide the Statement of Information.

⁵ The Complainant did not respond to the GRC’s request for an amended Denial of Access Complaint.
Greg Badini v. County of Hunterdon, 2008-122 – Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director

March 10, 2009

E-mail from the GRC to the Custodian's Counsel. The GRC grants Counsel's request for an extension of time until March 17, 2009 to provide the Statement of Information.

March 10, 2009

Custodian's Statement of Information ("SOI") with the following attachments:

- Complainant's OPRA request dated April 1, 2008.
- Letter from the Custodian to the Complainant dated April 18, 2008.
- Letter from the Custodian to the Complainant dated June 6, 2008.⁶

The Custodian certifies that Ms. Donna Gapas ("Ms. Gapas"), Division of Social Services, performed a search and prepared an index.

The Custodian states that he received the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request on April 11, 2008. The Custodian states that he responded to the Complainant on April 18, 2008, requesting additional time to respond to the Complainant's request and stating that the Complainant would be notified once a determination was made whether the requested records could be provided. The Custodian states that he responded to the Complainant on June 6, 2008, stating that the requested records could not be provided because they contain personnel information that is sensitive and private.

The Custodian contends that supervisory meetings are not public meetings and therefore formal minutes of the proceedings are not prepared. The Custodian asserts that the "minutes" are in fact memoranda prepared for weekly management supervisors' meetings. The Custodian asserts that these memoranda include, but are not limited to, interaction with or giving directions to individual employees and the evaluation and functioning of internal processes and systems. The Custodian asserts that disclosure of these memoranda under OPRA should be denied because the records constitute inter-agency or intra-agency advisory, consultative or deliberative ("ACD") material.

Analysis

Whether the Custodian responded to the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request in a timely manner?

OPRA provides that:

"[i]f the custodian is unable to comply with a request for access, the custodian shall indicate the specific basis therefor on the request form and promptly return it to the requestor. The custodian shall sign and date the

⁶The Custodian provided correspondence between parties during mediation. Pursuant to the Uniform Mediation Act, N.J.S.A. 2A:23C-1 et seq., communications that take place during the mediation process are not deemed to be public records subject to disclosure under OPRA. N.J.S.A. 2A:23C-2. All communications which occur during the mediation process are absolutely privileged from disclosure and may not be used in any judicial, administrative or legislative proceeding, or in any arbitration, unless all parties and the mediator waive the privilege. N.J.S.A. 2A:23C-4.

form and provide the requestor with a copy thereof ...” N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g.

OPRA further provides that:

“[u]nless a shorter time period is otherwise provided by statute, regulation, or executive order, a custodian of a government record shall grant access ... or deny a request for access ... as soon as possible, but *not later than seven business days after receiving the request* ... In the event a custodian fails to respond within seven business days after receiving a request, *the failure to respond shall be deemed a denial of the request* ...” (Emphasis added.) N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i.

In Hardwick v. NJ Department of Transportation, GRC Complaint No. 2007-164 (February 2008), the Custodian provided the Complainant with a written response to his request on the seventh (7th) business day following receipt of such request in which the Custodian requested an extension of time to fulfill said request but failed to notify the Complainant of when the requested records would be provided. The Council held that:

“...because the Custodian failed to notify the Complainant in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business days of when the requested records would be made available pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i., the Custodian’s written response to the Complainant dated June 20, 2007 and the request for an extension of time dated June 29, 2007 are inadequate under OPRA and the Complainant’s request is “deemed” denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g., N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i. and Kelley v. Township of Rockaway, GRC Complaint No. 2007-11 (October 2007)].”

In the instant complaint, the Custodian responded in writing to the Complainant on April 18, 2008, five (5) business days after receipt of the Complainant’s request, but failed to provide a specific date upon which the Custodian would either grant or deny access to the records responsive to the relevant OPRA request. The Custodian’s failure to respond in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business day time frame providing a specific date upon which he would respond is similar to the actions of the Custodian in Hardwick, *supra*.

Therefore, because the Custodian failed to notify the Complainant in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business days of a specific date when the Custodian would respond to the Complainant’s April 1, 2008, OPRA request, the Custodian’s written response to the Complainant’s request is inadequate under OPRA pursuant to Hardwick, *supra*, and the Complainant’s April 1, 2008, OPRA request is “deemed” denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g., N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i. and Kelley, *supra*.

Whether the Custodian unlawfully denied access to the requested supervisory meeting minutes?

OPRA provides that:

“...government records shall be readily accessible for inspection, copying, or examination by the citizens of this State, *with certain exceptions...*” (Emphasis added.) N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.

Additionally, OPRA defines a government record as:

“... any paper, written or printed book, document, drawing, map, plan, photograph, microfilm, data processed or image processed document, information stored or maintained electronically or by sound-recording or in a similar device, or any copy thereof, that has been *made, maintained or kept on file...or that has been received* in the course of his or its official business...[t]he terms shall not include *inter-agency or intra agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative* material.” (Emphasis added.) N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.

OPRA places the onus on the Custodian to prove that a denial of access is lawful. Specifically, OPRA states:

“...[t]he public agency shall have the burden of proving that the denial of access is authorized by law...” N.J.S.A. 47:1A-6.

