

PHILIP D. MURPHY

Governor

SHEILA Y. OLIVER

Lt. Governor

DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY DIVISION OF PENSIONS AND BENEFITS P. O. Box 295

TRENTON, NEW JERSEY 08625-0295
Telephone (609) 292-7524 / Facsimile (609) 777-1779
TRS 711 (609) 292-6683
www.nj.gov/treasury/pensions

nj.gov/treasury/pensio May 18, 2023 ELIZABETH MAHER MUOIO State Treasurer

JOHN D. MEGARIOTIS

Acting Director

Sent via email to:

Law Offices of Feeley & LaRocca John D. Feeley, Esquire

RE: Robin Daghlian PERS

## FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DETERMINATION

Dear Mr. Feeley:

At its meeting on April 19, 2023, the Board of Trustees (Board) of the Public Employees' Retirement System (PERS) considered the appeal of your client, Robin Daghlian, concerning her eligibility for Deferred retirement benefits in light of her dismissal for cause on charges of misconduct or delinquency directly related to her employment in accord with N.J.S.A. 43:15A-38. The Board had originally denied Ms. Daghlian's application for Deferred retirement benefits at its meeting of January 18, 2023. You filed a timely appeal of the Board's decision on Ms. Daghlian's behalf on February 15, 2023.

After careful consideration, the Board affirmed its prior decision, and finding no genuine issue of material fact in dispute, denied her request for an administrative hearing. Thereafter, the Board directed the undersigned to draft a Final Administrative Determination, which was reviewed and approved at its meeting of May 17, 2022.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

The Board made the following factual findings.

The record before the Board establishes that Ms. Daghlian was enrolled in the PERS on January 1, 1999, as a result of her employment as an Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) with

John D. Feeley, Esq.

Re: Robin Daghlian

May 18, 2023

Page 2

Cliffside Park Borough (Borough). She remained with this employer and in this title at the time of

her termination on November 12, 2013. Ms. Daghlian filed a retirement application on April 12,

2021, requesting a July 1, 2021, retirement.

A Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action (PNDA) was filed on October 17, 2012,

charging Ms. Daghlian with Conduct Unbecoming a Public Employee, Unfitness for Service as an

EMT, Insubordination, and Failing to meet and/or satisfy the conditions pursuant to which her

employment by the Borough had been continued on a probationary period. On repeated

occasions from July 29, 2012 through October 9, 2012, Ms. Daghlian's employer received

complaints that she was verbally abusive and confrontational toward patients and supervisors,

engaged in patterns of harassment toward co-workers, and exhibited other behaviors, towards

patients and their family members, co-workers, and other public safety personnel. This behavior

occurred while she was subject to a period of probation from a previous disciplinary action for

similar conduct. In addition, Ms. Daghlian failed to comply with administrative and supervisory

directives when she covertly recorded a meeting held between her and Borough personnel, and

failed to deliver a copy or a certified transcript of the recording to the Borough personnel upon his

request. As a result of the charges, the Borough sought her removal.

On or about October 1, 2013, the Hearing Officer issued a report and found that Ms.

Daghlian demonstrated a pattern of behavior that was contrary to that of a public employee and

that she was not fit for duty as an EMT. The Hearing Officer also found that the charges in the

PNDA were sustained and recommended that the Borough terminate Ms. Daghlian from her

employment as an EMT. A Borough Resolution was adopted on November 12, 2013, terminating

her employment effective immediately.

Ms. Daghlian filed a federal lawsuit against the Borough alleging retaliation and sexual

harassment in violation of the New Jersey Law Against Discrimination. In an opinion dated July

27, 2016, the court dismissed all claims except Count XIII (Violation of the New Jersey Civil Rights

John D. Feeley, Esq.

Re: Robin Daghlian

May 18, 2023

Page 3

Act for Failure to Implement Appropriate Policies) and Count XIV (Violation of the New Jersey

Law Against Discrimination). All other counts were dismissed without prejudice.

On May 9, 2017, the Borough and Ms. Daghlian entered into a Settlement Agreement

(Agreement) and General Release. A Voluntary Stipulation of Dismissal was approved upon

execution of the Agreement regarding Ms. Daghlian's lawsuit filed against the Borough. In

addition, Ms. Daghlian received \$68,578.54 from the Borough, however no admission of

wrongdoing was admitted to by either party. The Agreement settled Ms. Daghlian's lawsuit against

her employer regarding allegations of retaliation and sexual harassment, but had no effect with

respect to her removal from employment.

The Board considered Ms. Daghlian's application for Deferred retirement benefits at its

meeting of January 18, 2023. At the meeting, the Board found that she was removed for cause

on charges of misconduct or delinquency and denied her application. On or about February 15,

2023, you filed a timely appeal of the Board's decision and requested that the matter be

transferred to the Office of Administrative Law as a contested case.

At its meeting on April 19, 2023, the Board considered Ms. Daghlian's appeal, affirmed its

prior decision, and finding no genuine issue of material fact in dispute, denied her request for an

administrative hearing.

**CONCLUSIONS OF LAW** 

The Board made the following conclusions of law.

Tier 1 and 2 PERS members with 10 or more years of service are eligible to file for

Deferred retirement benefits upon reaching 60 years of age. The eligibility for Deferred retirement

benefits are outlined in N.J.S.A. 43:15A-38, which states, in pertinent part:

Should a member of the Public Employees' Retirement System, after having completed 10 years of service, be separated voluntarily or

involuntarily from the service, before reaching service retirement age, and not by removal for cause on charges of misconduct or delinquency,

such person may elect to receive:

John D. Feeley, Esq.

Re: Robin Daghlian

May 18, 2023

Page 4

(a) The payments provided for in section 41b of this act,<sup>1</sup> if he

so qualifies under said section, or;

(b) A deferred retirement allowance, beginning at the retirement

age...

[(Emphasis added)].

Based on the plain language of the statute as applied to the facts in the record, the Board

determined that Ms. Daghlian was removed for cause on grounds of misconduct or delinquency

directly related to her employment, and she is not eligible for Deferred retirement benefits. See

In re Hess, 422 N.J. Super. 27 (App. Div. 2011) (holding that ineligibility for Deferred retirement

occurs when a member is terminated for misconduct or delinquency related to the employment).

At the time of Ms. Daghlian's dismissal from employment, she was 51 years of age and

her membership account reflected a total of 13 years and 5 months of PERS service credit.

Therefore, at that time the only benefit she could file for was a Deferred retirement. Consequently,

the Board found that because Ms. Daghlian was removed for cause on charges of misconduct or

delinquency directly related to her employment, she is not eligible for a Deferred retirement, and

the Board denied her retirement application under the provisions of N.J.S.A. 43:15A-38. See also

In re Hess, 422 N.J. Super. 27 (App. Div. 2011).

Ms. Daghlian is eligible to withdraw her accumulated pension contributions remitted during

active membership, and she may request an Application for Withdrawal by writing to Robin

Willever, Supervisor, Loan/Withdrawal Section at the Division, at the address above.

Nonetheless, Ms. Daghlian is cautioned against filing the withdrawal application if she

intends to appeal the Board's determination. Withdrawal terminates all rights and

privileges of membership.

<sup>1</sup> N.J.S.A. 43:15A-41

-

John D. Feeley, Esq. Re: Robin Daghlian

May 18, 2023

Page 5

As noted above, the Board has considered your personal statements, written submission

and all documentation in the record. Because this matter does not entail any disputed questions

of fact, the Board was able to reach its findings of fact and conclusions of law on the basis of the

retirement system's enabling statutes and without the need for an administrative hearing.

Accordingly, this correspondence shall constitute the Final Administrative Determination of the

Board of Trustees of the Public Employees' Retirement System.

You have the right to appeal this final administrative action to the Superior Court of New

Jersey, Appellate Division, within 45 days of the date of this letter in accordance with the Rules

Governing the Courts of the State of New Jersey.

All appeals should be directed to:

Superior Court of New Jersey

Appellate Division

Attn: Court Clerk

PO Box 006

Trenton, NJ 08625

Sincerely,

Jeff S. Ignatowitz, Secretary

HBS. Sports

Board of Trustees

Public Employees' Retirement System

G-8/JSI

C: J. Ehrmann (ET); R. Willever (ET)

C: Sabrina Figueroa