OPRA provides that government records made, maintained, kept on file, or received by a public agency in the course of its official business are subject to public access unless otherwise exempt. N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1. A custodian must release all records responsive to an OPRA request “with certain exceptions.” N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1. Additionally, OPRA places the burden on a custodian to prove that a denial of access to records is lawful pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-6.

In the matter currently before the Council, the Custodian argues that the supervisory meetings are not public meetings and therefore formal minutes of the proceedings are not prepared. Further, the Custodian argues that the “minutes” being requested were actually memoranda prepared for weekly meetings, in which supervisors discuss employee or procedural issues.

The Complainant asserts that the exemptions to disclosure cited in the Custodian’s June 6, 2008 letter do not fall within any privilege or exemption contained in OPRA. The Complainant also asserts that the exemptions cited would not render the record entirely exempt from disclosure.

In Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, 379 N.J. Super. 346 (App. Div. 2005), the Complainant appealed a final decision of the GRC⁷ in which the GRC

⁷ Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, GRC Complaint No. 2003-128 (October 2005).
Greg Badini v. County of Hunterdon, 2008-122 – Findings and Recommendations of the Executive Director

dismissed the complaint by accepting the Custodian's legal conclusion for the denial of access without further review. The court stated that:

“OPRA contemplates the GRC’s meaningful review of the basis for an agency’s decision to withhold government records...When the GRC decides to proceed with an investigation and hearing, the custodian may present evidence and argument, but the GRC is not required to accept as adequate whatever the agency offers.”

The court also stated that:

“[t]he statute also contemplates the GRC’s *in camera* review of the records that an agency asserts are protected when such review is necessary to a determination of the validity of a claimed exemption. Although OPRA subjects the GRC to the provisions of the ‘Open Public Meetings Act,’ N.J.S.A. 10:4-6 to -21, it also provides that the GRC ‘may go into closed session during that portion of any proceeding during which the contents of a contested record would be disclosed.’ N.J.S.A. 47:1A-7f. This provision would be unnecessary if the Legislature did not intend to permit *in camera* review.”

Further, the court stated that:

“[w]e hold only that the GRC has and should exercise its discretion to conduct *in camera* review when necessary to resolution of the appeal...There is no reason for concern about unauthorized disclosure of exempt documents or privileged information as a result of *in camera* review by the GRC. The GRC’s obligation to maintain confidentiality and avoid disclosure of exempt material is implicit in N.J.S.A. 47:1A-7f, which provides for closed meeting when necessary to avoid disclosure before resolution of a contested claim of exemption.”

Therefore, pursuant to Paff, *supra*, the GRC must conduct an *in camera* review of all memoranda responsive to the Complainant’s April 1, 2008 OPRA request in order to determine the validity of the Custodian’s assertion that the records constitute the exemptions cited by the Custodian pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.

Whether the Custodian’s denial of access to the requested memoranda rises to the level of a knowing and willful violation of OPRA and unreasonable denial of access under the totality of the circumstances?

The Council defers analysis of whether the Custodian knowingly and willfully violated OPRA and unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances pending the Custodian’s compliance with the Council’s Interim Order.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The Executive Director respectfully recommends the Council find that:

1. Because the Custodian failed to notify the Complainant in writing within the statutorily mandated seven (7) business days of a specific date when the Custodian would respond to the Complainant's April 1, 2008 OPRA request, the Custodian's written response to the Complainant's OPRA request is inadequate under OPRA pursuant to Hardwick v. NJ Department of Transportation, GRC Complaint No. 2007-164 (February 2008), and the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request is "deemed" denied pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.g., N.J.S.A. 47:1A-5.i. and Kelley v. Township of Rockaway, GRC Complaint No. 2007-11 (October 2007).
2. Pursuant to Paff v. NJ Department of Labor, Board of Review, 379 N.J. Super. 346 (App. Div. 2005), the GRC must conduct an *in camera* review of all memoranda responsive to the Complainant's April 1, 2008, OPRA request in order to determine the validity of the Custodian's assertion that the records constitute the exemptions cited by the Custodian pursuant to N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1.
3. **The Custodian must deliver⁸ to the Council in a sealed envelope nine (9) copies of the requested unredacted documents (see No. 2 above), a document or redaction index⁹, as well as a legal certification from the Custodian, in accordance with N.J. Court Rule 1:4-4,¹⁰ that the documents provided are the documents requested by the Council for the *in camera* inspection. Such delivery must be received by the GRC within five (5) business days from receipt of the Council's Interim Order.**
4. The Council defers analysis of whether the Custodian knowingly and willfully violated OPRA and unreasonably denied access under the totality of the circumstances pending the Custodian's compliance with the Council's Interim Order.

Prepared By: Frank F. Caruso
Case Manager

Approved By: Catherine Starghill, Esq.
Executive Director

June 16, 2009

⁸ The *in camera* documents may be sent overnight mail, regular mail, or be hand-delivered, at the discretion of the Custodian, as long as they arrive at the GRC office by the deadline.

⁹ The document or redaction index should identify the document and/or each redaction asserted and the lawful basis for the denial.

¹⁰ "I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment."